

**There are no comments posted to Carb/Ejac Joint Meeting (carbejac090122)  
at this time.**

## **Comment 1 for Carb/Ejac Joint Meeting (carbejac090122). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Evan

Last Name: Edgar

Email Address: evan@edgarinc.org

Affiliation:

Subject: Support the ZEV Battery Directive for environmental justice for all

Comment:

<p>Comments attached&nbsp;&i</p>

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/2-carbejac090122-UTJVMgNwUWALUII3.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/2-carbejac090122-UTJVMgNwUWALUII3.pdf)

Original File Name: CARB EJAC Sept 1 2022 meeting Submittal.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-09-01 13:01:41

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 2 for Carb/Ejac Joint Meeting (carbejac090122). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Leah

Last Name: Bahramipour

Email Address: leah.bahramipour@sierraclub.org

Affiliation: Sierra Club

Subject: RE: Scoping Plan Electric Sector Comments

Comment:

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/4-carbejac090122-VDdVMIQnVmcAWQl6.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/4-carbejac090122-VDdVMIQnVmcAWQl6.pdf)

Original File Name: CARB Scoping Plan - Electric Sector Letter (Aug. 29, 2022).pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-09-01 13:48:13

No Duplicates.

### **Comment 3 for Carb/Ejac Joint Meeting (carbejac090122). (At Hearing)**

This comment was posted then deleted because it was unrelated to the Board item or it was a duplicate.

## **Comment 4 for Carb/Ejac Joint Meeting (carbejac090122). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Ted

Last Name: Franklin

Email Address: ted@tedfranklin.net

Affiliation:

Subject: 138 Rank-and-File Unionists: Scoping Plan Must Address Labor Concerns

Comment:

Please see letter submitted for June CARB meeting.

The Climate Jobs Plan is attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/6-carbejac090122-VTZRNgdqUWsAYAdo.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/6-carbejac090122-VTZRNgdqUWsAYAdo.pdf)

Original File Name: California Climate Jobs Plan.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-09-01 13:49:56

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 5 for Carb/Ejac Joint Meeting (carbejac090122). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Jeremy

Last Name: Martin

Email Address: [jmartin@ucsusa.org](mailto:jmartin@ucsusa.org)

Affiliation: Union of Concerned Scientists

Subject: California needs a petroleum phaseout plan

Comment:

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/7-carbejac090122-AXQAZVYkBAGeYQZp.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/7-carbejac090122-AXQAZVYkBAGeYQZp.pdf)

Original File Name: UCS comment for Sept 1 2022 EJAC meeting.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-09-01 13:56:41

No Duplicates.

## Comment 6 for Carb/Ejac Joint Meeting (carbejac090122). (At Hearing)

First Name: Yanely

Last Name: Martinez

Email Address: yanely@pestidereform.org

Affiliation:

Subject: Scoping Plan 9/1/22

Comment:

<p class="MsoNormal">Good afternoon members of the board,</p>

<p class="MsoNormal">&nbsp;</p>

<p class="MsoNormal">My name is Yanely Martinez. I am a resident of the city of Greenfield, the beautiful "Heart of The Valley." A place that is beautiful but constantly targeted by pesticides. As a mother of four and council member my family and community are constant targets. A community of those who have been underserved and with a population of over 93% Latinos.</p>

<p class="MsoNormal">&nbsp;</p>

<p class="MsoNormal">I would like to ask the following to be including:</p>

<p class="MsoNormal">&nbsp;</p>

<p class="MsoNormal">1. Keep all the language in the current Scoping Plan draft that supports safer,more sustainable pest management and support for organic farming.</p>

<p class="MsoNormal">&nbsp;</p>

<p class="MsoNormal">2. I ask the CARB Board to increase the organic agriculture target to 30% of all agricultural acreage being organically-framed by 2030. The Scoping Plan's&nbsp;<current target of 20% of all agricultural lands organically-farmed by 2045 is insufficient and does not even keep up with current market trends as more and more consumers purchase organic produce.</p>

<p class="MsoNormal">&nbsp;</p>

<p class="MsoNormal">3. I ask that the CARB Board instruct staff to remove all language from the Scoping Plan that identifies any form of pesticide use (including herbicide use) as a climate-smart or climate-friendly management strategy. The Scoping Plan currently identifies herbicide use on grasslands, scrublands and forests as an acceptable "climate-smart strategy " to eliminate invasive plant species, identifying any kind of pesticide use as a "climate-smart strategy" is unacceptable and there are other, non-toxic ways of dealing with invasive species.</p>

