

**Comment 1 for ShorePower (shorepwr07) - 45 Day.**

First Name: Enrique

Last Name: Chiock

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: Breathe California of Los Angeles County

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/1-07126com0001.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/1-07126com0001.pdf)

Original File Name: 07126com0001.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2007-11-07 10:51:56

No Duplicates.

**Comment 2 for ShorePower (shorepwr07) - 45 Day.**

First Name: Mark

Last Name: Krausse

Email Address: mckd@pge.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Pacific Gas and Electric Company

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/2-07126com0002.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/2-07126com0002.pdf)

Original File Name: 07126com0002.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2007-11-07 10:56:20

No Duplicates.

**Comment 3 for ShorePower (shorepwr07) - 45 Day.**

First Name: Joseph

Last Name: Haraburda

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: Oakland Metropolitan Chamber of Commerce

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/3-071260001.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/3-071260001.pdf)

Original File Name: 071260001.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2007-11-07 11:01:53

No Duplicates.

**Comment 4 for ShorePower (shorepwr07) - 45 Day.**

First Name: Jane

Last Name: Williams

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: California Communities Against Toxics California Environmental Rights Alliance

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/5-071260002.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/5-071260002.pdf)

Original File Name: 071260002.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2007-11-07 11:16:02

No Duplicates.

**Comment 5 for ShorePower (shorepwr07) - 45 Day.**

First Name: Omar

Last Name: Benjamin

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: Port of Oakland- Draft At-Berth Ocean Going Vessel Regulations

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/8-071260003.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/8-071260003.pdf)

Original File Name: 071260003.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2007-11-07 11:23:51

No Duplicates.

**Comment 6 for ShorePower (shorepwr07) - 45 Day.**

First Name: Teri

Last Name: Shore

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: Friends of the Earth

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/9-07126com0004.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/9-07126com0004.pdf)

Original File Name: 07126com0004.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2007-11-07 11:28:08

No Duplicates.

**Comment 7 for ShorePower (shorepwr07) - 45 Day.**

This comment was posted then deleted because it was unrelated to the Board item or it was a duplicate.

**Comment 8 for ShorePower (shorepwr07) - 45 Day.**

First Name: Jack

Last Name: Broadbent

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: Bay Area Air Quality Management District

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/12-07126com0007.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/12-07126com0007.pdf)

Original File Name: 07126com0007.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2007-11-08 13:29:09

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 9 for ShorePower (shorepwr07) - 45 Day.**

First Name: Amy

Last Name: Zimmerman

Email Address: amy@weemployyou.net

Affiliation: Amy Zimmerman & Associates, Inc.

Subject: California Air Resources Board has written a proposed shore-side power or “cold ironing” r

Comment:

The CARB regulation should be Technology Neutral as to how emissions from ships are reduced.

Ø Level the playing field for all technologies to be implemented.

Ø The proposed regulation allows industry to postpone emission reductions until 2014 when utility based grid power is available.

Ø Establish equal timelines based on emissions reductions regardless of the technology.

Ø Establish an emissions credit bank for early compliance.

Ø Many solutions are available today, we shouldn't have to wait for grid power promises

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2007-11-09 18:05:29

No Duplicates.

**Comment 10 for ShorePower (shorepwr07) - 45 Day.**

First Name: GINA

Last Name: ALLEN

Email Address: GINAC72@YAHOO.COM

Affiliation:

Subject: CARB REGULATION

Comment:

This is ridiculous. Why would you wait another 7-10 years to fix a problem when we have the resources and technology to help it now. How can we just sit here and continue to harm peoples health, and our environment when there are simple solutions to these problems now.

Stop being so political and lets get back to the basics of simple human survival.

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2007-11-12 09:31:46

No Duplicates.

**Comment 11 for ShorePower (shorepwr07) - 45 Day.**

First Name: Cheryl

Last Name: Tillman

Email Address: cheryl\_tillman@sbcglobal.net

Affiliation:

Subject: Stop ships from burning crude oil

Comment:

The proposed regulation allows industry to postpone emission reductions until 2014 when utility based grid power is available.

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2007-11-12 15:33:36

No Duplicates.

**Comment 12 for ShorePower (shorepwr07) - 45 Day.**

First Name: John

Last Name: Larson

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: City of Seal Beach

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/16-07126com0008.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/16-07126com0008.pdf)

Original File Name: 07126com0008.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2007-11-14 13:29:45

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 13 for ShorePower (shorepwr07) - 45 Day.**

First Name: Georgianna

Last Name: La Peer

Email Address: curiousgeorgianna@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Regulations to reduce emissions from diesel auxiliary engines on ocean going vessels ...

