SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

This SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE (hereinafter "Agreement") is entered into between the STATE OF CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD (hereinafter "ARB") 1001 I Street, Sacramento, California 95814, and J. Torres Co., Inc. (hereinafter "J. Torres Co., Inc."), 5810 South Union Avenue, Bakersfield, CA 93307.

I. RECITALS

(1) California Health and Safety Code section 44011.6 (HSC § 44011.6) established the Heavy-Duty Vehicle Inspection Program (HDVIP). It authorizes ARB to inspect on-road heavy-duty vehicles for excessive smoke emissions and engine tampering and to issue citations accordingly. The program also requires the vehicle owner to repair its engines that exceed the prescribed ARB smoke opacity standards, perform a post-repair opacity test, and submit proof of repairs and any assessed penalties under the regulations of the HDVIP, chapter 3.5, California Code of Regulations, title 13, sections 2180-2188 (13 CCR §§ 2180-2188).

(2) HSC § 43701 provides that ARB shall adopt regulations that require owners or operators of heavy-duty diesel motor vehicles to perform regular inspections of their vehicles for excessive smoke emissions.

(3) 13 CCR § 2190 *et seq.* were adopted under the authority of HSC § 43701 and, with limited exceptions, which are not applicable here, apply to all heavy-duty diesel powered vehicles with gross vehicle weight ratings greater than 6,000 pounds that operate on the streets or highways within the State of California.

(4) 13 CCR § 2190 *et seq.* authorize the Periodic Smoke Inspection Program (PSIP) which requires the owners and operators of California based vehicle fleets of two or more heavy-duty diesel motor vehicles with gross vehicle weight ratings greater than 6,000 pounds that operate on the streets or highways within the State of California to conduct annual smoke opacity inspections of their vehicles equipped with engines that are four years old or older.

(5) 13 CCR § 2192(a) requires inter alia that the owner of the vehicle "[t]est the vehicle for excessive smoke emissions periodically according to the inspection intervals specified in section 2193(a), (b), and (c)", "[m]easure the smoke emissions for each test...", "[r]ecord the smoke test opacity levels and other required test information as specified in section 2194..." and "[k]eep the records specified in section 2194 for two years after the date of inspection."

(6) HSC § 43016 states, "Any person who violates any provision of this part, or any order, rule, or regulation of the state board adopted pursuant to this part, and for which there is not provided in this part any other specific civil penalty or fine, shall

be subject to a civil penalty of not to exceed five hundred dollars ($500.00) per vehicle."

(7) ARB considers testing, measuring, recording, and recordkeeping to be critical components in reducing excessive smoke emissions from these heavy-duty vehicles.

(8) ARB contends J. Torres Co., Inc. failed to test, measure, record, and maintain records of smoke emissions for its fleet of heavy-duty diesel vehicles for years 2014 and 2015 in violation of 13 CCR § 2190 *et seq.*

(9) HSC §§ 39650-39675 mandate the reduction of the emissions of substances that have been determined to be toxic air contaminants. In 1998, following an exhaustive ten-year scientific assessment process, ARB identified particulate matter (PM) from diesel-fueled engines as a toxic air contaminant. In-use on-road diesel vehicles are powered by diesel fueled engines that emit toxic PM. On-road vehicles are controlled under the Truck and Bus regulation, as codified in 13 CCR § 2025.

(10) 13 CCR § 2025(e)(1)(B) states: "Starting January 1, 2012, for all vehicles with GVWR greater than 26,000 lbs, excluding school buses, fleets must meet the requirements of 13 CCR § 2025(g) or fleets that report may instead comply with the phase-in option of 13 CCR § 2025(i)."

(11) Failure to comply with the requirements of 13 CCR § 2025 is a violation of state law resulting in penalties. HSC §§ 39674 (a) and (b) authorize civil penalties for the violation of the programs for the regulation of toxic air contaminants not to exceed one thousand dollars ($1,000) or ten thousand dollars ($10,000), respectively, for each day in which the violation occurs.

(12) J. Torres Co., Inc. has elected to utilize the phase-in option provided for in 13 CCR § 2025(i).

