

## **Comment 1 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Bill

Last Name: Mayben

Email Address: bmayben@comcast.net

Affiliation: Wm Mayben and Associates

Subject: Tropical Forest Standard tfs 2019

Comment:

Honorable Board Members;

This is a superior idea. It has been interesting to read responses to my advocacy of planting and replanting California forests following decimation by drought, disease, climate change, and fire. Many people are apparently looking for that single transformative solution that preserves the natural world; and by extension their lifestyles. So they opine that planting trees cannot change our world climate. Naturally, this is true, and never proposed in the first place. It is an interesting comment, however.

Proposals such as tfs2019 should consider inclusion of statements indicating that it is part of a broad set of interrelated actions ,laws and regulations, which acting together will provide intervention toward significant mitigation and adaptation.

Please also consider a parallel endorsement providing functional and concrete support for reforestation broadly. Firefighting is not enough. We cannot necessarily replant what has been lost, for the very reasons outlined in tfs2019. We have to follow the horticultural and fire science on this; however we will desperately, universally need the carbon sequestration, the shading, the habitats, and the oxygen in the coming decades.

Thanks!

Bill Mayben

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-07-30 13:44:13

No Duplicates.

**Comment 2 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Gary

Last Name: Hughes

Email Address: garyhughes.bfw@gmail.com

Affiliation: Biofuelwatch

Subject: California Tropical Forest Standard and climate impacts from aviation

Comment:

This letter from more than 20 organizations warning of the dangers to the worlds forests and the global climate from relying on offsets to support "carbon neutral emissions growth" for the global aviation sector CORSIA scheme was sent to Gov Newsom and ARB Chair Nichols in June, and was presented to Chair Nichols and ARB directors during open public comment at the June ARB public meeting. It is submitted here for inclusion in the public record on this matter.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/2-tfs2019-B2FSPVU6BDYFb1UK.pdf'

Original File Name: final\_GovNewsom\_ARBChairNichols\_aviationCTFS\_sign-onletter.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-05 14:22:05

No Duplicates.

### **Comment 3 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Deseret

Last Name: Weeks

Email Address: dweeks@ucmerced.edu

Affiliation: University of California, Merced

Subject: Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Dear California Air Resources Board,

I am deeply concerned about your possible endorsement of the Tropical Forest Standard (TFS). I am an environmental geographer who specializes in climate change and other socio-environmental problems we face as a society. As a current Ph.D. student, my research surrounds climate change mitigation and adaptation in California with an emphasis on environmental laws and programs in addition to important socio-economic theories. What I have found through my research is that over time economic demands weaken laws that are made to increase socio-environmental resilience. The TFS will do just that by allowing GHG emissions to exceed reduction goals via offset credits. California has much to be proud of in terms of creating laws, programs, and tools to mitigate and adapt to climate change. The TFS will effectively un-do so much important progress while catering to corporations. In addition to those basic concerns, a major concern includes the leakage provisions and required accounting as it will be extremely difficult to assure accounting accuracy as well as the implications of illegal activities such as logging and mining. Another concern includes the social and environmental safeguards. We have to recognize that California will not be in complete control of grievance processes nor will California be able to assure prior and informed consent. I urge the California Air Resources Board to at least reconsider jumping into the TFS program and instead strengthen the cap on GHGs in California. There have already been adjustments, such as SB 97, to GHG emissions standards following AB 32 that allow for exemptions and the current cap and trade program already allows for GHG emissions to continue above the rate that they should be to truly see reductions in atmospheric carbon dioxide levels.

Sincerely,

-Deseret Weeks

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-21 12:10:01

No Duplicates.



**Comment 4 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Kristin

Last Name: Block

Email Address: kmbjunkmail@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Please endorse the California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please endorse the California Tropical Forest Standard. This has the potential to help protect the Amazon Rainforest by making the rainforests more valuable.

Thank you.

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-22 17:42:46

No Duplicates.

**Comment 5 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Nikhil

Last Name: Deshmukh

Email Address: thenikhil@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Please endorse CTFS

Comment:

To whom it may concern

I urge you to endorse the CTFS to protect our few remaining tropical forests. These dynamic ecosystems are vital to Californians.

Thank you for your time and consideration

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-22 18:00:09

No Duplicates.