Comment:

This regulation as written will not reduce a single ounce of harmful emissions until January 1st, 2014 at the earliest when mandated reductions go into effect. As written the proposed regulation offers no incentive for early adopters to achieve compliance before being forced to. Lastly, compliance standards within the proposed regulation serve to thwart new technological solutions that are available today. This is because the regulation is based on a presumptive solution: port electrification. The problem is that the presumption is flawed. The costs are staggering, estimated to be \$1.2 billion statewide, and the difficulty to electrify a port means years of construction to install infrastructure to receive electrical power that is not available - and there are no plans or budgets to build new generation capacity to supply this power.

Ship-borne air pollution is well documented and proven to cause serious health problems in people from in all walks of life having serious effects on children and the elderly. One scientific report published on November 7th, 2007 by the American Chemical Society journal Environmental Science & Technology states "...the number of people dying (globally) from heart and lung disease as a result of under-regulated shipping emissions totaled 60,000 in 2002, and that death toll is estimated to grow by 40% by 2012..."

Incentives for early adoption of alternative control solutions are essential to encourage ocean carriers, vessel owners and terminal operators to use proven emissions preventative technologies that are available now. If encouraged these solutions could reduce these harmful emissions to the full extent of the regulation in every seaport in California by year-end 2012 - and at a small fraction (1/30th) of the cost of port electrification. That's 6 years sooner and more than a billion dollars cheaper. This is truly a better way.

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2007-11-27 10:35:33

No Duplicates.

**Comment 14 for ShorePower (shorepwr07) - 45 Day.**

First Name: James

Last Name: Fine

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: Environmental Indicators Project

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/18-shorepwr07com0001.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/18-shorepwr07com0001.pdf)

Original File Name: shorepwr07com0001.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2007-11-27 13:32:27

No Duplicates.

**Comment 15 for ShorePower (shorepwr07) - 45 Day.**

First Name: Jack

Last Name: Broadbent

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: Bay Area Air Quality

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/19-shorepwr07com0002.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/19-shorepwr07com0002.pdf)

Original File Name: shorepwr07com0002.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2007-11-27 13:34:40

No Duplicates.

**Comment 16 for ShorePower (shorepwr07) - 45 Day.**

First Name: Robert

Last Name: Cross

Email Address: rcross@cleanairlogix.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Shore power regulation comment

Comment:

please see attachment

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/20-carb\\_comment\\_letter.doc](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/20-carb_comment_letter.doc)

Original File Name: CARB Comment Letter.doc

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2007-11-30 16:11:22

No Duplicates.

**Comment 17 for ShorePower (shorepwr07) - 45 Day.**

First Name: Tom

Last Name: Plenys

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: Coalition for Clean Air- Natural Resources Defense Council Updated  
Comment:

This comment is part of comment #7 which is missing the last 3 pages. Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/21-shorecom0001.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/21-shorecom0001.pdf)

Original File Name: shorecom0001.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2007-12-03 10:40:31

No Duplicates.

**Comment 18 for ShorePower (shorepwr07) - 45 Day.**

First Name: T.L.

Last Name: Garrett

Email Address: tgarrett@pmsaship.com

Affiliation: Pacific Merchant Shipping Association

Subject: PMSA Comment on Proposed Regulation to Reduce Emissions from Vessels at Berth  
Comment:

see attached letter

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/22-arb\\_shorepower\\_rule\\_comments\\_\\_12-3-07\\_.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/22-arb_shorepower_rule_comments__12-3-07_.pdf)

Original File Name: ARB Shorepower Rule Comments (12-3-07).pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2007-12-03 14:23:12

No Duplicates.

**Comment 19 for ShorePower (shorepwr07) - 45 Day.**

First Name: Valerie

Last Name: Gardner

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: Form Letter 1

Comment:

Please see attached

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/23-formlettercom0002.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/23-formlettercom0002.pdf)

Original File Name: formlettercom0002.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2007-12-03 14:39:35

75 Duplicates.

## **Comment 20 for ShorePower (shorepwr07) - 45 Day.**

First Name: Stephen and Betty

Last Name: Anderson

Email Address: sca1baa@earthlink.net

Affiliation:

Subject: comment to shorepwr07

Comment:

It is in the interest of all Californians that you act to reduce pollution where ever it occurs. This is particularly true at the ports of California where there is such a high concentration of pollution. We see this as a critical step in improving the quality of life for Californians and especially for communities in and around the ports.

We do not think it wise to extend exemptions to any port users for any reason at the expense of our children and communities. These regulations need to reflect our determination to illuminate problems resulting from port pollution; if not as an enforceable solution as a goal. Most Californians are fed up with government that accomplishes nothing by appeasing polluters.