<p class="MsoNormal">&nbsp;</p>

<p class="MsoNormal">4. I &nbsp;<ask the CARB Board to include a measurable target of reducing synthetic pesticide use by 50% by 2030 and highly hazardous pesticide use by 90% by 2050. We have heard pretty consistently that a pesticide reduction goal is not going to be put in the Scoping Plan since CalEPA has spoken out against it so many times, but it doesn't &nbsp;<mean we can't make it clear how much public support there is for pesticide reduction targets.&nbsp;</p>

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-09-01 17:08:00

No Duplicates.



## Comment 7 for Carb/Ejac Joint Meeting (carbejac090122). (At Hearing)

First Name: Mabel

Last Name: Tsang

Email Address: mabel@caleja.org

Affiliation: CA Environmental Justice Alliance (CEJA)

Subject: Public Comment for 9/1

Comment:

<p dir="ltr" style="line-height: 1.7999999999999998; margin-top: 0pt; margin-bottom: 0pt;"><span style="font-size: 13.999999999999998pt; font-family: Arial; color: #000000; background-color: transparent; font-weight: 400; font-style: normal; font-variant: normal; text-decoration: none; vertical-align: baseline; white-space: pre-wrap;">Good evening, I'm Mabel Tsang, interim co-director and political director speaking on behalf of the California Environmental Justice Alliance with a membership of 10 organizations and representing 30,000 frontline residents. I want to thank CARB Members for your commitments today to California's clean air and healthy communities.&nbsp;</span><strong id="docs-internal-guid-3fd76c3d-7fff-19ed-0e88-29339c435461" style="font-weight: normal;"></strong></p>  
<p dir="ltr" style="line-height: 1.7999999999999998; margin-top: 0pt; margin-bottom: 0pt;">&nbsp;</p>  
<p dir="ltr" style="line-height: 1.7999999999999998; margin-top: 0pt; margin-bottom: 0pt;"><span style="font-size: 13.999999999999998pt; font-family: Arial; color: #000000; background-color: transparent; font-weight: 400; font-style: normal; font-variant: normal; text-decoration: none; vertical-align: baseline; white-space: pre-wrap;">We strongly support the chair's suggestion for a cross agency working group to study a fossil fuel phaseout - thank you to Boardmember Balmes, de la Torre, Kracov & Hurt for your support for just transition planning.&nbsp;</span></p>  
<p><strong style="font-weight: normal;">&nbsp;</strong></p>  
<p dir="ltr" style="line-height: 1.7999999999999998; margin-top: 0pt; margin-bottom: 0pt;"><span style="font-size: 13.999999999999998pt; font-family: Arial; color: #000000; background-color: transparent; font-weight: 400; font-style: normal; font-variant: normal; text-decoration: none; vertical-align: baseline; white-space: pre-wrap;">I'd like to urge the Board that this taskforce, and draft plan, should prioritize cutting the use of CCUS on fossil fuel infrastructure to avoid keeping our refineries open purely for exports and protecting the health of frontline residents.</span></p>  
<p><strong style="font-weight: normal;">&nbsp;</strong></p>  
<p dir="ltr" style="line-height: 1.7999999999999998; margin-top: 0pt; margin-bottom: 0pt;"><span style="font-size: 13.999999999999998pt; font-family: Arial; color: #000000; background-color: transparent; font-weight: 400; font-style: normal; font-variant: normal; text-decoration: none; vertical-align: baseline; white-space: pre-wrap;">As EJAC representatives pointed out today, this draft plan is a paradox: on the one hand, CARB staff have assured us that decreasing California

oil consumption will cause a massive decline in refinery production by 2045.&nbsp;&nbsp;&nbsp;</span></p>

<p><strong style="font-weight: normal;">&nbsp;&nbsp;&nbsp;</strong></p>

<p dir="ltr" style="line-height: 1.799999999999998; margin-top: 0pt; margin-bottom: 0pt;"><span style="font-size: 13.99999999999998pt; font-family: Arial; color: #000000; background-color: transparent; font-weight: 400; font-style: normal; font-variant: normal; text-decoration: none; vertical-align: baseline; white-space: pre-wrap;">On the other hand, this draft&rsquo;s targets will create billions of dollars of carbon capture & sequestration investment that could extend the life of refineries and other polluting infrastructure with the chance that exported petroleum & diesel will exponentially grow to offset any declines. It doesn&rsquo;t add up.</span></p>

