

**Comment 1 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA  
(tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: David

Last Name: Mundstock

Email Address: davidmundstock@msn.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Tropical Forest Offsets

Comment:

I oppose all plans for tropical forest offsets. The validity of such "offsets" is questionable at best. They fail to meet CARB's standards that offsets must be real, quantifiable, and enforceable.

And with Brazil about to elect a right wing anti-environmentalist, Amazon rain forest offsets will be just a sham, little different from such offsets in other countries.

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-08 11:47:23

No Duplicates.

**Comment 2 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA  
(tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Michael

Last Name: Martin

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: Oppose the California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/2-tfs2018-UTwHYFckByBRPghm.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/2-tfs2018-UTwHYFckByBRPghm.pdf)

Original File Name: Martin.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-22 15:02:01

6685 Duplicates.

**Comment 3 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Alberto

Last Name: Saldamando

Email Address: alberto@ienearth.org

Affiliation: Indigenous Environmental Network

Subject: IEN Comments on the proposed Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please find the Indigenous Environmental Network's comments on California's Tropical Forest Standards

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/5-tfs2018-UzpXNFQ7WFQDKAJd.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/5-tfs2018-UzpXNFQ7WFQDKAJd.pdf)

Original File Name: IEN - Comments to CARB on Tropical Forest Standard-1-Signed.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-24 14:25:01

No Duplicates.

**Comment 4 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA  
(tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Test

Last Name: Is this Working?

Email Address: test@igc.org

Affiliation:

Subject: TEST

Comment:

x

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-26 11:13:12

No Duplicates.

**Comment 5 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA  
(tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Todd

Last Name: Snyder

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: Withdraw California Tropical Forest Standard Proposal

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/7-tfs2018-VyACbQRxAjkKaFUn.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/7-tfs2018-VyACbQRxAjkKaFUn.pdf)

Original File Name: withdraw California Tropical Forest Standard proposal.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-26 14:14:17

No Duplicates.

**Comment 6 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA  
(tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Roberto

Last Name: Ferraez

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Campeche State, Mexico

Subject: Public Comment Letter of Support for California Cap & Trade

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/8-tfs2018-UTJRNgFtUXJSMQVm.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/8-tfs2018-UTJRNgFtUXJSMQVm.pdf)

Original File Name: Campeche 2018 10 17 carta de apoyo de Campeche para California.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-26 14:17:49

No Duplicates.

**Comment 7 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Maria

Last Name: Mejia

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Jalisco State, Mexico

Subject: Public Comment Letter of Support for California Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/10-tfs2018-UjhXMFY7BD5SJwBj.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/10-tfs2018-UjhXMFY7BD5SJwBj.pdf)

Original File Name: Jalisco OFICIO 1539-2018 (GCF).pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-26 14:21:29

No Duplicates.

**Comment 8 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Sayda Melina Rodrigu  
Last Name: Gomez  
Email Address: Non-web submitted comment  
Affiliation: Yucatan State, Mexico

Subject: Public Comment Letter of Support for California Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/11-tfs2018-WikGZVYZWX8KYQdm.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/11-tfs2018-WikGZVYZWX8KYQdm.pdf)

Original File Name: SEDUMA YUC\_GOB CALIFORNIA\_ENG.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-26 14:22:02

No Duplicates.

**Comment 9 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Ricardo Hernandez

Last Name: Sanchez

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Chiapas State, Mexico

Subject: Public Comment Letter of Support for California Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/12-tfs2018-BmVSPFM7UGIGcAR1.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/12-tfs2018-BmVSPFM7UGIGcAR1.pdf)

Original File Name: Chiapas carta de apoyo al cap and trade.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-26 14:23:00

No Duplicates.

**Comment 10 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Alfredo Aaron Juarez

Last Name: Cruz

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Oaxaca State, Mexico

Subject: Public Comment Letter of Support for California Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/13-tfs2018-VjkbZIEoUWMBZFAx.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/13-tfs2018-VjkbZIEoUWMBZFAx.pdf)

Original File Name: Oaxaca.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-26 14:24:00

No Duplicates.

**Comment 11 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Krista

Last Name: Petrelli

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: Adopt the California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/14-tfs2018-VzgGMFRkAyAEwM0D.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/14-tfs2018-VzgGMFRkAyAEwM0D.pdf)

Original File Name: Adopt the California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2018).pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-26 16:14:55

No Duplicates.

**Comment 12 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Jonah  
Last Name: Busch  
Email Address: jbusch@earthinnovation.org  
Affiliation: Earth Innovation Institute

Subject: Strong Support for CARB Endorsing the Draft California Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

Strong Support for CARB Endorsing the Draft California Tropical Forest Standard

Public comment from Earth Innovation Institute

The Earth Innovation Institute strongly supports the California Air Resources Board endorsing the draft California Tropical Forest Standard as a step toward integrating international jurisdictional sector-based offsets for reducing emissions from deforestation and forest degradation into the California cap-and-trade program.

In the attached letter of support, we:

- i) describe the importance of the Standard in the larger context of solving climate change; and
- ii) offer specific points of feedback on elements of the draft Standard with the goal of approving the strongest possible final Standard.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/15-tfs2018-UCNRI1wvBzsAaAlu.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/15-tfs2018-UCNRI1wvBzsAaAlu.pdf)

Original File Name: Strong Support for CARB Endorsing the Draft California Tropical Forest Standard.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-28 13:55:31

No Duplicates.

**Comment 13 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Frances  
Last Name: Seymour  
Email Address: francesjseymour@gmail.com  
Affiliation:

Subject: Comments on Draft Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

Please see attached file with my comments.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/16-tfs2018-UTJSO1Y6UG4DYFI8.docx](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/16-tfs2018-UTJSO1Y6UG4DYFI8.docx)

Original File Name: Comments on Draft California Tropical Forest Standard.docx

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-28 17:44:04

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 14 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Christopher  
Last Name: Lish  
Email Address: lishchris@yahoo.com  
Affiliation:

Subject: Stand with Indigenous allies, say no to tropical forest offsets  
Comment:

Sunday, October 28, 2018

Subject: Stand with Indigenous allies, say no to tropical forest offsets -- Notice of Availability and Public Comment Period For the California Tropical Forest Standard and Draft Environmental Analysis

Dear California Air Resources Board Officials,

As a California resident, I am writing to urge you to reject and withdraw the deeply flawed California Tropical Forest Standard and to ensure that these offsets never are accepted into California's carbon trading system. In the name of our climate, health and wildlife, we must act as quickly as possible to keep fossil fuels in the ground right here in California. That means requiring industrial polluters to make deeper greenhouse gas cuts at their own facilities rather than certifying carbon-offset schemes in jurisdictions thousands of miles away.