(13) 13 CCR § 2025(i), phase-in option, requires that owners of diesel vehicles with a GVWR greater than 26,000 lbs meet the PM Best Available Control Technology (BACT) requirements by phasing in, 60 percent by January 1, 2013, 90 percent by January 1, 2014, and 90 percent by January 1, 2015.

(14) ARB has documented that J. Torres Co., Inc. failed to have 60 percent of their fleet meet the PM BACT requirements by January 1, 2013, 90 percent by January 1, 2014, and 90 percent by January 1, 2015.

(15) J. Torres Co., Inc. has a fleet containing Solid Waste Collection Vehicles.

(16) Under authority of HSC §§ 39601 and 39660, 13 CCR § 2020 *et seq.* requires owners of diesel fueled solid waste collection vehicles (SWCV) over 14,000 pounds gross vehicle weight with model-year engines from 1960 to 2006 used to collect solid waste to use Best Available Control Technology (BACT) for each SWCV in the active fleet. Records of the installed diesel emission control strategies and corresponding compliance plan must be accessible at the terminal. Each SWCV must have a legible and durable label with complete and accurate information affixed to the driver's side doorjamb or another readily accessible location known to the driver.

(17) ARB Enforcement Division contends that J. Torres Co., Inc. failed to install BACT to SWCVs in its fleet according to the implementation schedule outlined in 13 CCR § 2021 et seq. at their terminal in Bakersfield, California.

(18) HSC §§ 39674(a) and (b) authorize civil penalties for the violation of the programs for the regulation of toxic air contaminants not to exceed one thousand dollars ($1,000.00) or not to exceed ten thousand dollars ($10,000.00) respectively, for each day in which the violation occurs.

(19) In order to resolve these alleged violations, J. Torres Co., Inc. has taken, or agreed to take, the actions enumerated below under "RELEASE". Further, ARB accepts this Agreement in termination and settlement of this matter.

(20) In consideration of the foregoing, and of the promises and facts set forth herein, the parties desire to settle and resolve all claims, disputes, and obligations relating to the above-listed violations, and voluntarily agree to resolve this matter by means of this Agreement. Specifically, ARB and J. Torres Co., Inc. agree as follows:

II. TERMS AND RELEASE

In consideration of ARB not filing a legal action against J. Torres Co., Inc. for the alleged violations referred to above, and J. Torres Co., Inc.'s payment of the penalties set forth in Section 1 below, ARB and J. Torres Co., Inc. agree as follows:

(1) Upon execution of this Agreement, the sum of sixteen thousand five hundred dollars shall be paid on behalf of J. Torres Co., Inc. no later than October 15, 2016, as follows:

- $12,375.00 payable to the **Air Pollution Control Fund**
- $4,125.00 payable to the **Peralta Colleges Foundation**

Please send the signed Settlement Agreement and any future mailings or documents required per the terms of this Settlement Agreement to:

Mr. Luke Duval
Air Pollution Specialist
California Air Resources Board
Enforcement Division
P.O. Box 2815
Sacramento, California 95812

Please send the payment along with the attached "Settlement Agreement Payment Transmittal Form" (Attachment A) to:

California Air Resources Board
Accounting Office
P.O. Box 1436
Sacramento, California 95812-1436

(2) If the Attorney General files a civil action to enforce this settlement agreement, J. Torres Co., Inc. shall pay all costs of investigating and prosecuting the action, including expert fees, reasonable attorney's costs, and costs.

(3) It is further agreed that the penalties described in "Terms and Release", paragraph 1 are punitive in nature, rather than compensatory. Furthermore, the penalty is intended to deter and punish J. Torres Co., Inc. for violations of state environmental statutes, and these penalties are payable to and for the benefit of ARB, a governmental unit. Therefore, it is agreed that these penalties imposed on J. Torres Co., Inc. by ARB arising from the facts described in recital paragraphs (1) through (18) are non-dischargeable under 11 United States Code § 523 (a)(7), which provides an exception from discharge for any debt to the extent such debt is for a fine, penalty or forfeiture payable to and for benefit of governmental unit, and is not compensation for actual pecuniary loss, other than certain types of tax penalties.

