

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

This SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE (hereinafter "Agreement") is entered into between the STATE OF CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD (hereinafter "ARB") 1001 I Street, Sacramento, California 95814, and Transportation Commodities, Inc. (hereinafter "TCI"), 4950 Triggs Street, Commerce, California 90022.

I. RECITALS

- (1) HSC §§ 39650-39675 mandate the reduction of the emissions of substances that have been determined to be toxic air contaminants. In 1998, following an exhaustive ten-year scientific assessment process, ARB identified particulate matter (PM) from diesel-fueled engines as a toxic air contaminant. In-use on-road diesel vehicles are powered by diesel fueled engines that emit toxic PM. On-road vehicles are controlled under the Truck and Bus regulation, as codified in 13 CCR § 2025.
- (2) 13 CCR § 2025(e)(1)(B) states: "Starting January 1, 2012, for all vehicles with GVWR greater than 26,000 lbs, excluding school buses, fleets must meet the requirements of 13 CCR § 2025(g) or fleets that report may instead comply with the phase-in option of 13 CCR § 2025(i)".
- (3) TCI has elected to utilize the phase-in option provided for in 13 CCR § 2025(i).
- (4) 13 CCR § 2025(i), phase-in option, requires that owners of diesel vehicles with a GVWR greater than 26,000 lbs meet the PM Best Available Control Technology (BACT) requirements by phasing in 90 percent by January 1, 2015, and 100 percent by January 1, 2016.
- (5) ARB has documented that TCI failed to have 90 percent by January 1, 2015, and 100 percent by January 1, 2016.
- (6) 13 CCR § 2025(r) sets forth the requirements for reporting all vehicles with engines subject to the regulation if the owner of a fleet has elected to utilize the compliance options of 13 CCR §§ 2025(f)(4), 2025(g)(3), 2025(g)(4), 2025(h), 2025(i), the credits of 13 CCR § 2025(j), and the agricultural provisions of 13 CCR § 2025(m), single-engine and two-engine street sweeper provisions of 13 CCR § 2025(n), extension or exemptions for vehicles used exclusively in NOx exempt areas of 13 CCR § 2025(p)(1), the extension for work trucks of 13 CCR § 2025(p)(2), and the low-use vehicle provision of 13 CCR § 2025(p)(4).
- (7) 13 CCR § 2025(e)(8) states: "All information specified in 13 CCR § 2025(r) must be reported to the Executive Officer."
- (8) 13 CCR § 2025(r)(20) states: "All reports submitted to ARB, must be accompanied with a certification signed by a responsible official or a designee

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and TCI

Page 2 of 8

thereof that the information reported is accurate and that the fleet is in compliance with the regulation."

- (9) TCI has elected to utilize the compliance options/credits/provisions of section 13 CCR §§ 2025 (i).
- (10) ARB has documented that TCI submitted inaccurate reports for vehicles with engines subject to the regulation for which the fleet owner has elected to utilize the compliance options of 13 CCR § 2025 (i).
- (11) Failure to comply with the requirements of 13 CCR § 2025 is a violation of state law resulting in penalties. HSC §§ 39674(a) and (b) authorize civil penalties for the violation of the programs for the regulation of toxic air contaminants not to exceed one thousand dollars (\$1,000) or ten thousand dollars (\$10,000), respectively, for each day in which the violation occurs.
- (12) In order to resolve these alleged violations, TCI has taken, or agreed to take, the actions enumerated below under "RELEASE". Further, ARB accepts this Agreement in termination and settlement of this matter.
- (13) In consideration of the foregoing, and of the promises and facts set forth herein, the parties desire to settle and resolve all claims, disputes, and obligations relating to the above-listed violations, and voluntarily agree to resolve this matter by means of this Agreement. Specifically, ARB and TCI agree as follows:

II. TERMS AND RELEASE

In consideration of ARB not filing a legal action against TCI for the alleged violations referred to above, and TCI's payment of the penalties set forth in Section 1 below, ARB and TCI agree as follows:

- (1) Upon execution of this Agreement, the sum of ninety four thousand five hundred dollars (\$94,500.00) shall be paid on behalf of TCI no later than May 1, 2017, as follows:
 - \$47,250.00 payable to the **Air Pollution Control Fund**
 - \$47,250.00 payable to the **San Joaquin Valley Air Pollution Control District**, with the following notation in the memo line of the check: **"For the School Bus and Diesel Emission Reduction SEP"**

Please send the signed Settlement Agreement and any future mailings or documents required per the terms of this Settlement Agreement to:

**Alfonso Arambula
Air Pollution Specialist
California Air Resources Board
Enforcement Division
P.O. Box 2815
Sacramento, California 95812**

Please send the payment along with the attached "Settlement Agreement Payment Transmittal Form" (Attachment A) to:

**California Air Resources Board
Accounting Office
P.O. Box 1436
Sacramento, California 95812-1436**

- (2) If the Attorney General files a civil action to enforce this settlement agreement, TCI shall pay all costs of investigating and prosecuting the action, including expert fees, reasonable attorney's costs, and costs.
- (3) It is further agreed that the penalties described in "Terms and Release", paragraph 1 are punitive in nature, rather than compensatory. Furthermore, the penalty is intended to deter and punish TCI for violations of state environmental statutes, and these penalties are payable to and for the benefit of ARB, a governmental unit. Therefore, it is agreed that these penalties imposed on TCI by ARB arising from the facts described in recital paragraphs (1) through (11) are non-dischargeable under 11 United States Code § 523 (a)(7), which provides an exception from discharge for any debt to the extent such debt is for a fine, penalty or forfeiture payable to and for benefit of governmental unit, and is not compensation for actual pecuniary loss, other than certain types of tax penalties.
- (4) TCI shall not violate HSC §§ 43701 *et seq.*, 44011.6 *et seq.*, and 13 CCR §§ 2180 *et seq.*, 2190 *et seq.*, and 2485 *et seq.*
- (5) TCI shall comply with one or both of the following options to attend the California Council on Diesel Education and Technology (CCDET I) class, (SAE J1667 Snap Acceleration Smoke Test Procedure for Heavy-Duty Diesel Powered Vehicles) as described on the CCDET webpage, ccdet.org. This class is conducted by various California Community Colleges and instructs attendees on compliance with the PSIP, the ECL regulation and the HDVIP.
 - (a) TCI shall have the fleet maintenance manager (or equivalent) and all staff performing opacity tests for compliance with PSIP and the HDVIP attend the

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and TCI

Page 4 of 8

CCDET I class. Proof of CCDET I completion shall be provided to ARB within six months of the date of this Agreement and be maintained in each applicable employee's file for the term of his or her employment.

- (b) If TCI uses a contractor to perform the annual smoke opacity testing required under the PSIP, in addition to having the fleet maintenance manager (or equivalent) attend the CCDET I course, TCI shall obtain proof that the contractor's staff conducting the smoke opacity tests completed the CCDET I course within the past four years. This proof of CCDET I completion shall be provided to ARB with PSIP records as required by this Agreement and be maintained with the annual PSIP records.
- (6) TCI shall comply with the following options to attend the CCDET II class (Diesel Exhaust After Treatment and Maintenance), described on the CCDET webpage, ccdet.org. This class is conducted by various California Community Colleges and instructs attendees on California's emission regulations and the proper care and maintenance of diesel exhaust after-treatment systems (DEATS).
- (a) TCI shall have the fleet maintenance manager (or equivalent) and all staff responsible for maintenance of DEATS attend the CCDET II class. Proof of CCDET II completion shall be provided to ARB within six months of the date of this Agreement and also be maintained in each applicable employee's file for the term of his or her employment.
 - (b) In case TCI uses a contractor for the maintenance of DEATS, in addition to having the fleet maintenance manager (or equivalent) attend the CCDET II course, TCI shall obtain proof that the contractor's staff maintaining the DEATS device(s) completed the CCDET II course within the last four years. This proof of the CCDET II completion shall be provided by TCI to ARB within six months of the date of this settlement and be maintained with the DEATS installation and maintenance records.
 - (c) In case TCI is unable to find a CCDET II certified contractor within a radius of 25 miles from its yard for the maintenance of DEATS, in addition to having the fleet maintenance manager (or equivalent) attend the CCDET II course, TCI shall contract only with the authorized verified diesel emission control strategy installer(s) or original equipment manufacturer distributor(s) for the maintenance of DEATS. The proof of the CCDET II completion for the fleet maintenance manager (or equivalent) shall be provided by TCI to ARB within six months of the date of this settlement and be maintained with the DEATS installation and maintenance records.
- (7) TCI shall submit copies of all PSIP compliance records for the years 2017 and 2018 to ARB by January 31 of the following year. **Copies shall be addressed to the attention of Mr. Alfonso Arambula at the California Air Resources Board, Enforcement Division, P.O. Box 2815, Sacramento, California 95812.**

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and TCI

Page 5 of 8

ARB reserves the right to visit any TCI fleet location at any time to conduct compliance audits for the HDVIP and PSIP, or any other applicable ARB program.

- (8) TCI shall complete Low NOx Software Upgrades (reflash) on all applicable heavy-duty diesel engines operating in California and report to ARB within 45 days of this agreement.
- (9) TCI shall remain in compliance with the ECL regulation as codified in 13 CCR § 2183.
- (10) TCI shall instruct all employees who operate diesel-fueled vehicles to comply with the idling regulations set forth in 13 CCR § 2485, within 45 days of this Agreement.
- (11) TCI shall not violate the Truck and Bus regulation as codified in 13 CCR § 2025.
- (12) TCI, by January 31, 2018, shall submit proof of compliance with the January 1, 2018 Truck and Bus deadline, for all regulated heavy-duty diesel vehicles, to **Mr. Alfonso Arambula, Air Pollution Specialist, California Air Resources Board, Enforcement Division, P.O. Box 2815, Sacramento, California 95812.**
- (13) This Agreement shall apply to and be binding upon TCI, and its officers, directors, receivers, trustees, employees, successors and assignees, subsidiary and parent corporations and upon ARB and any successor agency that may have responsibility for and jurisdiction over the subject matter of this Agreement.
- (14) This Agreement constitutes the entire agreement and understanding between ARB and TCI concerning the subject matter hereof, and supersedes and replaces all prior negotiations and agreements between ARB and TCI concerning the subject matter hereof.
- (15) No agreement to modify, amend, extend, supersede, terminate, or discharge this Agreement, or any portion thereof, is valid or enforceable unless it is in writing and signed by all parties to this Agreement.
- (16) Severability. Each provision of this Agreement is severable, and in the event that any provision of this Agreement is held to be invalid or unenforceable, the remainder of this Agreement remains in full force and effect.
- (17) This Agreement shall be interpreted and enforced in accordance with the laws of the State of California, without regard to California's choice-of-law rules.