Specifically, I urge you to abandon this plan for the following reasons:

1) Carbon offsets allow big emitters in California to keep polluting, often in low-income communities of color, instead of reducing their carbon footprint. They perpetuate pollution hotspots and prevent California from taking real action on climate change. To prevent the worst effects of climate change, we can't afford to make way for carbon offsets that enable fossil fuel companies to continue polluting in California. Our carbon budget for preventing devastating climate change harms is nearly spent. And with offsets, some industrial polluters in California will emit more greenhouse gas pollution--and for longer--than they would otherwise be allowed in the absence of those offsets.

2) We know that the greenhouse gas pollution from industry is very often accompanied by other pollutants that worsen air quality. We must cut carbon pollution at its source here in California to ensure the health and safety of our communities.

3) Tropical forest carbon offsets lack integrity and are impossible to police across national borders. Similar schemes resembling the draft California Tropical Forest Standard have failed to prove reliable with their carbon accounting and guaranteed permanence. To make matters worse, these offset programs have a poor track record of actually reducing deforestation. For these reasons, no

compliance market in the world accepts tropical forest carbon credits, and California should not be the first. We can do better.

4) Tropical forest offset programs threaten the rights of indigenous peoples in the Amazon and beyond, placing forest peoples at risk of displacement and losing control of their territories, their cultures, and their ways of life. In places like Brazil and Indonesia, they have a disturbing track record of disrupting indigenous communities and the surrounding forest ecosystems.

For all these reasons, I urge you to reject the draft California Tropical Forest Standard and to commit to ending new permits for oil and gas projects in California. If California wants to be a real climate leader, it must do better than "offsetting" pollution. We must address the primary cause of climate change: fossil fuel extraction and combustion. Our climate, health, and wildlife can't afford the grave threat of continued fossil fuel development.

Thank you for your consideration of my comments. Please do NOT add my name to your mailing list. I will learn about future developments on this issue from other sources.

Sincerely,  
Christopher Lish  
San Rafael, CA

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-28 19:21:56

No Duplicates.

**Comment 15 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Alice

Last Name: Ekwu

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Government of Cross River State

Subject: Public Comment - Letter of Support for California Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/18-tfs2018-BmUCZQNuADpSMgdo.doc](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/18-tfs2018-BmUCZQNuADpSMgdo.doc)

Original File Name: California ARB Letter.doc

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 08:21:47

No Duplicates.

**Comment 16 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Antonio

Last Name: Kubes

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Government of Pastaza, Ecuador

Subject: Letter of Support for California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/19-tfs2018-WipTNAR2ByAEY1Io.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/19-tfs2018-WipTNAR2ByAEY1Io.pdf)

Original File Name: Pastaza Carta CALIFORNIA.PDF

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 08:22:56

No Duplicates.

**Comment 17 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Antonio Waldez Goes  
Last Name: Da Silva  
Email Address: Non-web submitted comment  
Affiliation: Government of Amapa, Brazil

Subject: Letter of Support for California Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/20-tfs2018-WjtVPgRkAyADZAZZ.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/20-tfs2018-WjtVPgRkAyADZAZZ.pdf)

Original File Name: Amapa CARTA DE APOIO AO GOVERNADOR DE CALIFORNIA-GCF.PDF

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 08:24:51

No Duplicates.

**Comment 18 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Alfredo Arellano

Last Name: Guillermo

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Government of Quintana Roo, Mexico

Subject: Letter of Support for California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/21-tfs2018-ATMGMFFhAGtRZIJi.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/21-tfs2018-ATMGMFFhAGtRZIJi.pdf)

Original File Name: 20181024142825333.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 08:33:37

No Duplicates.

**Comment 19 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Andre Luis Torres

Last Name: Baby

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Government of Mato Grosso State, Brazil

Subject: Letter of Support for California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/22-tfs2018-VzgCYgRsVGQAb1M8.docx](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/22-tfs2018-VzgCYgRsVGQAb1M8.docx)

Original File Name: OFICIO MT ao Governo Califoørnia .docx

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 08:35:02

No Duplicates.

**Comment 20 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Carrie  
Last Name: Mann  
Email Address: cmann@foe.org  
Affiliation: Friends of the Earth

Subject: Comments from Friends of the Earth  
Comment:

Hello,  
On behalf of Friends of the Earth and our members and activists, I am submitting 5703 comments on this proposal. Please see attachment for details.  
Thanks,  
Carrie

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/23-tfs2018-VjVSNVYIUWAHXgNg.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/23-tfs2018-VjVSNVYIUWAHXgNg.pdf)

Original File Name: CARB comments.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 09:17:41

No Duplicates.

**Comment 21 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Amy  
Last Name: Duchelle  
Email Address: a.duchelle@cgiar.org  
Affiliation: CIFOR

Subject: Support for the California Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

Please see attached file.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/24-tfs2018-AWICa1Y6VWtWNQVr.docx](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/24-tfs2018-AWICa1Y6VWtWNQVr.docx)

Original File Name: Comments on the California Tropical Forest Standard\_29Oct2018.docx

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 10:21:48

No Duplicates.

**Comment 22 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Michelle  
Last Name: Chan  
Email Address: mchan@foe.org  
Affiliation:

Subject: ARB should reject consideration of Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

Attached please find a submission from more than 50 organizations from around the world. We strongly urge the ARB to reject consideration of the Tropical Forest Standard, and any attempts to accept REDD credits into California's carbon trading system.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/25-tfs2018-BTdcalFhAmkELAc2.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/25-tfs2018-BTdcalFhAmkELAc2.pdf)

Original File Name: 2018.10.29 NoToREDD.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 10:31:07

No Duplicates.

**Comment 23 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Charles

Last Name: McNeill

Email Address: charles.mcneill@un.org

Affiliation: United Nations Environment

Subject: Comments in Support of California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached comments from the United Nations in support of the California Tropical Forest Standards.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/26-tfs2018-WjkAWVY6WWIWPgdi.docx](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/26-tfs2018-WjkAWVY6WWIWPgdi.docx)

Original File Name: C McNeill on California Tropical Forest Standard 28 Oct 2018.docx

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 10:34:17

No Duplicates.

**Comment 24 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Magaly

Last Name: Medeiros

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Government of Acre State, Brazil

Subject: Letter of Support for California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/27-tfs2018-VjpcP1UgVnEFZgFz.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/27-tfs2018-VjpcP1UgVnEFZgFz.pdf)

Original File Name: Letter Of Recommendation Acre.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 10:46:23

No Duplicates.

**Comment 25 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Heather  
Last Name: Karlstad  
Email Address: heather.karlstad@dentons.com  
Affiliation: Legal Secretary

Subject: Shell Energy North America (US), L.P. Comments  
Comment:

Attached are Shell Energy North America (US), L.P.'s Comments to the CARB's tropical forest standard and draft environmental analysis.

