

**Comment 1 for San Joaquin Valley Supplement to the 2016 State Strategy for the SIP (sjvsipsupplement) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Kevin

Last Name: Maggay

Email Address: kmaggay@semprautilities.com

Affiliation: SoCalGas

Subject: SoCalGas Comments to the SJV SIP Supplement

Comment:

Attached is SoCalGas' comment letter on the San Joaquin Valley State Implementation Plan Supplement.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/1-sjvsipsupplement-AnEGY1M1Aw8AdQJo.pdf'

Original File Name: SCG SJV SIP Supplement Comments 9-27-18.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-09-27 15:38:41

No Duplicates.

**Comment 2 for San Joaquin Valley Supplement to the 2016 State Strategy for the SIP (sjvsipsupplement) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: James E.

Last Name: Enstrom

Email Address: jenstrom@ucla.edu

Affiliation: UCLA and Scientific Integrity Institute

Subject: Evidence Invalidating EPA PM2.5 NAAQS and SJV PM2.5 Regulations

Comment:

Please consider my attached 73-page September 14, 2018 SJVAPCD comment regarding the SJVAPCD 2018 Plan for PM2.5 when assessing the San Joaquin Valley Supplement to the 2016 State Strategy for the State Implementation Plan. My comment contains strong evidence that invalidates the 1997 and 2012 EPA PM2.5 NAAQS, as well as proposed new PM2.5 regulations. There should be no additional PM2.5 regulations in the San Joaquin Valley based on my evidence, which I have presented to EPA.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/2-sjvsipsupplement-VTBROQR2UnUCdlU6.pdf'

Original File Name: Enstrom Comment re SJVAPCD 2018 Plan for PM2.5 091418.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-09-30 17:09:19

No Duplicates.

**Comment 3 for San Joaquin Valley Supplement to the 2016 State Strategy for the SIP (sjvsipsupplement) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: James E.

Last Name: Enstrom

Email Address: jenstrom@ucla.edu

Affiliation: UCLA and Scientific Integrity Institute

Subject: Evidence re SJV PM2.5 Plan Showing NO PM2.5 Deaths in CA and US

Comment:

Please read my attachment "Recent PM2.5 Activities Documenting NO Relationship Between PM2.5 and Total Mortality in US." I provide weblinks to overwhelming evidence of NO relationship between PM2.5 and total mortality in California and the US. This evidence challenges the scientific and economic validity of the EPA PM2.5 NAAQS and challenges the validity of the SJVAPCD Draft 2018 PM2.5 Plan and the SJV Supplement to the 2016 State SIP.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/3-sjvsipsupplement-AXFWPVVmAH1RYgBf.pdf'

Original File Name: PM2.5 Working Group Enstrom Evidence NO PM2.5 Deaths 100118.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-04 11:28:04

No Duplicates.

**Comment 4 for San Joaquin Valley Supplement to the 2016 State Strategy for the SIP (sjvsipsupplement) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: James E.

Last Name: Enstrom

Email Address: jenstrom@ucla.edu

Affiliation: UCLA and Scientific Integrity Institute

Subject: Criticism of PM2.5 Health Effects in 2016 AQMP re 2018 SJV PM2.5 Plan

Comment:

Please read my attached January 30, 2017 criticism of the SCAQMD 2016 AQMP Appendix I Health Effects. I identified six major flaws in the staff assessment of the PM2.5 health effects in the South Coast Air Basin. These same flaws exist in the SJVAPCD Draft 2018 PM2.5 Plan and the SJV Supplement to the 2016 State SIP. These flaws exaggerate the current health effects of PM2.5 in the San Joaquin Valley and they challenge the scientific and economic validity of the PM2.5 Plan and the SJV Supplement. All PM2.5 regulations proposed in the PM2.5 Plan and the SJV Supplement must be reconsidered after fully addressing the flaws that I have identified.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/4-sjvsipsupplement-AGUFbQFzU3QBdVM8.pdf'

Original File Name: Enstrom Criticism of Ghosh re SCAQMD 2016 AQMP 013017.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-04 13:21:29

No Duplicates.

**Comment 5 for San Joaquin Valley Supplement to the 2016 State Strategy for the SIP (sjvsipsupplement) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Genevieve

Last Name: Gale

Email Address: genevieve@calcleanair.org

Affiliation: Central Valley Air Quality Coalition

Subject: CVAQ Comments

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/5-sjvsipsupplement-AWJSII09VXcAWQJh.pdf'

Original File Name: CVAQ Comments - SJV Mobile Source Supplement .pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-19 13:47:15

No Duplicates.

**Comment 6 for San Joaquin Valley Supplement to the 2016 State Strategy for the SIP (sjvsipsupplement) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Mark

Last Name: Rose

Email Address: MROSE@NPCA.ORG

Affiliation: National Parks Conservation Association

Subject: NPCA comments Re: San Joaquin Valley Supplement to the 2016 State Strategy for the State I

Comment:

See attached written comments submitted on behalf of National Parks Conservation Association.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/6-sjvsipsupplement-UT8BdwldAzEAWQU3.docx'

Original File Name: NPCA\_2018 Draft PM2.5 Plan CARB Comments.docx

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-22 15:45:52

No Duplicates.

**Comment 7 for San Joaquin Valley Supplement to the 2016 State Strategy for the SIP (sjvsipsupplement) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Noelle

Last Name: Cremers

Email Address: ncremers@cfbf.com

Affiliation: California Farm Bureau Federation

Subject: San Joaquin Valley Supplement to the 2016 State Strategy for the State Implementation Plan

Comment:

Please see attached comment.

Thanks ,  
Noelle Cremers

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/7-sjvsipsupplement-BXZTPwB3WFQDdQRp.pdf'

Original File Name: SJV PM 25 SIP State Strategy 10-22-18.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-22 16:43:40

No Duplicates.

**Comment 8 for San Joaquin Valley Supplement to the 2016 State Strategy for the SIP (sjvsipsupplement) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Ryan

Last Name: Kenny

Email Address: ryan.kenny@cleanenergyfuels.com

Affiliation: Clean Energy

Subject: Comments re: SJV SIP Supplement

Comment:

Please find attached a comment letter from Clean Energy concerning the San Joaquin Valley SIP Supplement. Thank you.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/8-sjvsipsupplement-B2QBa10yADZSCwVp.pdf'

Original File Name: CLNE Letter SJV Supplement to 2016 SIP.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-22 16:50:53

No Duplicates.



**Comment 1 for San Joaquin Valley Supplement to the 2016 State Strategy for the SIP (sjvsipsupplement). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Genevieve

Last Name: Gale

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Central Valley Air Quality Coalition

Subject: Mobile Source Plan for PM2.5 Attainment in the San Joaquin Valley

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/9-sjvsipsupplement-UzRdOgFsVmBXf1Qk.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/9-sjvsipsupplement-UzRdOgFsVmBXf1Qk.pdf)

Original File Name: Gale.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-10-26 13:32:08

No Duplicates.