

From: Tom Koehler [mailto:tomk@pacificethanol.com]

Sent: Wednesday, March 23, 2016 3:21 PM

To: Duffy, James@ARB

Subject: Comments regarding Dashboard.

Hi Jim - We think the dashboard is great, however the second slide converting the price of credits to pass through price increase for carbob is misleading and could add unnecessary propaganda to the oil companies campaign to discredit the program as expensive. Ethanol as example competes with octane in the refinery which is more expensive than base carbob. Ethanol has been and continues to be the cheapest form of octane for refiners. In addition the sheer volume of ethanol creates a tremendous supply "savings" to the consumers. These two very real effects are not considered in your second slide and the public could get a very wrong impression of the actual cost of the program and the oil companies could totally use it to misrepresent the case. We would recommend not including this as part of the dash board. If you have any questions or follow up happy to have a conversation. Thanks for considering.

Tom

Tom Koehler