Heather Karlstad, Legal Secretary to  
John W. Leslie  
Dentons US LLP  
Attorneys for Shell Energy North America (US), L.P.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/28-tfs2018-ATNdawExUzgcWwNs.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/28-tfs2018-ATNdawExUzgcWwNs.pdf)

Original File Name: 2018 October 29 Tropical Forest Comments to ARB.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 10:52:25

No Duplicates.

**Comment 26 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Hamilton  
Last Name: Santiago Pereira  
Email Address: renatoberwanger@gmail.com  
Affiliation: Secretary of Environment, Rondonia Brazi

Subject: Letter of Support for California Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

Dear Board Members,

Please find enclosed a letter of support for the California Tropical Forest Standard from the State of Rondonia, Brazil.

Thank you for your attention,

Sincerely,

Hamilton Santiago Pereira  
Secretary of Environment  
Rondonia, Brazil

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/29-tfs2018-BmlTM1A4U14BWFVi.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/29-tfs2018-BmlTM1A4U14BWFVi.pdf)

Original File Name: OFI&#769;CIO (1).pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 10:47:46

No Duplicates.

**Comment 27 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Cybele

Last Name: Knowles

Email Address: cknowles@biologicaldiversity.org

Affiliation: Center for Biological Diversity

Subject: 2,280 comments opposing Draft California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Attached please find 2,280 comments from supporters of the Center for Biological Diversity on the California Tropical Forest Standard and Draft Environmental Analysis. Your close attention is appreciated.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/30-tfs2018-WjkCZVxwBSIEcFU6.xlsx](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/30-tfs2018-WjkCZVxwBSIEcFU6.xlsx)

Original File Name: CA-Trop-Forest-2280comments.xlsx

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 11:13:09

No Duplicates.

**Comment 28 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Alvaro Pacheco

Last Name: Alvarez

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Department of Caqueta

Subject: Letter of Support for California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/31-tfs2018-AmFRNIMjACZVNgB0.zip](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/31-tfs2018-AmFRNIMjACZVNgB0.zip)

Original File Name: Caqueta.zip

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 12:02:07

No Duplicates.

**Comment 29 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA  
(tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Reynaldo Hilbck

Last Name: Guzman

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Regional Government of Piura

Subject: Letter of Support for California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/32-tfs2018-UiIBbgZyByZRNgUr.zip](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/32-tfs2018-UiIBbgZyByZRNgUr.zip)

Original File Name: Piura.zip

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 12:04:49

No Duplicates.

**Comment 30 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Victor Manuel Norieg

Last Name: Reategui

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Regional Government of San Martin

Subject: Letter of Support for California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/34-tfs2018-VyQFYgdoVFgBagJj.zip](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/34-tfs2018-VyQFYgdoVFgBagJj.zip)

Original File Name: San Martin.zip

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 12:08:32

No Duplicates.

**Comment 31 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Marcelo Jose de Lima

Last Name: Dutra

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Government of Amazonas, Brazil

Subject: Letter of Support for California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/35-tfs2018-AGMGYQd0V3ALbAdY.docx](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/35-tfs2018-AGMGYQd0V3ALbAdY.docx)

Original File Name: Carta de adesão do Projeto da Califórnia-ingle&#770;s.pdf(2).docx

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 12:09:01

No Duplicates.

**Comment 32 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA  
(tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Harjot

Last Name: Kaur

Email Address: kaur@law.ucla.edu

Affiliation: UCLA School of Law

Subject: Emmett Institute Writes in Support of the Proposed California Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

The Emmett Institute on Climate Change and the Environment at UCLA School of Law submits this letter in support of CARB's proposed Tropical Forest Standard. The full letter is attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/36-tfs2018-AWJVMIE8BwtRI1Ai.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/36-tfs2018-AWJVMIE8BwtRI1Ai.pdf)

Original File Name: Cal Tropical Forest Std Comment Letter - Emmett Institute.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 12:06:30

No Duplicates.

**Comment 33 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Manuel Gambini

Last Name: Rupay

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Regional Government of Ucayali

Subject: Letter of Support for California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/37-tfs2018-BXAAZVw8WXMBZlc7.zip](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/37-tfs2018-BXAAZVw8WXMBZlc7.zip)

Original File Name: Ucayali.zip

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 12:15:41

No Duplicates.

**Comment 34 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA  
(tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Flavia Furtado

Last Name: Alves

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Government of Roraima

Subject: Letter of Support for California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/38-tfs2018-VCZTOgd0BTcLZAhl.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/38-tfs2018-VCZTOgd0BTcLZAhl.pdf)

Original File Name: Roraima.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 12:28:03

No Duplicates.

**Comment 35 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Gary

Last Name: Hughes

Email Address: garygrahamhughes@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Inadequate Analysis Requires Rejection of Endorsement of CTFS

Comment:

Please see the attached letter for comment on the draft California Tropical Forest Standard and accompanying Draft EA.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/39-tfs2018-AmEGdF06WXkFYAZp.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/39-tfs2018-AmEGdF06WXkFYAZp.pdf)

Original File Name: CTFScommentHughes.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 12:36:35

No Duplicates.

**Comment 36 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Jeff  
Last Name: Seabright  
Email Address: Jeff.Seabright@Unilever.com  
Affiliation:

Subject: Comments on the California Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

See attached letter.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/40-tfs2018-UjFcNQZqVmhQMwJs.docx](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/40-tfs2018-UjFcNQZqVmhQMwJs.docx)

Original File Name: Comments on the California Tropical Forest Standard.docx

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 12:40:03

No Duplicates.

**Comment 37 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA  
(tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

This comment was posted then deleted because it was unrelated to the Board item or it was a duplicate.

**Comment 38 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Michael  
Last Name: Schmidlehner  
Email Address: michael@schmidlehner.com  
Affiliation:

Subject: Rejeicao do anteprojeto Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

Veja anexos.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/42-tfs2018-BnUGYwFoWGYCbQRg.zip](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/42-tfs2018-BnUGYwFoWGYCbQRg.zip)

Original File Name: Schmidlehner.zip

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 12:46:09

No Duplicates.

**Comment 39 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Amy  
Last Name: Moas  
Email Address: amy.moas@greenpeace.org  
Affiliation: Greenpeace

Subject: Strong opposition to the Draft California Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

Please find attached here Greenpeace USA's formal comment letter signed by our Executive Director, Annie Leonard.

Sincerely,

Amy Moas, Ph.D.  
Senior Forest Campaigner  
Greenpeace USA

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/43-tfs2018-AGcGcFAOBDQCawdq.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/43-tfs2018-AGcGcFAOBDQCawdq.pdf)

Original File Name: GP Comment letter on CA Tropical Forest Standard FINAL.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 12:53:31

No Duplicates.

