Draft Minutes

ARB Environmental Justice (EJ) Stakeholders Group Meeting

Monday, March 24, 2003
10:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m.

Room 620, Cal/EPA Headquarters Building
1001 I Street, Sacramento, California 95814

Attended by:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Organization</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Bailey, Diane</td>
<td>NRDC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Barham, Robert</td>
<td>ARB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Behrmann, Jim</td>
<td>ARB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Benz, Meghan</td>
<td>NUMMI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Bigos, Ken</td>
<td>USEPA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Blaisdell, Bob</td>
<td>OEHHA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Blanton, Erin</td>
<td>ARB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Bode, Richard</td>
<td>ARB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Brandt, Renee (City of LA)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Chiu, Bonnie</td>
<td>OPR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Coleman, Curtis</td>
<td>CMA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>DaMassa, John</td>
<td>ARB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Donohoue, Dan</td>
<td>ARB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Fletcher, Bob</td>
<td>ARB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Forbes, Paula</td>
<td>EHC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Grattidge, Brian</td>
<td>OPR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>**Grow, Richard</td>
<td>USEPA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Krinsik, Leslie</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Lee, Barbara</td>
<td>NSCAQMD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Martin, Jerry</td>
<td>ARB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>McKinnon, Matt</td>
<td>ARB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Murchison, Linda</td>
<td>ARB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Pascual, Romel</td>
<td>Cal/EPA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Pasek, Randy</td>
<td>ARB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Peter, Ellen</td>
<td>Atty Gen Ofc</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Porras, Carlos</td>
<td>CBE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Prasad, Shanker</td>
<td>ARB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>Quetin, Doug</td>
<td>MBUAPCD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Rabaud, Nicole</td>
<td>OPR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Ratcliff, Dick</td>
<td>CEC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>Ringer, Mike</td>
<td>CEC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Rupp, Stu</td>
<td>NUMMI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>Ryden, Jim</td>
<td>ARB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>Salazar-Thompson, Sandra</td>
<td>OPR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Sarabia, Sofia</td>
<td>Atty Gen Ofc</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Schaufelberger, Christine</td>
<td>BAAOMD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>Shahroody, Shawnee</td>
<td>Atty Gen Ofc</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>Shimp, Dale</td>
<td>ARB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>Smith, Dick</td>
<td>SDAPCD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>Suer, Carolyn</td>
<td>ARB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>Takemoto, Brent</td>
<td>ARB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>Terry, Lynn</td>
<td>ARB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>Tschogl, Kathleen</td>
<td>ARB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>Tuck, Cindy</td>
<td>CCEEB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>Venturini, Peter</td>
<td>ARB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>Victory, Winona</td>
<td>USEP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td>Wallerstein, Barry</td>
<td>SCAQMD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td>Walsh, Kathleen</td>
<td>ARB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49</td>
<td>Witherspoon, Catherine</td>
<td>ARB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
<td>Wyman, Sue</td>
<td>ARB</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Asterisk indicates a participant via videoconference at ARB’s El Monte Office. There was one participant by phone conference (**).

The meeting, chaired by Board member Matt McKinnon, began at 10:30 a.m. with introductions.

1. Update on ARB environmental justice activities

Bob Fletcher summarized the status report given to the Air Resources Board in January, briefly described ongoing environmental justice activities, listed the nine air toxic control measures that are under
development during 2003/04, and presented State Implementation Activities during the next two years.

In its report to the Board, ARB staff summarized actions taken during 2002, and identified the priority for the next year of addressing cumulative emissions, exposure and risk.

There are three parallel processes underway for ongoing environmental justice activities: (1) this Stakeholders Group; (2) the Cal/EPA Interagency Working Group on Environmental Justice; and (3) the SCAQMD Working Group for Cumulative Impacts. The Governor’s Office of Planning and Research is developing general plan guidance.

2. Cumulative Risk Technical Tools

Bob Fletcher gave an overview of the tools and products being developed to make emission data more accessible to the public, and for professionals to be able to assess localized cumulative impacts.

The Community Health Air Pollution Information System, or CHAPIS, is a web-mapping, emissions-based tool that will provide interactive maps of sources including stationary, mobile, and area-wide emissions. Several draft web pages were shown to give an idea of the system’s appearance. The system is being developed in stages to assure data quality with an initial public release as early as this summer.

The Hot Spots Analysis and Reporting Program, or HARP, is a tool to perform air dispersion modeling of emission data, and conduct health risk analyses. The vision is to be able to integrate CHAPIS and HARP to be able to assess localized cumulative impacts.

Bob described efforts underway on regional and micro-scale air quality modeling with the intention of integrating them and the challenges in trying to do so. The goal is to provide improved information to the public and improved tools for air quality professionals to assess localized and total cumulative impacts.


Linda Murchison traced the products developed since the Board’s adoption of its policies, the Public Participation Guidance and the Complaint Resolution Protocol. Staff is now preparing an Air Quality Handbook. The purpose of the Handbook is to help local decision-makers identify air quality-related considerations and improve decision-making. Key topics will be to address the siting of new sources, address the siting
of sensitive receptors such as schools, and identify types of facilities that need site-specific review.

The Handbook will be done in a question and answer format with technical supplements being added as new information becomes available. The timeframe planned is for a detailed outline to be reviewed by this Stakeholders Group in the spring with a draft handbook to be completed during the summer.

Discussion included comments on:
- the interest of locals regarding diesel controls,
- identifying what questions are most important,
- how to engage and educate local agencies,
- developing tutorials,
- the need to address broader recommendations and not just permit-by-permit,
- embedding some of the concepts into the guidelines being drafted by OPR and due out this July,
- planning conferences as opportunities to interact with planners,
- industrial and agricultural interfaces with residential, and
- community impacts on projects (in addition to project impacts on communities).

4. Update on Cal/EPA Environmental Justice Activities

Romel Pascual described the 17-member committee appointed by the Secretary Hickox with the charge of advising Cal/EPA and developing a set of recommendations about how to look at environmental justice. The recommendations will be released for a 60-day public comment period.

5. Update on OPR Environmental Justice Activities

Sandra Salazar-Thompson and Brian Grattidge of OPR summarized their charge to add environmental justice into general plan requirements.

6. SCAQMD Cumulative Risk Project

Barry Wallerstein described their project as an outgrowth of action taken by the SCAQMD Board last September. There have been three meetings so far.

7. Risk Management Guidelines for New and Modified Sources

After lunch, Dan Donohoue provided an overview of the ARB’s Risk Management Guidance approved in 1993. This presentation was
intended to inform the group of the guidance that is currently available on siting of new and modified sources.

There followed a general discussion about cumulative impacts. In closing, Matt McKinnon suggested that everyone identify their 10 most important criteria for cumulative impact analysis and send them to Linda Murchison (lmurchis@arb.ca.gov). Examples discussed at the meeting were emissions, number of facilities in the community, risk, etc. Some people stated we should consider criteria other than, or in addition to, just risk. No deadline was set, but the ARB staff will send out a note regarding this. The criteria sent to Linda will be sent out to the whole group prior to the next meeting in order for the group to review and be prepared to discuss. Other agenda items for the next meeting will be an update on the Air Quality Handbook and the South Coast activities.

Matt McKinnon announced that he may be appointed to another position in the current administration, and while no final decision had been made, he may be required to leave his Board position. He appreciated everyone’s commitment to the group.

The ARB staff will poll the group to determine a date for the next meeting. The meeting adjourned at approximately 4:10 p.m.