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and TCI

Page 6 of 8

- (18) This Agreement is deemed to have been drafted equally by the Parties; it will not be interpreted for or against either party on the ground that said party drafted it.
- (19) Senate Bill 1402 (Dutton, Chapter 413, statutes of 2010) requires ARB to provide information on the basis for the penalties it seeks (HSC § 39619.7). This information, which is provided throughout this settlement agreement, is summarized here:

The manner in which the penalty amount was determined, including a per unit or per vehicle penalty.

Penalties must be set at levels sufficient to discourage violations. The penalties in this matter were determined in consideration of all relevant circumstances, including the eight factors specified in HSC §§ 42403 and 43024.

Truck and Bus Violations

The per unit penalty for the Truck and Bus violations involved in this case is a maximum of \$1,000 per vehicle per day for strict liability violations or \$10,000 per vehicle per day for negligent or intentional violations.

The penalty obtained for the Truck and Bus violations involved in this case for failure to meet the requirements of the Phase-In Compliance Schedule is \$93,000 or \$250 per month of violation:

- \$75,000 for 25 vehicles not meeting the 90 percent phase-in requirement by January 1, 2015 (12 months in violation), and
- \$18,000 for 6 vehicles not meeting the 100 percent phase-in requirement by January 1, 2016 (12 months in violation).

The penalty obtained for the Truck and Bus violations involved in this case for submitting inaccurate reports for vehicles in the fleet is \$1,500.00 or \$500.00 per vehicle per violation for 3 vehicles.

The penalty was discounted based on the fact that this was a first time violation and the violator made diligent efforts to comply and to cooperate with the investigation.

The provision of law the penalty is being assessed under and why that provision is most appropriate for that violation.

Truck and Bus Violations

The penalty provision being applied for the Truck and Bus regulation (13 CCR § 2025) violations in this case is HSC § 39674 because the Truck and Bus

regulation is an Airborne Toxic Control Measure adopted pursuant to authority contained in HSC §§ 39002 et seq., 39650-39675 and because TCI failed to bring their diesel fleet into compliance by the deadlines set forth in 13 CCR § 2025(i) and submitted inaccurate reports vehicles in the fleet for which they have elected to utilize compliance options/credits/provisions as required in 13 CCR § 2025(r).

Is the penalty being assessed under a provision of law that prohibits the emission of pollution at a specified level, and, if so a quantification of excess emissions, if it is practicable to do so.

Truck and Bus Violations

The provisions cited above do prohibit emissions above a specified level of g/hp-hr. However, since the hours of operation of the noncompliant vehicles involved and their individual emission rates are not known, it is not practicable to quantify the excess emissions.


- (20) TCI acknowledges that ARB has complied with Senate Bill 1402 in prosecuting or settling this case. Specifically, ARB has considered all relevant facts, including those listed at HSC § 43024, has explained the manner in which the penalty amount was calculated, has identified the provision of law under which the penalty is being assessed and has considered and determined that this penalty is being assessed under a provision of law that prohibits the emission of pollutants at a specified level.
- (21) Penalties were determined based on the unique circumstances of this matter, considered together with the need to remove any economic benefit from noncompliance, the goal of deterring future violations and obtaining swift compliance, the consideration of past penalties in similar cases, and the potential costs and risk associated with litigating these particular violations. Penalties in future cases might be smaller or larger on a per unit basis.
- (22) The penalty was based on confidential settlement communications between ARB and TCI that ARB does not retain in the ordinary course of business. The penalty is the product of an arms length negotiation between ARB and TCI and reflects ARB's assessment of the relative strength of its case against TCI, the desire to avoid the uncertainty, burden and expense of litigation, obtain swift compliance with the law and remove any unfair advantage that TCI may have secured from its actions.

(23) Now therefore, in consideration of the payment on behalf of TCI to the Air Pollution Control Fund and the San Joaquin Valley Air Pollution Control District, ARB hereby releases TCI and their principals, officers, agents, predecessors and successors from any and all claims, ARB may have or have in the future based on the circumstances described in paragraphs (1) through (11) of the Recitals. The undersigned represent that they have the authority to enter into this Agreement.

California Air Resources Board

Transportation Commodities, Inc.

Signature: 

Signature: 

Print Name: Ellen M. Peter

Print Name: Andrew Flynn

Title: Chief Counsel

Title: President

Date: 5/5/2017

Date: 4/24/17