**Comment 40 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA  
(tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Pennie Opal

Last Name: Plant

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Idle No More SF Bay

Subject: Comments on Tropical Forest Offsets

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/44-tfs2018-UCRRJQNtVnVRPgdk.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/44-tfs2018-UCRRJQNtVnVRPgdk.pdf)

Original File Name: Tropical Forest Offsets.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 12:58:56

No Duplicates.

**Comment 41 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Cassandra  
Last Name: Smithies  
Email Address: noredd@igc.org  
Affiliation: Global Alliance against REDD

Subject: Reject the Neocolonialist Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

I have tried to send this comment 15 times your webpage is not working properly.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/45-tfs2018-VTtXPgNdAyQGZgd0.docx](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/45-tfs2018-VTtXPgNdAyQGZgd0.docx)

Original File Name: NO TFS Letter.docx

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 14:00:16

No Duplicates.

**Comment 42 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA  
(tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Pamela

Last Name: Tau

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: Asian American Community opposition to the Proposed CA Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/46-tfs2018-UTABdABoVWcLY1UK.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/46-tfs2018-UTABdABoVWcLY1UK.pdf)

Original File Name: Asian American Community opposition to the proposed California Tropical Forest Standard and Draft Environmental Analysis.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 14:12:13

No Duplicates.

**Comment 43 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA  
(tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Eron  
Last Name: Bloomgarden  
Email Address: eron@climateandforest.com  
Affiliation:

Subject: Tropical Forest Standard Comment  
Comment:

To California Air Resources Board:

Please see our comment on the Tropical Forest Standard attached.

Sincerely,

Eron Bloomgarden

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/47-tfs2018-BWZVMgNwVWQLUgRw.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/47-tfs2018-BWZVMgNwVWQLUgRw.pdf)

Original File Name: CARB\_TFS\_10.29\_Final.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 14:30:14

No Duplicates.

**Comment 44 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Dawson

Last Name: Hunter

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Conservation International

Subject: Conservation International Comments on the CA Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/48-tfs2018-B2ICZQBrUwtX4M0d.zip](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/48-tfs2018-B2ICZQBrUwtX4M0d.zip)

Original File Name: CARB.zip

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 14:35:15

No Duplicates.

**Comment 45 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA  
(tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Luan

Last Name: Marks

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: Comments on Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/49-tfs2018-AHQAYFEjUzJSZAEw.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/49-tfs2018-AHQAYFEjUzJSZAEw.pdf)

Original File Name: tfs2018 Resending.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 14:35:33

No Duplicates.

**Comment 46 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Jim

Last Name: Peugh

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: San Diego Audubon Society

Subject: Comment Letter on CA Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/50-tfs2018-UjNQP1UmWVUAdARh.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/50-tfs2018-UjNQP1UmWVUAdARh.pdf)

Original File Name: Air Resources Board Tropical Forest letter Oct2018.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 14:36:40

No Duplicates.

**Comment 47 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Larry

Last Name: Lohmann

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: The Corner House

Subject: Comments for the California Air Resources Board on the California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/51-tfs2018-UTICZQRpWWNSMlc4.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/51-tfs2018-UTICZQRpWWNSMlc4.pdf)

Original File Name: CALIFORNIA TFS AND DRAFT EA.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 14:53:35

No Duplicates.

**Comment 48 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: David

Last Name: Antonioli

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Verra

Subject: Comments on CA Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/52-tfs2018-VyEFZIYIUXADZFUK.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/52-tfs2018-VyEFZIYIUXADZFUK.pdf)

Original File Name: Verra comments on Draft CA Tropical Forest Standard, 29 OCT 2018.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 14:59:06

No Duplicates.

**Comment 49 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Ruben  
Last Name: Alva Ochoa  
Email Address: aencinas@mda.org.pe  
Affiliation: Governor of Huanuco, Peru

Subject: Letter of Support for California Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

Dear Board Members,

Please find enclosed a letter of support for the California Tropical Forest Standard from Roraima State, Brazil.

Thank you for your attention,

Sincerely,

Ruben Alva Ochoa  
Governor  
Huanuco, Peru

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/53-tfs2018-AWJdOgFyUXZQN1UK.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/53-tfs2018-AWJdOgFyUXZQN1UK.pdf)

Original File Name: Carta a California (ES-EN) Hua&#769;nuco.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 15:00:03

No Duplicates.

**Comment 50 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Carlos  
Last Name: Navas del Aguila  
Email Address: aencinas@mda.org.pe  
Affiliation: Governor of Amazonas, Peru

Subject: Letter of Support for California Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

Dear Board Members,

Please find enclosed a letter of support for the California Tropical Forest Standard from Amazonas, Peru.

Thank you for your attention,

Sincerely,

Carlos Navas del Aguila  
Governor  
Amazonas State, Peru

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/54-tfs2018-UDNTNABzAiVXMANc.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/54-tfs2018-UDNTNABzAiVXMANc.pdf)

Original File Name: Carta a California (ES-EN) Amazonas.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 15:04:24

No Duplicates.

**Comment 51 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Cynthia

Last Name: Mellon

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Climate Justice Alliance

Subject: Comments on TFS from Climate Justice Alliance

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/56-tfs2018-BmVROF0xAD5WNVA+.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/56-tfs2018-BmVROF0xAD5WNVA+.pdf)

Original File Name: Comments on TFS from Climate Justice Alliance.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 15:12:22

No Duplicates.

**Comment 52 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Leila  
Last Name: Salazar-Lopez  
Email Address: leila@amazonwatch.org  
Affiliation: Amazon Watch

Subject: Opposition to TFS  
Comment:

Please see the attached letter.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/57-tfs2018-UzIAcQBeUGADZAh6.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/57-tfs2018-UzIAcQBeUGADZAh6.pdf)

Original File Name: AW CARB Letter on Opposition to TFS.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 15:29:52

No Duplicates.

**Comment 53 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: EDWIGE DAVY WOHARY

Last Name: COULIBALY

Email Address: davy.afhon@gmail.com

Affiliation: +22501013147

Subject: COMPLAINTE

Comment:

We as Civil Society Organization in Ivory Coast express a deep concern about the FPIC process. The fact that the technical document is only available in english is very problematic for the communities. Then the technical document in English need to be adress in French before any implementations of program or project in Cavally and Belier provinces in Ivory Coast.

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 15:01:06

No Duplicates.

**Comment 54 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Christopher  
Last Name: Field  
Email Address: cfield@stanford.edu  
Affiliation: Stanford University

Subject: Comments on the California Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

Jason Gray  
California Air Resources Board  
1001 I Street  
Sacramento, CA 95812

Re: Comments on the California Tropical Forest Standard: Criteria for Assessing Jurisdictional-Scale Programs that Reduce Emissions from Tropical Deforestation

Dear Mr. Gray:

I am submitting comments as an individual and not as a representative of Stanford University or any other organization. I am a research scientist with decades of experience in studies of the global carbon cycle and quantifying ecosystem carbon stocks.

