



September 6, 2011

Via Electronic Submittal Form¹

California Air Resources Board
SSD/Freight Transport Branch—6th Floor,
Attn: Harold Holmes,
1001 I Street, Sacramento, California 95814

Re: NRDC Comments on Supplement to the June 2010 Staff Report on
Proposed Actions to Further Reduce Diesel Particulate Matter at High-
Priority California Railyards

On behalf of the Natural Resources Defense Council (NRDC), thank you for the opportunity to present these comments on the July 5, 2011 Supplement to the June 2010 Staff Report on Proposed Actions to Further Reduce Diesel Particulate Matter at High-Priority California Railyards. NRDC also adopts the comments submitted today by East Yards Communities For Environmental Justice.

We write to make these points: that the assumptions in the July 5, 2011 Supplement about diesel truck pollution and locomotive replacement are unrealistic, leading the health risk assessments to be too low.

First, with respect to diesel trucks, the July 5 Supplement assumes that the improvements in diesel particulate pollution from the CARB drayage truck rule will last forever. As the recent history at the Ports of Los Angeles and Long Beach has shown, low-income drayage truck drivers are often unable to keep their trucks maintained properly. A badly-maintained new truck can become a dirty truck within a year. Thus, assuming that new, clean CARB-compliant trucks will remain clean is unwarranted.


Second, with respect to locomotives, the July 5 supplement assumes that the affected railroads will comply with their unenforceable promises to CARB to reduce emissions. In addition, CARB reached its locomotive emission numbers by simply multiplying the assumed emission factors by a fraction based on the percentage of current to projected cargo movement. There is no scientific basis for this simplistic method.

¹ http://www.arb.ca.gov/lispub/comm2/bcsubform.php?listname=ceqarycommitments-ws&comm_period=1

Combined, these errors make the conclusions of the July 5 Report unreliable. NRDC urges CARB to withdraw the July 5 report and associated Functional Equivalent Document until the emission numbers can be recalculated accurately.

Thank you for your consideration of these comments.

Yours truly,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "D. Pettit", is centered on the page. The signature is written in a cursive style with a large initial "D" and a stylized "P".

David Pettit
Senior Attorney
Natural Resources Defense Council