(4) J. Torres Co., Inc. shall not violate HSC §§ 43701 *et seq.*, 44011.6 *et seq.*, and 13 CCR §§ 2180 *et seq.*, 2190 *et seq.*, and 2485 *et seq.*

(5) J. Torres Co., Inc. shall comply with one or both of the following options to attend the California Council on Diesel Education and Technology (CCDET I) class, (SAE J1667 Snap Acceleration Smoke Test Procedure for Heavy-Duty Diesel Powered Vehicles) as described on the ARB webpage at http://www.arb.ca.gov/enf/hdvip/ccdet/ccdet.htm. This class is conducted by various California Community Colleges and instructs attendees on compliance with the PSIP, the ECL regulation and the HDVIP.

(a) J. Torres Co., Inc. shall have the fleet maintenance manager (or equivalent) and all staff performing opacity tests for compliance with PSIP and the HDVIP attend the CCDET I class. Proof of CCDET I completion shall be provided to ARB within six months of the date of this Agreement and be maintained in each applicable employee's file for the term of his or her employment.

(b) If J. Torres Co., Inc. uses a contractor to perform the annual smoke opacity testing required under the PSIP, J. Torres Co., Inc. shall obtain proof that the contractor's staff conducting the smoke opacity tests completed the CCDET I course within the past four years. This proof of CCDET I completion shall be provided to ARB with PSIP records as required by this Agreement and be maintained with the annual PSIP records.

(6) J. Torres Co., Inc. shall comply with the following options to attend the CCDET II class (Diesel Exhaust After Treatment and Maintenance), described on the ARB's webpage http://www.arb.ca.gov/enf/hdvip/ccdet/ccdet.htm. This class is conducted by various California Community Colleges and instructs attendees on California's emission regulations and the proper care and maintenance of diesel exhaust after-treatment systems (DEATS).

(a) J. Torres Co., Inc. shall have the fleet maintenance manager (or equivalent) and all staff responsible for maintenance of DEATS attend the CCDET II class. Proof of CCDET II completion shall be provided to ARB within six months of the date of this Agreement and also be maintained in each applicable employee's file for the term of his or her employment.

(b) In case J. Torres Co., Inc. uses a contractor for the maintenance of DEATS, in addition to having the fleet maintenance manager (or equivalent) attend the CCDET II course, J. Torres Co., Inc. shall obtain proof that the contractor's staff maintaining the DEATS device(s) completed the CCDET II course within the last four years. This proof of the CCDET II completion shall be provided by J. Torres Co., Inc. to ARB within six months of the date of this settlement and be maintained with the DEATS installation and maintenance records.

(c) In case J. Torres Co., Inc. is unable to find a CCDET II certified contractor within a radius of 25 miles from its yard for the maintenance of DEATS, in addition to having the fleet maintenance manager (or equivalent) attend the CCDET II course, J. Torres Co., Inc. shall contract only with the authorized verified diesel emission control strategy installer(s) or original equipment manufacturer distributor(s) for the maintenance of DEATS. The proof of the CCDET II completion for the fleet maintenance manager (or equivalent) shall be provided by J. Torres Co., Inc. to ARB within six months of the date of this settlement and be maintained with the DEATS installation and maintenance records.

(7) J. Torres Co., Inc. shall submit copies of all PSIP compliance records for the years 2016 and 2017 to ARB by January 31 of the following year. **Copies shall be addressed to the attention of Mr. Luke Duval at the California Air Resources Board, Enforcement Division, P.O. Box 2815, Sacramento, California 95812**. ARB reserves the right to visit any J. Torres Co., Inc. fleet location at any time to conduct compliance audits for the HDVIP and PSIP, or any other applicable ARB program.

(8) J. Torres Co., Inc. shall complete Low NOx Software Upgrades (reflash) on all applicable heavy-duty diesel engines operating in California and report to ARB within 45 days of this agreement.

(9) J. Torres Co., Inc. shall remain in compliance with the ECL regulation as codified in 13 CCR § 2183.

(10) J. Torres Co., Inc. shall instruct all employees who operate diesel-fueled vehicles to comply with the idling regulations set forth in 13 CCR § 2485, within 45 days of this Agreement.

(11) J. Torres Co., Inc. shall not violate the Truck and Bus regulation as codified in 13 CCR § 2025.

(12) J. Torres Co., Inc. shall maintain compliance with the SWCV Rule.