I have evaluated the draft California Tropical Forest Standard and am writing to encourage the California Air Resources Board to endorse the Standard.

My reading of the technical literature and my own research together convince me that available and affordable technologies have the necessary accuracy, precision, and availability to provide high-confidence in reported carbon stocks and stock changes, especially at the jurisdictional scale. I do not feel that concerns about the potential accuracy of reporting and verification should prevent approval of the standard. Reporting and verification involve important technical challenges, but the available technology can deal with these effectively, at reasonable costs.

Sincerely,

Christopher Field

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 15:38:17

No Duplicates.

**Comment 55 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Alexandra  
Last Name: Leumer  
Email Address: aleumer@tnc.org  
Affiliation: The Nature Conservancy

Subject: Group Support Letter for the Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

I submit this letter in support of the Tropical Forest Standard on behalf of The Nature Conservancy, Environmental Defense Fund, Earth Innovation Institute, Climate Action Reserve, and Verra.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/60-tfs2018-Wj1dKQdpByEAdIUK.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/60-tfs2018-Wj1dKQdpByEAdIUK.pdf)

Original File Name: Group Support Letter for Tropical Forest Std. 10 29 18.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 15:48:56

No Duplicates.

**Comment 56 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Alexandra  
Last Name: Leumer  
Email Address: aleumer@tnc.org  
Affiliation: The Nature Conservancy

Subject: The Nature Conservancy Support for the Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

The Nature Conservancy submits this letter in strong support of the Tropical Forest Standard.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/61-tfs2018-AnYGbgBiAw9RNAZp.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/61-tfs2018-AnYGbgBiAw9RNAZp.pdf)

Original File Name: TNC Comments on Draft Tropical Forest Standard .pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 15:52:17

No Duplicates.

**Comment 57 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Michael  
Last Name: Smyth  
Email Address: Michael.Smyth@olamnet.com  
Affiliation: Olam International

Subject: Comment from Olam International on CA Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

Dear Mr. Gray,

Please see the attached letter comment from Mr. Michael Smyth, Senior Vice President, Olam International, regarding the California Tropical Forest Standard.

Thank you for your attention and consideration.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/62-tfs2018-UzAFYIEiADFVDFIh.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/62-tfs2018-UzAFYIEiADFVDFIh.pdf)

Original File Name: CARB\_Signed\_Comment on CA Tropical Forest Standard\_Olam-International\_29OCT2018.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 15:41:29

No Duplicates.

**Comment 58 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: .

Last Name: Documentary Projects

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Documentary Projects

Subject: California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA Risks and Alternatives

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/64-tfs2018-AmEBZlwxVG4BYQhn.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/64-tfs2018-AmEBZlwxVG4BYQhn.pdf)

Original File Name: California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA Risks and Alternatives.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 16:03:10

No Duplicates.

**Comment 59 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: James  
Last Name: Holtkamp  
Email Address: [jholtkamp@hollandhart.com](mailto:jholtkamp@hollandhart.com)  
Affiliation: Holland & Hart LLP

Subject: California Tropical Forest Standard and Draft Environmental Analysis  
Comment:

Comments of Pax Natura attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/65-tfs2018-ATMFM1xsUjkGLQIz.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/65-tfs2018-ATMFM1xsUjkGLQIz.pdf)

Original File Name: 2018-10-29 ltr to CA Air Resources Board.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 16:00:27

No Duplicates.

**Comment 60 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Tim

Last Name: Clairs

Email Address: tim.clairs@undp.org

Affiliation: United Nations Development Programme

Subject: Tropical Forest Standard comments

Comment:

Please find letter attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/66-tfs2018-UDNUM1V5WX4KfgBv.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/66-tfs2018-UDNUM1V5WX4KfgBv.pdf)

Original File Name: Ca-tropical forest standard\_UNDP letter.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 16:01:59

No Duplicates.

**Comment 61 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA  
(tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Heather

Last Name: Shelby

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Environmental Defense Fund

Subject: Adopt the California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/67-tfs2018-BnVVO105AzwFYVcu.zip](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/67-tfs2018-BnVVO105AzwFYVcu.zip)

Original File Name: Shelby.zip

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 16:07:38

No Duplicates.

**Comment 62 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA  
(tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Lauren  
Last Name: Withey  
Email Address: [lwithey@berkeley.edu](mailto:lwithey@berkeley.edu)  
Affiliation: UC Berkeley

Subject: TFS Draft Standard -- Time to Drop Tropical Forest Offsets  
Comment:

To Jason Gray and CARB Members:  
Please find attached my comments on the draft TFS.

Thank you for your consideration.

Sincerely,  
Lauren Withey

PhD Candidate  
UC Berkeley  
Environmental Science, Policy, and Management

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/68-tfs2018-B3BVOIYjWGNXNFMq.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/68-tfs2018-B3BVOIYjWGNXNFMq.pdf)

Original File Name: Withey\_CARB TFS\_ Comments\_2018.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 16:06:08

No Duplicates.

**Comment 63 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Jaron

Last Name: Browne

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Grassroots Global Justice Alliance

Subject: Comments on Draft California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/69-tfs2018-BTdSZFdnUDsGMgk5.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/69-tfs2018-BTdSZFdnUDsGMgk5.pdf)

Original File Name: 20182029 GGJ Letter to CARB on the TFS.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 16:09:54

No Duplicates.

**Comment 64 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA  
(tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: David

Last Name: Marvin

Email Address: dave@sal0.ai

Affiliation: Salo Sciences, Inc.

Subject: Comments on the California Tropical Forest Standard submitted by Salo Sciences, Inc.

Comment:

Please see the attached letter.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/70-tfs2018-AnEFYgdqAj5WD1Ix.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/70-tfs2018-AnEFYgdqAj5WD1Ix.pdf)

Original File Name: Salo Comments to ARB.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 15:13:00

No Duplicates.

**Comment 65 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Shaye

Last Name: Wolf

Email Address: [swolf@biologicaldiversity.org](mailto:swolf@biologicaldiversity.org)

Affiliation: Center for Biological Diversity

Subject: TFS comments

Comment:

I am submitting the attached comment letter on the California Tropical Forest Standard and Draft EA on behalf of the Center for Biological Diversity, Friends of the Earth, and Indigenous Environmental Network. The Tropical Forest Standard remains deeply problematic and we request that CARB reject it.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/71-tfs2018-VmcGOFEPVzUANgVa.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/71-tfs2018-VmcGOFEPVzUANgVa.pdf)

Original File Name: 18 10 29 CBD FOE IEN comments Tropical Forest Standard final.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 16:15:09

No Duplicates.