**Comment 6 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Gustavo de L.T.

Last Name: Oliveira

Email Address: gustavo.oliveira@uci.edu

Affiliation: University of California Irvine

Subject: Comments for Consideration of Endorsement of an Updated CA Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/6-tfs2019-B2hTOQdvUXRSMQdu.pdf'

Original File Name: Oliveira - letter for ARB August 2019.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-26 09:20:52

No Duplicates.

**Comment 7 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Michael

Last Name: Radomir

Email Address: mradomir@coderedd.org

Affiliation: Code Redd and Stand for Trees

Subject: Letter of endorsement for the California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/7-tfs2019-VSdTNFE0BTkLYFU8.pdf'

Original File Name: Radomir.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-26 12:16:59

No Duplicates.



**Comment 8 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Lucien

Last Name: Kubo

Email Address: Lucienk@aol.com

Affiliation: Santa Cruz Indivisible

Subject: Endorsement of an updated California Tropical Forest standard

Comment:

Please endorse the updated California Tropical First standard. Our environment is our most precious resource. Thank you

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 07:23:52

No Duplicates.

**Comment 9 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Pamela

Last Name: Lee

Email Address: ptleel4@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Comments on California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/9-tfs2019-AnJQOIQwBTNReQd3.pdf'

Original File Name: PLee.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 08:11:09

No Duplicates.

**Comment 10 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Miriam

Last Name: Baum

Email Address: miriambaum@aol.com

Affiliation:

Subject: no carbon offsets

Comment:

GET WITH THE PROGRAM YOU GREEDY SCUM SUCKERS!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 08:34:13

No Duplicates.

**Comment 11 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Jon

Last Name: Anderholm

Email Address: xunbio@hotmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: off sets only seem to benefit the polluters

Comment:

offsets cannot stop the terrible loss of forest....  
and benefit the big polluters...

strong regulation , investment in the environment... needed

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 08:41:29

No Duplicates.

**Comment 12 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Dan  
Last Name: Silver  
Email Address: dsilverla@me.com  
Affiliation:

Subject: Tropical forest offsets  
Comment:

I am very skeptical about the "additionally" of these offsets.

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 08:47:14

No Duplicates.

**Comment 13 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Victor

Last Name: Bobier

Email Address: zoom3141@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: No offsets

Comment:

No offsets in the Amazon or anywhere in South America! 20% of your oxygen comes from there.

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 08:51:12

No Duplicates.

**Comment 14 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: kelly

Last Name: doyle

Email Address: Kellydcmt@comcast.net

Affiliation:

Subject: No Carbon Offsets

Comment:

No carbon offsets.

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 08:52:41

No Duplicates.

**Comment 15 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Sol  
Last Name: Fdez  
Email Address: wampis@gmail.com  
Affiliation: Ms.

Subject: Pollution  
Comment:

No local pollution! We need to reduce it!

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 08:54:38

No Duplicates.



## **Comment 16 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: jon  
Last Name: bumstead  
Email Address: jasperp131@aol.com  
Affiliation: Mr

Subject: carbon offset  
Comment:

To whom it matters -

The whole concept of trading pollution is based on keeping business - mostly big business - moving smoothly, and without interruption. I get it.

Much money has been given to politicians for a long time to make sure that this sort of con game is allowed to continue. It was a bad idea from the get-go, and it's a bad idea to extend it.

Business needs to take care of its own shit like the rest of us. I ask nobody else to wipe my ass. It's not way beyond time to require the same sort of self-care for polluters. They've been given a free ride, and it's time to end it.

J.P.Bumstead

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 09:06:18

No Duplicates.

**Comment 17 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Malcolm

Last Name: Groome

Email Address: otorongo@earthlink.net

Affiliation:

Subject: Proposed Carbon Offsets

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/17-tfs2019-AWZTJ1I8V2sEbwFk.pdf'

Original File Name: Groome.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 09:26:18

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 18 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Wayne

Last Name: Gibb

Email Address: wdgibb@hotmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: NO on tropical carbon offsets

Comment:

Please do not allow polluting corporations to offset their climate-changing emissions by purchasing tropical offsets in the global south.

This has always been a shell game, and always will be.

Instead, such corporations should be taxed at a high rate for the climate-changing carbon / methane emissions for which they are responsible.

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 09:26:38

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 19 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Carlos Alberto Crasb  
Last Name: Ojeda  
Email Address: saguzmanb@gmail.com  
Affiliation: ACOFOP

Subject: Comment Letter on CA Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

Dear CARB members.  
As the last year ACOFOP keeps on supporting the endorsement of the California Tropical Forestry Standard. We are pleased to congratulate the California Air Resources Board on the development of a Tropical Forest Standard as part of the leadership of the State of California in sustainable sourcing mechanisms, commitments of deforestation "zero net", move towards nationally determined contributions and additional measures to mitigate carbon emissions. This standard is an effort that is already globally recognized.