(13) Each SWCV shall comply with the label requirements set forth in the 13 CCR § 2021.2(f) (2) within 30 days of this agreement.

(14) This Agreement shall apply to and be binding upon J. Torres Co., Inc., and its officers, directors, receivers, trustees, employees, successors and assignees, subsidiary and parent corporations and upon ARB and any successor agency that may have responsibility for and jurisdiction over the subject matter of this Agreement.

(15) This Agreement constitutes the entire agreement and understanding between ARB and J. Torres Co., Inc. concerning the subject matter hereof, and supersedes and replaces all prior negotiations and agreements between ARB and J. Torres Co., Inc. concerning the subject matter hereof.

(16) No agreement to modify, amend, extend, supersede, terminate, or discharge this Agreement, or any portion thereof, is valid or enforceable unless it is in writing and signed by all parties to this Agreement.

(17) Severability. Each provision of this Agreement is severable, and in the event that any provision of this Agreement is held to be invalid or unenforceable, the remainder of this Agreement remains in full force and effect.

(18) This Agreement shall be interpreted and enforced in accordance with the laws of the State of California, without regard to California's choice-of-law rules.

(19) This Agreement is deemed to have been drafted equally by the Parties; it will not be interpreted for or against either party on the ground that said party drafted it.

(20) Senate Bill 1402 (Dutton, Chapter 413, statutes of 2010) requires ARB to provide information on the basis for the penalties it seeks (HSC § 39619.7). This information, which is provided throughout this settlement agreement, is summarized here:

The manner in which the penalty amount was determined, including a per unit or per vehicle penalty.

Penalties must be set at levels sufficient to discourage violations. The penalties in this matter were determined in consideration of all relevant circumstances, including the eight factors specified in HSC §§ 42403 and 43024.

Truck and Bus Violations

The per unit penalty for the Truck and Bus violations involved in this case is a maximum of $1,000 per vehicle per day for strict liability violations or $10,000 per vehicle per day for negligent or intentional violations.

The penalty obtained for the Truck and Bus violations involved in this case for failure to meet the requirements of the Phase-In Compliance Schedule is $6,000.00 or approximately $111.11 per month of violation:

- $3,000.00 for 3 vehicles not meeting the 60 percent phase-in requirement by January 1, 2013 (9 months in violation),
- $777.78 for 7 vehicles not meeting the 90 percent phase-in requirement by January 1, 2014 (1 month in violation),
- $888.89 for 4 vehicles not meeting the 90 percent phase-in requirement by March 1, 2014 (2 month in violation),
- $444.44 for 2 vehicles not meeting the 90 percent phase-in requirement by March 1, 2014 (2 months in violation),
- $888.89 for 1 vehicle not meeting the 90 percent phase-in requirement by January 1, 2015 (8 months in violation)

The penalty was discounted based on financial hardship, the fact that this was a first time violation, and the violator made diligent efforts to comply and to cooperate with the investigation.

SWCV Violations

The per vehicle penalty for the SWCV Rule violations involved in this case is a maximum of $1,000 per vehicle per day for strict liability violations or $10,000 per vehicle per day for negligent or intentional violations.

The penalty obtained for failing to install BACT by the implementation deadline for 21 violations involving in this case is $5,250 or $250 per vehicle per violation:

- $3,750 for 15 violations involving three vehicles with a 1988 to 2002 model year engine (2013, 2014, 2015)
- $1,500 for 6 violations involving two vehicles with a 2003 to 2006 model year engine (2013, 2014, 2015)

The penalty was discounted based on financial hardship, the fact that this was a first time violation, and the violator made diligent efforts to comply and to cooperate with the investigation.

PSIP Violations

The per vehicle penalty for the PSIP violations involved in this case is a maximum of $500.00 per vehicle per violation per year. The penalty obtained for the PSIP violations involved in this case is $5,250.00 for 21 violations involving 12 vehicles, or $250.00 per vehicle per violation.

The penalty was discounted based on financial hardship, the fact that this was a first time violation, and the violator made diligent efforts to comply and to cooperate with the investigation.

The provision of law the penalty is being assessed under and why that provision is most appropriate for that violation.