<p><strong style="font-weight: normal;">&nbsp;&nbsp;&nbsp;</strong></p>

<p dir="ltr" style="line-height: 1.799999999999998; margin-top: 0pt; margin-bottom: 0pt;"><span style="font-size: 13.99999999999998pt; font-family: Arial; color: #000000; background-color: transparent; font-weight: 400; font-style: normal; font-variant: normal; text-decoration: none; vertical-align: baseline; white-space: pre-wrap;">If we are truly committed to a just transition, we can&rsquo;t continue to refine exports indefinitely.</span></p>

<p><strong style="font-weight: normal;">&nbsp;&nbsp;&nbsp;</strong></p>

<p dir="ltr" style="line-height: 1.799999999999998; margin-top: 0pt; margin-bottom: 0pt;"><span style="font-size: 13.99999999999998pt; font-family: Arial; color: #000000; background-color: transparent; font-weight: 400; font-style: normal; font-variant: normal; text-decoration: none; vertical-align: baseline; white-space: pre-wrap;">Working class Californians deserve a commitment of a managed, and coordinated transition &ndash; to have our state agency commit to the planning that will, and lead, to a California beyond oil and gas.</span></p>

<p><strong style="font-weight: normal;">&nbsp;&nbsp;&nbsp;</strong></p>

<p dir="ltr" style="line-height: 1.799999999999998; margin-top: 0pt; margin-bottom: 0pt;"><span style="font-size: 13.99999999999998pt; font-family: Arial; color: #000000; background-color: transparent; font-weight: 400; font-style: normal; font-variant: normal; text-decoration: none; vertical-align: baseline; white-space: pre-wrap;">We know what happens when the market decides alone - it displaces and under-employs workers, creates gaps in the tax-base for schools and communities, and abandons infrastructure with no accountability from polluters to do the clean-up work. We saw it at the Martinez refinery, we&rsquo;ve seen it at Exide.&nbsp;&nbsp;&nbsp;</span></p>

<p dir="ltr" style="line-height: 1.799999999999998; margin-top: 0pt; margin-bottom: 0pt;"><span style="font-size: 13.99999999999998pt; font-family: Arial; color: #000000; background-color: transparent; font-weight: 400; font-style: normal; font-variant: normal; text-decoration: none; vertical-align: baseline; white-space: pre-wrap;">&nbsp;&nbsp;&nbsp;</span></p>

<p dir="ltr" style="line-height: 1.799999999999998; margin-top: 0pt; margin-bottom: 0pt;"><span style="font-size: 13.99999999999998pt; font-family: Arial; color: #000000; background-color: transparent; font-weight: 400; font-style: normal; font-variant: normal; text-decoration: none; vertical-align: baseline; white-space: pre-wrap;">Last night, the Legislature passed the responsibility to this Board for protecting residents from the impacts of carbon capture, storage and sequestration.&nbsp;&nbsp;&nbsp;</span></p>

We need a guarantee from this board that there will be no CCUS placed on fossil fuel infrastructure, and for this board to provide the strongest possible public health protections to minimize pollution for frontline communities from this dangerous technology invading our state.

I add my public comment to the thousands of Californians across the state urging that this Board, together with the Governor, enact a plan to protect our health and safeguard our climate future.

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-09-01 17:12:33

No Duplicates.

## Comment 8 for Carb/Ejac Joint Meeting (carbejac090122). (At Hearing)

First Name: Lizbeth

Last Name: Gonzalezruiz

Email Address: lizbeth.gonzalezruiz@sierraclub.org

Affiliation: Sierra Club

Subject: CARB Scoping Plan 2022

Comment:

<p><strong id="docs-internal-guid-61934a3c-7fff-6379-d6d7-659bde5f5e0c" style="font-weight: normal;">&nbsp;</strong></p>  
<p dir="ltr" style="line-height: 1.38; margin-top: 0pt; margin-bottom: 0pt;"><span style="font-size: 11pt; font-family: Arial; color: #000000; background-color: transparent; font-weight: 400; font-style: normal; font-variant: normal; text-decoration: none; vertical-align: baseline; white-space: pre-wrap;">Good Afternoon, Lizbeth here with the Sierra Club. I am a mother and resident of Altadena CA . I am here today to emphasize how burning gas harms the lungs and health of my community.</span></p>  
<p dir="ltr" style="line-height: 1.38; margin-top: 0pt; margin-bottom: 0pt;"><span style="font-size: 11pt; font-family: Arial; color: #000000; background-color: transparent; font-weight: 400; font-style: normal; font-variant: normal; text-decoration: none; vertical-align: baseline; white-space: pre-wrap;">We urgently need CARB to create the road to zero emissions and gas plant retirements for the health of both our people and our planet. Our children deserve better, please do better.&nbsp;</span></p>  
<p><strong style="font-weight: normal;">&nbsp;</strong></p>  
<p dir="ltr" style="line-height: 1.38; margin-top: 0pt; margin-bottom: 0pt;"><span style="font-size: 11pt; font-family: Arial; color: #000000; background-color: transparent; font-weight: 400; font-style: normal; font-variant: normal; text-decoration: none; vertical-align: baseline; white-space: pre-wrap;">I am asking the board to create a Scoping Plan that can help actually  
</span><span style="font-size: 11pt; font-family: Arial; color: #000000; background-color: transparent; font-weight: 400; font-style: italic; font-variant: normal; text-decoration: none; vertical-align: baseline; white-space: pre-wrap;">retire</span><span style="font-size: 11pt; font-family: Arial; color: #000000; background-color: transparent; font-weight: 400; font-style: normal; font-variant: normal; text-decoration: none; vertical-align: baseline; white-space: pre-wrap;"> gas plants in frontline communities. The only way to do this is to set a low greenhouse gas emissions limit for the electricity sector.  
</span><span style="font-size: 11pt; font-family: Arial; color: #000000; background-color: transparent; font-weight: bold; font-style: normal; font-variant: normal; text-decoration: none; vertical-align: baseline; white-space: pre-wrap;">We need a 30 million metric ton emissions limit by 2030.</span><span style="font-size: 11pt; font-family: Arial; color: #000000; background-color: transparent; font-weight: 400; font-style: normal; font-variant: normal; text-decoration: none; vertical-align: baseline; white-space: pre-wrap;"> This will make sure that California starts to build the clean energy needed to

replace gas plants in working class communities of  
color.&nbsp;</span></p>  
<p>&nbsp;</p>  
<p dir="ltr" style="line-height: 1.38; margin-top: 0pt;  
margin-bottom: 0pt;"><span style="font-size: 11pt; font-family:  
Arial; color: #000000; background-color: transparent; font-weight:  
400; font-style: normal; font-variant: normal; text-decoration:  
none; vertical-align: baseline; white-space: pre-wrap;">I urge you  
to Please make the health of our communities your top priority by  
helping move California toward a clean and just energy future that  
replaces gas plants with reliable, renewable energy.</span></p>

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-09-01 17:29:45

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 9 for Carb/Ejac Joint Meeting (carbejac090122). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Ted

Last Name: Franklin

Email Address: ted@tedfranklin.net

Affiliation:

Subject: Two minutes about the PERI Report

Comment:

In lieu of speaking at the meeting, I am sharing what I would have said:

I'm speaking today as a labor and climate activist and an advocate for the California Climate Jobs Plan.

I was very encouraged today to hear members of the EJAC specifically point the Board in the direction of the Political Economy Research Institute Report, referred to by some of us as the California Climate Jobs Plan.

I want to underscore how valuable the Climate Jobs Plan can be as your work goes forward.

If there are going to be real reductions in California's fossil fuel industry, we are talking about major social and economic change.

We need a vision and a plan for workers and working class communities.

The CARB scoping plan does not address this.

The only union mentioned in the draft scoping plan is the European Union.

We can help you with that.

In June, 138 rank-and-file trade unionists sent the Board the 178-page PERI report and a comment letter pleading for CARB to incorporate the Plan into its final report.

The Climate Jobs Plan explains how California can manage a just and equitable transition away from fossil fuels, produce one million new jobs per year, and take care of all the workers and working class communities that are currently supported by wages and revenues from the fossil fuel industry.

The Peri Report has been endorsed by over two dozen unions, including unions representing refinery workers. It was drafted by a team led by the distinguished economist Robert Pollin at the University of Massachusetts.

You can find the full PERI report attached to the earlier comment I submitted for this meeting.

Thank you.

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-09-01 17:33:56

No Duplicates.