**Comment 66 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Eduardo  
Last Name: Tavares  
Email Address: seplan.ap@gmail.com  
Affiliation: Spokenperson for GCF Brazil - Amapa

Subject: Comments on the CARB Tropical Forest Standard hearing November  
Comment:

On Behalf of the State of Amapa and Brazil Mata Viva, which in partnership have instituted a Jurisdictional Scale Program to preserve and reduce emissions from tropical deforestation, I hereby present the attached submissions. Should you have any questions or comments, we are available to answer or respond further per the above contact details.

Please note that pages on the BMV methodology is confidential and submitted only to CARB official who need to know.

Best Regards,

Eduardo Tavares  
Secretary of Budget - Amapa  
Member of GCF Brazil - AP

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/72-tfs2018-W2pWYFMNVjcHOFcI.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/72-tfs2018-W2pWYFMNVjcHOFcI.pdf)

Original File Name: 10 29 2018 AMAPA BMV SUBMISSIONS ON CALIFORNIA TROPICAL FOREST STANDARD.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 16:16:41

No Duplicates.

**Comment 67 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Donna

Last Name: Lee

Email Address: donnalynettelee@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Comments on draft Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

See attached, comments on draft Tropical Forest Standard.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/73-tfs2018-AnIGdVixAD8EawBj.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/73-tfs2018-AnIGdVixAD8EawBj.pdf)

Original File Name: Public comments - CA Tropical Forest Standard.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 16:24:47

No Duplicates.

**Comment 68 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Katie  
Last Name: Sullivan  
Email Address: sullivan@ieta.org  
Affiliation:

Subject: IETA Comments on Proposed Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

Dear Jason Gray,

Thank you for the opportunity to provide comments on the proposed tropical forest standard. Please find IETA's comments attached.

Sincerely,

Katie Sullivan

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/74-tfs2018-BTcGOVwCVWkKbw19.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/74-tfs2018-BTcGOVwCVWkKbw19.pdf)

Original File Name: 29 Oct 18 IETA Final Tropical Forest Standard.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 16:26:29

No Duplicates.

**Comment 69 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Gladys  
Last Name: Limon  
Email Address: glimon@caleja.org  
Affiliation: CEJA

Subject: 29 Organizations Reject Draft California Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

Please see the attached letter from 20 organizations urging that the Air Resources Board reject the proposed TFS.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/76-tfs2018-WzgBYgBrUmADWlc5.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/76-tfs2018-WzgBYgBrUmADWlc5.pdf)

Original File Name: CEJA NoTFS Ltr Final. 10.29.18.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 16:35:36

No Duplicates.

**Comment 70 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Jessica  
Last Name: Melton  
Email Address: jessica.melton@pge.com  
Affiliation: PG&E

Subject: PG&E Letter of Support for Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

See attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/78-tfs2018-WysHZgZiBwtXJQh6.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/78-tfs2018-WysHZgZiBwtXJQh6.pdf)

Original File Name: PGE Tropical Forest Standard Support Letter.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 16:41:52

No Duplicates.

**Comment 71 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA  
(tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Christina

Last Name: McCain

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Environmental Defense Fund

Subject: Support for Proposed California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please accept these comments in support of the proposed California  
Tropical Forest Standard.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/79-tfs2018-UjEHYABeWH8Cdgo.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/79-tfs2018-UjEHYABeWH8Cdgo.pdf)

Original File Name: CA\_TropicalForestStandard\_EDF.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 16:47:41

No Duplicates.

**Comment 72 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Virginiaor  
Last Name: Zaunbrecher  
Email Address: zaunbrecher@ucla.edu  
Affiliation: UCLA - Center for Tropical Research

Subject: Comments on the Draft Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

Please find attached comments on the CARB draft Tropical Forest Standard submitted by UCLA's Center for Tropical Research and the Congo Basin Institute.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/80-tfs2018-AGNWJFMgWVUBcwFz.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/80-tfs2018-AGNWJFMgWVUBcwFz.pdf)

Original File Name: CTR Tropical Forest Standard Comments (Oct 29 2018).pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 16:34:40

No Duplicates.

**Comment 73 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Andreas

Last Name: Dahl-Jorgensen

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: NICFI

Subject: California's Climate and Forest Leadership

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/81-tfs2018-AGMBZgFsBD4BYVU6.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/81-tfs2018-AGMBZgFsBD4BYVU6.pdf)

Original File Name: California's climate and forest leadership.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 16:54:46

No Duplicates.

**Comment 74 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA  
(tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Laura

Last Name: Rosenberger Haider

Email Address: lauragreen.rosenberger@gmail.com

Affiliation: Sierra Club, CEJC

Subject: Tropical forests

Comment:

Please reserve all forest land. Do not burn it in biomass incinerator plants which increased the PM 2.5 in the nearby community of Malaga by 25% and sometimes releases hydrogen sulfide. Processing wood requires too much energy.

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 16:47:12

No Duplicates.

**Comment 75 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Kathy

Last Name: McAfee

Email Address: kmcafee@sfsu.edu

Affiliation: San Francisco State University kmcafee@s

Subject: Comments on proposed Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please find comments attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/83-tfs2018-VTZTOl0xVGoHZAln.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/83-tfs2018-VTZTOl0xVGoHZAln.pdf)

Original File Name: Comments on proposed Tropical Forest Standard - submitted.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 16:48:46

No Duplicates.

**Comment 76 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Christie

Last Name: Pollet-Young

Email Address: cpollet-young@scsglobalservices.com

Affiliation: SCS Global Services

Subject: tfs2018\_Verification Support for Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/84-tfs2018-UCMAZQFzVVkLeVAi.docx](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/84-tfs2018-UCMAZQFzVVkLeVAi.docx)

Original File Name: SCS\_TropicalForestStandard\_102918.docx

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 16:58:20

No Duplicates.

**Comment 77 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Magaly  
Last Name: Medeiros  
Email Address: magalymedeiros@gmail.com  
Affiliation:

Subject: Letter of Support for California Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

Dear Board Members,

Please find enclosed a letter of support for the California Tropical Forest Standard from a member of the Global Committee for Indigenous Peoples and Local Communities of the Governors' Climate and Forest Task Force

Thank you for your attention,

Sincerely,

Magaly Medeiros  
Member of the Global Committee for Indigenous Peoples and Local Communities of the Governors' Climate and Forest Task Force

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/85-tfs2018-BmUCZQNwByBVMlAP.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/85-tfs2018-BmUCZQNwByBVMlAP.pdf)

Original File Name: Carta de Recomendac#o#771;o - Povos Indi#769;genas e Comunidades Locais GCF.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-29 16:54:23

No Duplicates.

**Comment 78 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Janice

Last Name: McMahon

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Environmental Services Inc.

Subject: LATE ARB Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/86-tfs2018-B2IGcwRsVVIQIgBy.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/86-tfs2018-B2IGcwRsVVIQIgBy.pdf)

Original File Name: ESI\_TropicalForestStandard2018\_Comments\_Final\_2018-10-29.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-30 08:20:17

No Duplicates.