Stephen and Betty Anderson

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2007-12-03 23:17:31

No Duplicates.

**Comment 21 for ShorePower (shorepwr07) - 45 Day.**

First Name: Don

Last Name: Perata

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: California State Senate- Senator Perata

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/26-california\\_state\\_senate.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/26-california_state_senate.pdf)

Original File Name: california state senate.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2007-12-04 09:54:11

No Duplicates.

**Comment 22 for ShorePower (shorepwr07) - 45 Day.**

First Name: Terry

Last Name: Dale

Email Address: bondi@alcalde-fay.com

Affiliation: Cruise Lines International Association

Subject: Comments of CLIA regarding the Proposed At-Berth Ocean-Going Vessels Regulation  
Comment:

Please see the attached document for the Cruise Lines International Association's comments regarding the proposed at-berth ocean-going vessel regulation.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/27-carb\\_comments\\_clia.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/27-carb_comments_clia.pdf)

Original File Name: CARB Comments CLIA.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2007-12-04 14:24:03

No Duplicates.

**Comment 23 for ShorePower (shorepwr07) - 45 Day.**

First Name: Barry

Last Name: Wallerstein

Email Address: bwallerstein@aqmd.gov

Affiliation:

Subject: SCAQMD Staff Comments on the Proposed At-Berth Regulations

Comment:

Please find attached a copy of the South Coast AQMD staff comments regarding the proposed regulations.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/28-scaqmd\\_comments\\_-\\_shorepower\\_-\\_120507.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/28-scaqmd_comments_-_shorepower_-_120507.pdf)

Original File Name: SCAQMD Comments - Shorepower - 120507.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2007-12-05 09:00:12

No Duplicates.

**Comment 24 for ShorePower (shorepwr07) - 45 Day.**

This comment was posted then deleted because it was unrelated to the Board item or it was a duplicate.

**Comment 25 for ShorePower (shorepwr07) - 45 Day.**

First Name: Candice

Last Name: Kim

Email Address: candice@coalitionforcleanair.org

Affiliation: Coalition For Clean Air

Subject: Support for Shorepower Regulation

Comment:

Please find attached a comment letter in support of the shorepower regulation that has been signed by health and environmental advocates from throughout the state.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/30-carb\\_shorepower\\_comments\\_final\\_12\\_5.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/30-carb_shorepower_comments_final_12_5.pdf)

Original File Name: CARB Shorepower Comments FINAL 12\_5.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2007-12-05 11:57:15

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 26 for ShorePower (shorepwr07) - 45 Day.**

First Name: Larry

Last Name: Hottenstein

Email Address: larry.hottenstein@erm.com

Affiliation: ERM

Subject: Comment on Emission Measurement Method

Comment:

The emission measurement method for diesel PM for demonstrating control efficiencies for alternative control technologies (f)(4)(B)3. should allow CARB Test Method 5 or U.S. EPA Reference Method 5 and 202. The ISO 8178 Test Methods needlessly require a dilution tunnel, 5 stable test modes, and a different temperature (125 F) defining PM. Auxilliary engine exhaust stack diameters and gas velocity are normally within the range to allow standard isokinetic PM sampling. Accepted CARB standard methods should be utilized to provide consistency in PM measurements.

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2007-12-05 14:46:41

No Duplicates.

**Comment 1 for ShorePower (shorepwr07). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Henry

Last Name: Hogo

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: South Coast AQMD

Comment:

please see attached

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/32-07126com0001.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/32-07126com0001.pdf)

Original File Name: 07126com0001.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2007-12-19 11:02:15

No Duplicates.

**Comment 2 for ShorePower (shorepwr07). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Rhey

Last Name: Lee

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: City of Long Beach

Comment:

please see attached

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/33-document.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/33-document.pdf)

Original File Name: Document.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2007-12-19 11:08:17

No Duplicates.

### **Comment 3 for ShorePower (shorepwr07). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Seiichi

Last Name: Tsurumi

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: Sound Energy Solutions

Comment:

please see attached

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/34-document0001.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/34-document0001.pdf)

Original File Name: Document0001.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2007-12-19 11:15:08

No Duplicates.

**Comment 4 for ShorePower (shorepwr07). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Thomas

Last Name: Jelenic

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: The Port of Long Beach

Comment:

please see attached

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/35-document0002.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/35-document0002.pdf)

Original File Name: Document0002.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2007-12-19 11:18:40

No Duplicates.

