

**Comment 1 for Cap-and-Trade Public Meeting to Discuss CO2 Weighted  
Ton Refinery Benchmark (aug-28-cwt-bm-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Dave

Last Name: Copeland

Email Address: dave\_copeland@praxair.com

Affiliation: Praxair Inc

Subject: Praxairs comments to Aug 28-CWT-BM-WS

Comment:

Attached are Praxair's comments to the Development of GHG  
efficiency benchmarks for the distribution of free emissions  
allowances in the California Cap and Trade Program - Refineries.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/aug-28-cwt-bm-ws/2-09242012\\_praxair\\_comments\\_on\\_refinery\\_report\\_v2.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/aug-28-cwt-bm-ws/2-09242012_praxair_comments_on_refinery_report_v2.pdf)

Original File Name: 09242012\_Praxair Comments on Refinery Report\_v2.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2012-09-24 09:20:37

No Duplicates.

**Comment 2 for Cap-and-Trade Public Meeting to Discuss CO2 Weighted  
Ton Refinery Benchmark (aug-28-cwt-bm-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Seth

Last Name: Barna

Email Address: Seth\_Barna@americanchemistry.com

Affiliation: American Chemistry Council

Subject: Comments on Refinery Benchmark in the Second Compliance Period

Comment:

The Industrial Gases Panel of the American Chemistry Council appreciates the opportunity to submit comments on the, "Development of GHG efficiency benchmarks for the distribution of free emissions allowances in the California Cap-and-Trade Program Refineries - Preliminary Work Product" that was part of the, "Cap-and-Trade Technical Workshop to Discuss Refinery Benchmark in the Second Compliance Period" held on August 28, 2012. In order to inform and enhance the Air Resource Board's efforts, we offer the following comments on the, "Options for allocation methodology for hydrogen production."

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/aug-28-cwt-bm-ws/3-acc\\_igp\\_comments\\_on\\_benchmark\\_options\\_120924.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/aug-28-cwt-bm-ws/3-acc_igp_comments_on_benchmark_options_120924.pdf)

Original File Name: ACC IGP Comments on Benchmark Options 120924.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2012-09-24 15:56:38

No Duplicates.

**Comment 3 for Cap-and-Trade Public Meeting to Discuss CO2 Weighted  
Ton Refinery Benchmark (aug-28-cwt-bm-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Craig  
Last Name: Moyer  
Email Address: cmoyer@manatt.com  
Affiliation: WIRA

Subject: WIRA Comments on CWT initial workshop  
Comment:

Please find attached the comments from WIRA on the initial CWT  
workshop and presentation.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/aug-28-cwt-bm-ws/5-wira\\_cwt\\_comments.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/aug-28-cwt-bm-ws/5-wira_cwt_comments.pdf)

Original File Name: WIRA CWT Comments.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2012-09-25 15:38:03

No Duplicates.

**Comment 4 for Cap-and-Trade Public Meeting to Discuss CO2 Weighted  
Ton Refinery Benchmark (aug-28-cwt-bm-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Marcus

Last Name: Ruscio

Email Address: mruscio@worldoil.net

Affiliation:

Subject: Comments for CWT Refinery Benchmark

Comment:

Please see the attached uploaded letter for Lunday-Thagard  
Company's Comments for the Carbon Dioxide Weighted Tonne Refinery  
Benchmark.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/aug-28-cwt-bm-ws/6-ltr\\_2012-09-24\\_carb\\_public\\_comments\\_re\\_cwt\\_\\_final\\_.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/aug-28-cwt-bm-ws/6-ltr_2012-09-24_carb_public_comments_re_cwt__final_.pdf)

Original File Name: LTR 2012-09-24 CARB Public Comments Re CWT (FINAL).pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2012-09-25 16:00:22

No Duplicates.

**Comment 5 for Cap-and-Trade Public Meeting to Discuss CO2 Weighted  
Ton Refinery Benchmark (aug-28-cwt-bm-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Keith

Last Name: Adams

Email Address: adamskb@airproducts.com

Affiliation: Air Products and Chemicals, Inc.

Subject: Comments Regarding Refinery Benchmark Revisions under the Cap & Trade Program

Comment:

Comments in response to the August 20th Ecofys report "Development of GHG efficiency benchmarks for the distribution of free emission allowances in the California Cap-and-Trade Program, Refineries - Preliminary Work Product" and the August 28th CARB Workshop.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/aug-28-cwt-bm-ws/7-air\\_products\\_comments\\_-\\_refinery\\_benchmark\\_revisions.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/aug-28-cwt-bm-ws/7-air_products_comments_-_refinery_benchmark_revisions.pdf)

Original File Name: Air Products Comments - Refinery Benchmark Revisions.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2012-09-25 16:50:26

No Duplicates.

**Comment 6 for Cap-and-Trade Public Meeting to Discuss CO2 Weighted  
Ton Refinery Benchmark (aug-28-cwt-bm-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Jasmin

Last Name: Ansar

Email Address: jansar@ucsusa.org

Affiliation:

Subject: Union of Concerned Scientists feedback

Comment:

feedback attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/aug-28-cwt-bm-ws/12-ucs\\_comments\\_on\\_cwt\\_9-30-2012final.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/aug-28-cwt-bm-ws/12-ucs_comments_on_cwt_9-30-2012final.pdf)

Original File Name: UCS comments on CWT 9-30-2012final.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2012-10-10 12:00:48

No Duplicates.

**Comment 7 for Cap-and-Trade Public Meeting to Discuss CO2 Weighted  
Ton Refinery Benchmark (aug-28-cwt-bm-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Melinda

Last Name: Hicks

Email Address: mhicks@kernoil.com

Affiliation: Kern Oil & Refining Co.

Subject: CWT Comments from 8-28-12 Workshop

Comment:

See attached

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/aug-28-cwt-bm-ws/13-kern\\_cwt\\_comment\\_letter\\_10-12-2012.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/aug-28-cwt-bm-ws/13-kern_cwt_comment_letter_10-12-2012.pdf)

Original File Name: Kern CWT Comment Letter 10-12-2012.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2012-10-12 17:00:03

No Duplicates.

**There are no comments posted to Cap-and-Trade Public Meeting to Discuss CO2 Weighted Ton Refinery Benchmark (aug-28-cwt-bm-ws) that were presented during the Workshop at this time.**