**Comment 79 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Leslie  
Last Name: Durshinger  
Email Address: Non-web submitted comment  
Affiliation: Terra Global

Subject: LATE Comments on California Tropical Forestry Protocol  
Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/87-tfs2018-BXFTMANwAyJQNwVa.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/87-tfs2018-BXFTMANwAyJQNwVa.pdf)

Original File Name: Terra Global - CA Tropical Forest Protocol comments v1-0.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-30 13:48:55

No Duplicates.

**Comment 80 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Shaye

Last Name: Wolf

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Center for Biological Diversity

Subject: LATE 2018 Proposed Tropical Forest Carbon Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/88-tfs2018-UCMCZQBrUVIQ4m0D.zip](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/88-tfs2018-UCMCZQBrUVIQ4m0D.zip)

Original File Name: Center for Biological Diversity.zip

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-30 13:52:25

No Duplicates.

**Comment 81 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Rubens Pereira

Last Name: Brito

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Tocantins State, Brazil

Subject: LATE Letter of Support for California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/89-tfs2018-VjIRMVSYUmJQPwJt.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/89-tfs2018-VjIRMVSYUmJQPwJt.pdf)

Original File Name: OFÍCIO - GOVERNADOR DO ESTADO DA CALIFÓRNIA.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-30 15:16:24

No Duplicates.

**Comment 82 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA  
(tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Marcelo De Araujo Co  
Last Name: Coehlo  
Email Address: Non-web submitted comment  
Affiliation: Maranhao State, Brazil

Subject: LATE Comments on California Tropical Forestry Protocol  
Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/90-tfs2018-WzhUPQFIUGtSOAdo.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/90-tfs2018-WzhUPQFIUGtSOAdo.pdf)

Original File Name: Coehlo.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-30 15:18:34

No Duplicates.

**Comment 83 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Andrea

Last Name: Tuttle

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Forest and Climate Policy

Subject: LATE Support for the "Draft California Tropical Forest Standard"

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/91-tfs2018-AmMHc1c0VVkFcAF0.docx](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/91-tfs2018-AmMHc1c0VVkFcAF0.docx)

Original File Name: ARB Support Ltr- Tropical Forest Standard ATuttle.docx

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-11-08 11:20:08

No Duplicates.

**Comment 84 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Jordan

Last Name: Hensley

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Central Valley Water Board

Subject: Comments to Request for Review for the Endorsement of the CA Tropical Forest Standar

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/92-tfs2018-ATkGNAQoV3BRMQFy.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/92-tfs2018-ATkGNAQoV3BRMQFy.pdf)

Original File Name: 84-tfs2018.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-11-09 10:38:50

No Duplicates.

**Comment 85 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Jutta

Last Name: Kill

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: LATE Comments on the California Air Resources Board Draft Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/93-tfs2018-VTYBaANvBTsBYgJs.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/93-tfs2018-VTYBaANvBTsBYgJs.pdf)

Original File Name: Comment to the California Air Resources Board on the draft Tropical Forest Standard.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-11-13 08:10:44

No Duplicates.

**Comment 86 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Suzi

Last Name: Kerr

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Motu Economic and Public Policy Research

Subject: LATE Support for the California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/94-tfs2018-UGIGMAY2Vj0CW1dm.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/94-tfs2018-UGIGMAY2Vj0CW1dm.pdf)

Original File Name: 2018\_11 Motu CARB letter.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-11-13 08:54:10

No Duplicates.

**Comment 87 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA  
(tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Luiz Paulo

Last Name: Maciel

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Amazon Environmental Research Institute

Subject: LATE IPAM - Letter to Members of the Board of the California Air Resources Board  
Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/95-tfs2018-WjdSNVw+BD5RMIQ4.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/95-tfs2018-WjdSNVw+BD5RMIQ4.pdf)

Original File Name: Maciel.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-11-13 08:56:46

No Duplicates.

**Comment 88 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Michael

Last Name: Jenkins

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Forest Trends

Subject: LATE Support for the California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/96-tfs2018-Uz4FaVIMAj0GZVAk.docx](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/96-tfs2018-Uz4FaVIMAj0GZVAk.docx)

Original File Name: MJ Letter\_ 20181112.docx

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-11-13 09:00:31

No Duplicates.

**Comment 89 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Maximilian

Last Name: Probst

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: MexiCO2

Subject: LATE Support for the California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/97-tfs2018-Am1WJVQhUHFWNVAx.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/97-tfs2018-Am1WJVQhUHFWNVAx.pdf)

Original File Name: Outreach to CARB board on Forest Standard - MEXICO2.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-11-13 09:02:13

No Duplicates.

**Comment 90 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Sergio

Last Name: Guzman

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: ACOFOP

Subject: LATE Comments on the California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/98-tfs2018-VTRXMIM9BDEHbIMj.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/98-tfs2018-VTRXMIM9BDEHbIMj.pdf)

Original File Name: ACOFOP.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-11-13 09:03:29

No Duplicates.

**Comment 91 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA  
(tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Dawson

Last Name: Hunter

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Conservation International

Subject: LATE Conservation International Comments on the California Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/99-tfs2018-VjUAbwRaWGgKbQV3.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/99-tfs2018-VjUAbwRaWGgKbQV3.pdf)

Original File Name: CI CARB Forest Standard 10.29.18.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-11-13 09:06:24

No Duplicates.

**Comment 92 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Jane

Last Name: Goodall

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: The Jane Goodal Institute

Subject: LATE The California Draft Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/101-tfs2018-UzkHYAFuWG4HXgFm.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/101-tfs2018-UzkHYAFuWG4HXgFm.pdf)

Original File Name: Jane Goodall letter to Mary Nicholls CARB..pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-11-13 09:15:47

No Duplicates.

**Comment 93 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Amy  
Last Name: Duchelle  
Email Address: Non-web submitted comment  
Affiliation: CIFOR

Subject: LATE Letter for CARB on behalf of CIFOR and Partners  
Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/102-tfs2018-VTZdNFE9AD4FZIU7.docx](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/102-tfs2018-VTZdNFE9AD4FZIU7.docx)

Original File Name: Comments on the California Tropical Forest Standard\_13Nov2018\_final.docx

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-11-13 09:22:37

No Duplicates.

**Comment 94 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Daniel

Last Name: Nepstad

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: LATE A Letter to the Air Resources Board Regarding the Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/103-tfs2018-AmNUDVwuBDQEawRh.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/103-tfs2018-AmNUDVwuBDQEawRh.pdf)

Original File Name: A Scientists' Letter to CARB\_Nov 13\_final2.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-11-13 09:26:25

No Duplicates.