**Comment 5 for ShorePower (shorepwr07). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Ralph

Last Name: Appy

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: The Port of Los Angeles

Comment:

please see attached

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/36-document0003.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/36-document0003.pdf)

Original File Name: Document0003.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2007-12-19 11:23:27

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 1 for ShorePower (shorepwr07) - 15-1.**

First Name: John

Last Name: Powell

Email Address: jpowell@actiengineering.com

Affiliation: ACTI

Subject: Comment on proposed Reg

Comment:

1. On page 8, Requirements and Compliance Schedule (d)(2)(A) The sentence "...Specifically, at-berth auxiliary engine emissions must be reduced by 10 percent by January 1, 2010, 25 percent by January 1, 2012, ..."

should be modified to read... "Specifically, at-berth emissions must be reduced by...", where the words "auxiliary engines" have been deleted.

At-berth emissions include boiler emissions, and the ACTI system will reduce boiler emissions as well as auxiliary engine emissions, resulting in lower total emissions than if only the auxiliary engines were considered. Total emissions reduction should be the criterion.

2. There will be a period of time during shore power connect and also prior to shore power disconnect when the auxiliary engines will be operating. This time is not accounted for.

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2008-08-27 14:28:21

No Duplicates.

**Comment 2 for ShorePower (shorepwr07) - 15-1.**

First Name: William G.  
Last Name: Gotimer, Jr.  
Email Address: bgotimer@trailerbridge.com  
Affiliation: Trailer Bridge, Inc.

Subject: Reduced Emissions from Ocena-Going Vessels While at Berth in Cal. Port  
Comment:

Please see attached comments.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/39-comment\\_to\\_carb\\_september\\_2008.doc](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/39-comment_to_carb_september_2008.doc)

Original File Name: Comment to CARB September 2008.doc

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2008-09-03 08:49:22

No Duplicates.

### **Comment 3 for ShorePower (shorepwr07) - 15-1.**

First Name: T.L

Last Name: Garrett

Email Address: tgarrett@pmsaship.com

Affiliation: Pacific Merchant Shipping Association

Subject: PMSA Comments on 15-day Notice of Modifications to At-Berth Regulation

Comment:

Attached are PMSA's comments on "Proposed Modified Regulations to Reduce Emissions from Diesel Auxiliary Engines on Ocean-Going Vessels While At-Berth at a California Port", we include our previous comments submitted on December 3, 2008 by reference.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/40-pmsa\\_comments\\_\\_on\\_15-day\\_modifications\\_to\\_at\\_berth\\_regulation.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/40-pmsa_comments__on_15-day_modifications_to_at_berth_regulation.pdf)

Original File Name: PMSA Comments on 15-day Modifications to At Berth Regulation.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2008-09-08 13:56:55

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 4 for ShorePower (shorepwr07) - 15-1.**

First Name: T.L

Last Name: Garrett

Email Address: tgarrett@pmsaship.com

Affiliation: Pacific Merchant Shipping Association

Subject: PMSA Comments on 15-day Notice of Modifications to At-Berth Regulation

Comment:

Previous comments sent as attachment to PMSA's comments on 15-Day Notice to "Proposed Regulations to Reduce Emissions from Diesel Auxiliary Engines on Ocean-Going Vessels While At-Berth at a California Port", we include our previous comments submitted on December 3, 2008 by reference.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/41-](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/41-pmsa_comment_on_proposed_regulation_to_reduce_emissions_from_vessels_at_berth.pdf)

[pmsa\\_comment\\_on\\_proposed\\_regulation\\_to\\_reduce\\_emissions\\_from\\_vessels\\_at\\_berth.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/41-pmsa_comment_on_proposed_regulation_to_reduce_emissions_from_vessels_at_berth.pdf)

Original File Name: PMSA Comment on Proposed Regulation to Reduce Emissions from Vessels at Berth.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2008-09-08 14:00:41

No Duplicates.

**Comment 5 for ShorePower (shorepwr07) - 15-1.**

First Name: Lee  
Last Name: Kindberg  
Email Address: NAMENVIRO@maersk.com  
Affiliation: Maersk Line

Subject: Maersk Comments on Proposed Modified Shore Power Regulations  
Comment:

Maersk Inc. and Maersk Line respectfully request the California Air Resource Board's (CARB) consideration of the attached comments on the "Proposed Modified Regulations to Reduce Emissions from Diesel Auxiliary Engines on Ocean-Going Vessels While At-Berth at a California Port" published on August 22, 2008.

Thank you.  
Sincerely,  
Lee Kindberg

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/42-maersk\\_comments\\_on\\_ca\\_shore\\_power\\_proposed\\_revisions\\_09-08-08\\_final.doc](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/shorepwr07/42-maersk_comments_on_ca_shore_power_proposed_revisions_09-08-08_final.doc)

Original File Name: Maersk Comments on CA Shore Power Proposed Revisions 09-08-08 final.doc

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2008-09-08 14:48:55

No Duplicates.