Truck and Bus Violations

The penalty provision being applied for the Truck and Bus regulation (13 CCR § 2025) violations in this case is HSC § 39674 because the Truck and Bus regulation is an Airborne Toxic Control Measure adopted pursuant to authority contained in HSC §§ 39002 et seq., 39650-39675 and because J. Torres Co., Inc. failed to bring their diesel fleet into compliance by the deadlines set forth in 13 CCR § 2025(i).

SWCV Violations

The penalty provision being applied for the SWCV Rule (13 CCR § 2020 *et seq.*) violations is HSC § 39674. The SWCV Rule is an Airborne Toxic Control Measure adopted pursuant to authority contained in HSC §§ 39002 et seq., 39650-39675 and because J. Torres Co., Inc. failed to install BACT on 5 vehicles by the implementation deadlines as required by the SWCV Rule during the years 2013, 2014, and 2015.

PSIP Violations

The penalty provision being applied to the PSIP violations is HSC § 43016 because J. Torres Co., Inc. failed to test, measure, record, and maintain records of smoke emissions from its fleet of heavy-duty diesel vehicles for the years 2014 and 2015 in violation of the PSIP regulation in 13 CCR § 2190 *et seq.*, for 12 vehicles. Since the PSIP regulation was adopted pursuant to authority granted in Part 5 of Division 26 of the HSC and since there is no specific penalty or fine provided for PSIP violations in Part 5, HSC § 43016 is the applicable penalty provision.

Is the penalty being assessed under a provision of law that prohibits the emission of pollution at a specified level, and, if so a quantification of excess emissions, if it is practicable to do so.

Truck and Bus Violations

The provisions cited above do prohibit emissions above a specified level of g/hp-hr. However, since the hours of operation of the noncompliant trucks involved and their individual emission rates are not known, it is not practicable to quantify the excess emissions.

SWCV Violations

The provisions cited above do prohibit emissions above a specified level of g/hp-hr. However, since the hours of operation of the noncompliant trucks involved and their individual emission rates are not known, it is not practicable to quantify the excess emissions.

PSIP Violations

The PSIP provisions cited above do prohibit emissions above a specified opacity or level of g/hp-hr. However, since the hours of operation of the noncompliant

units involved and their individual emission rates are not known, it is not practicable to quantify the excess emissions.

(21) J. Torres Co., Inc. acknowledges that ARB has complied with Senate Bill 1402 in prosecuting or settling this case. Specifically, ARB has considered all relevant facts, including those listed at HSC § 43024, has explained the manner in which the penalty amount was calculated, has identified the provision of law under which the penalty is being assessed and has considered and determined that this penalty is being assessed under a provision of law that prohibits the emission of pollutants at a specified level.

(22) Penalties were determined based on the unique circumstances of this matter, considered together with the need to remove any economic benefit from noncompliance, the goal of deterring future violations and obtaining swift compliance, the consideration of past penalties in similar cases, and the potential costs and risk associated with litigating these particular violations. Penalties in future cases might be smaller or larger on a per unit basis.

(23) The penalty was based on confidential settlement communications between ARB and J. Torres Co., Inc. that ARB does not retain in the ordinary course of business. The penalty is the product of an arms length negotiation between ARB and J. Torres Co., Inc. and reflects ARB's assessment of the relative strength of its case against J. Torres Co., Inc., the desire to avoid the uncertainty, burden and expense of litigation, obtain swift compliance with the law and remove any unfair advantage that J. Torres Co., Inc. may have secured from its actions.

(24) Now therefore, in consideration of the payment on behalf of J. Torres Co., Inc. to the Air Pollution Control Fund and the Peralta Colleges Foundation, ARB hereby releases J. Torres Co., Inc. and their principals, officers, agents, predecessors and successors from any and all claims, ARB may have or have in the future based on the circumstances described in paragraphs (1) through (18) of the Recitals. The undersigned represent that they have the authority to enter into this Agreement.

California Air Resources Board		**J. Torres Co., Inc.**	
Signature:		Signature:	
Print Name:	Dr. Todd P. Sax	Print Name:	JOE TORRES JR.
Title:	Chief Enforcement Division	Title:	G. M.
Date:	10/25/16	Date:	10/15/16.