**Comment 95 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Geeta

Last Name: Uhl

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Governor's Climate and Forest Task Force

Subject: LATE Strong Support for CA Tropical Forest Standard from 22 GCF Task Force  
Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/106-tfs2018-UGIdNFFuWiJQbm0d.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/106-tfs2018-UGIdNFFuWiJQbm0d.pdf)

Original File Name: GCF Task Force.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-11-13 10:09:40

No Duplicates.

**Comment 96 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA  
(tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Barbara

Last Name: Haya

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: LATE Joint geographer and other social and conservation scientists comments

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/107-tfs2018-BmwBaFI6UG0GdFV4.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/107-tfs2018-BmwBaFI6UG0GdFV4.pdf)

Original File Name: Joint-scholar-comments-on-TFS.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-11-13 10:57:19

No Duplicates.

**Comment 97 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Erik

Last Name: Solheim

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: UN Environment Programme

Subject: LATE Comments on the California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/108-tfs2018-UCUAaFEPUmRQOFM1.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/108-tfs2018-UCUAaFEPUmRQOFM1.pdf)

Original File Name: UN Environment Programme.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-11-13 13:38:29

No Duplicates.

**Comment 98 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA  
(tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Maria

Last Name: DiGiano

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Global Committee for Indigenous Peoples

Subject: LATE Letter to CARB Board Members

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/109-tfs2018-VDJRJVM9Az0HXglu.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/109-tfs2018-VDJRJVM9Az0HXglu.pdf)

Original File Name: From GCF TF Global Committe for IP and LC.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-11-13 15:37:08

No Duplicates.

**Comment 99 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA  
(tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Janice

Last Name: McMahon

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Environmental Services Inc.

Subject: LATE Letter from Verification Body - Endorsement of Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/111-tfs2018-AmdTO1QjVW9WIII9.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/111-tfs2018-AmdTO1QjVW9WIII9.pdf)

Original File Name: Environment Services.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-11-14 11:36:22

No Duplicates.

**Comment 100 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Nara

Last Name: Lee

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Korea Forest Standard

Subject: LATE Supporting Letter for California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/112-tfs2018-AHMGdQR1VXZVPFAi.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/112-tfs2018-AHMGdQR1VXZVPFAi.pdf)

Original File Name: Support for California Tropical Forest Standard.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-11-14 11:38:39

No Duplicates.

**Comment 101 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Gustavo

Last Name: Valle

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Red MOCAF

Subject: LATE Comments on the California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/126-tfs2018-UTJUM1MgVHNXMANc.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/126-tfs2018-UTJUM1MgVHNXMANc.pdf)

Original File Name: Carta RED MOCAF (Meixico) sobre Norma de Bosques Tropicales.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-11-19 14:31:29

No Duplicates.

**Comment 102 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Barbara

Last Name: Haya

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: LATE Joint Comment Letter from 110 social and conservation scientists

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/127-tfs2018-UDoFbFU9Az4LeQcq.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/127-tfs2018-UDoFbFU9Az4LeQcq.pdf)

Original File Name: Joint-scholars-comments-on-TFS.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-11-27 08:22:45

No Duplicates.

**Comment 103 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Michael

Last Name: Carr

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Shell

Subject: LATE Shell Comments regarding the Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/128-tfs2018-UCNTPVI2Um1ROwdY.docx](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/128-tfs2018-UCNTPVI2Um1ROwdY.docx)

Original File Name: Shell Comments November Board Agenda Item Number 18-9-6.docx

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-12-05 09:52:24

No Duplicates.

**Comment 1 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Charlotta

Last Name: Chan

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Earth Innovation

Subject: Image of Jane Goodall

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/113-tfs2018-Vz1VNAcoByRXNQNI.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/113-tfs2018-Vz1VNAcoByRXNQNI.pdf)

Original File Name: JG.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-11-19 14:07:45

No Duplicates.

**Comment 2 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA  
(tfs2018). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Robinson

Last Name: Lopez

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: Comments on the Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/114-tfs2018-AXNVP1F+U3AFZwZg.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/114-tfs2018-AXNVP1F+U3AFZwZg.pdf)

Original File Name: RL.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-11-19 14:11:34

No Duplicates.

**Comment 3 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA  
(tfs2018). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Colleen

Last Name: Lyons

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: GCF

Subject: Comments on the Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/115-tfs2018-VDdXPQMsACMFZwBm.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/115-tfs2018-VDdXPQMsACMFZwBm.pdf)

Original File Name: CL.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-11-19 14:12:43

No Duplicates.

**Comment 4 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA  
(tfs2018). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Gary

Last Name: Hughes

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: California Tropical Forest Standard Comments

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/117-tfs2018-UDdRP1J9WXoFZwBm.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/117-tfs2018-UDdRP1J9WXoFZwBm.pdf)

Original File Name: GH.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-11-19 14:14:10

No Duplicates.

**Comment 5 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Paul

Last Name: Mason

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: Support for the Draft California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/118-tfs2018-VDIcO1MhV2sHbwQq.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/118-tfs2018-VDIcO1MhV2sHbwQq.pdf)

Original File Name: Mason.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-11-19 14:14:54

No Duplicates.

**Comment 6 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA  
(tfs2018). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Ana Luz Valadez

Last Name: Ortega

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: Open Letter from the Indigenous Peoples of the World to the Governor of California

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/119-tfs2018-VTpUIAB1AzUFZAZn.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/119-tfs2018-VTpUIAB1AzUFZAZn.pdf)

Original File Name: Ortega.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-11-19 14:16:02

No Duplicates.

**Comment 7 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA  
(tfs2018). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Francisca

Last Name: Arara

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: Comments on the Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/120-tfs2018-BWRRJQRkUnNQNWgm.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/120-tfs2018-BWRRJQRkUnNQNWgm.pdf)

Original File Name: Arara.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-11-19 14:18:10

No Duplicates.

**Comment 8 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Basilio

Last Name: Chi

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: Comments on the Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/122-tfs2018-AGMBb1A4VSgFc1A0.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/122-tfs2018-AGMBb1A4VSgFc1A0.pdf)

Original File Name: Chi.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-11-19 14:20:42

No Duplicates.

**Comment 9 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Magaly

Last Name: Medeiros

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: Comments on the Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/123-tfs2018-UD0AY1YzWW8Ea1Un.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/123-tfs2018-UD0AY1YzWW8Ea1Un.pdf)

Original File Name: Medeiros.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-11-19 14:21:29

No Duplicates.

**Comment 10 for California Tropical Forest Standard and the Draft EA (tfs2018). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Sergio

Last Name: Guzman

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: Tropical Forest Carbon in Indigenous Territories: A Global Analysis

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/125-tfs2018-BWJTIFUuWWdVMgFv.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/125-tfs2018-BWJTIFUuWWdVMgFv.pdf)

Original File Name: Guzman.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-11-19 14:23:55

No Duplicates.