

**RUBY GHADIALLY, M.D.**  
**Professor, Department of Dermatology**  
**University of California, San Francisco**  
**Department of Dermatology**  
**School of Medicine**  
**4150 Clement Street, 1A-31,**  
**Box 190,**  
**San Francisco, CA 94143**

June 23, 2008

David Mallory  
Carla Takemoto  
Trish Johnson  
Stationary Sources Division  
California Air Resources Board  
1001 I Street, 6<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Sacramento, California 95812

Re: Consumer Product Rulemaking; Astringents/Toners

Dear CARB Staff,

It has come to my attention that, in a recent conversation between a CARB board member and a CARB member of staff, I may have been misquoted in a material respect on my stated opinions regarding the CARB proposal on astringents. To set the record straight, I have never stated in writing or verbally that a 25% alcohol level would be an acceptable cap in this category.

In the course of our meetings and in my correspondence, I have stressed my strong medical opinion that higher levels of alcohol in products are needed by certain affected individuals and groups. My opinion has not changed, and I encourage you to reconsider your recommendation in this category.

Sincerely,



Ruby Ghadially, M.D.