Please see a letter of support in the attachment.

Best Regards,  
The association of forest communities of Peten Guatemala - ACOFOP  
Members of AMPB into the Governors' Climate and Forest Force Global  
Committee for Indigenous Peoples and Local Communities

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/19-tfs2019-VjECcVMoVGpQNwNt.pdf'

Original File Name: Guzman.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 09:29:43

No Duplicates.

**Comment 20 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Brian

Last Name: Gottejman

Email Address: blgottejman@aol.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Updated California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

PUT LIFE FIRST

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 10:13:11

No Duplicates.

**Comment 21 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Rupert  
Last Name: Edwards  
Email Address: redwards@forest-trends.org  
Affiliation: Forest Trends

Subject: Endorsement of Updated California Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

Dear CARB,

Please find an attached file. The file is a letter from Michael Jenkins, President and CEO of Forest Trends, endorsing the updated TFS.

Kind regards

Rupert Edwards

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/21-tfs2019-WjZdPgN2WH9XNFMh.pdf'

Original File Name: Letter to CARB Re draft 27.08.19.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 10:31:56

No Duplicates.

**Comment 22 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Steven

Last Name: Sugarman

Email Address: wrathchild62@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Real Climate Solutions

Comment:

Carbon offsets, flawed as they are, are not the solution we need for climate change. We need to keep ALL fossil fuels in the ground.

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 10:36:26

No Duplicates.

**Comment 23 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: George

Last Name: LudwiG

Email Address: notification+kjdp\_v1puv\_\_@facebookmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: TROPICAL FOREST

Comment:

DO WHAT IS OBVIOUSLY RIGHT.

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 10:53:41

No Duplicates.



## **Comment 24 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: joanne

Last Name: Katzen

Email Address: jokat9@hotmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Carbon offsets

Comment:

Human beings are facing the most extreme crisis of this civilization. The effects of climate change will not be mitigated, if at all, for decades to come. We must do all we can to end the use of fossil fuels and all carbon-producing practices.

I am writing to you as a California resident. Please do not endorse the California Tropical Forest Standard. Tropical forest offsets must not be a part of California's Carbon Trading System, or adopted by the International Commercial Aviation Organization or other out of state entities.

These carbon offsets allow polluters to keep on polluting, instead of reducing their carbon footprint. They also would allow airline emissions to keep on growing.

California should not be encouraging tropical forest carbon offsets through the endorsement of the TFS.

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 11:16:08

No Duplicates.

**Comment 25 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Susanne

Last Name: Bader

Email Address: susannes\_bader@hotmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Environmental

Comment:

We are in the midst of the sixth extinction and need to do everything we can to obviate this. It only takes political will

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 11:32:55

No Duplicates.

**Comment 26 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Charlene

Last Name: Henley

Email Address: judgemoo@aol.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Chemicals

Comment:

Our elected people must regulate the chemicals in household products and our drinking water.

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 11:41:27

No Duplicates.

**Comment 27 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Hollis

Last Name: Stewart

Email Address: hollisstewart90042@gmail.com

Affiliation: North Pine Neighborhood Alliance

Subject: Stop destroying the environment

Comment:

Letting corporations buy there way out of stopping pollution is not an answer, it is a large part of the problem. IT IS TIME, AS THE WILD FIRES IN THE ARCTIC AND IN THE AMAZON RAIN FOREST MAKE ABUNDANTLY CLEAR, POLLUTING HAS TO STOP IMMEDIATELY AND ALLOWING BUY ROUNDS DOESN'T DO THAT, IT LETS POLLUTERS EVADE THEIR RESPONSIBILITY. And they don't even pay the costs because it is passed on to consumers who pay the higher prices while the polluters increase their profits.

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 11:48:10

No Duplicates.

**Comment 28 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Philip

Last Name: McManus

Email Address: pmcmanus@baymoon.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Comment on the Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/28-tfs2019-AG1UMQZqAzEAaAZz.pdf'

Original File Name: McManus.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 12:02:55

No Duplicates.

**Comment 29 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: RJ

Last Name: Cooper

Email Address: [rj@rjcooper.com](mailto:rj@rjcooper.com)

Affiliation:

Subject: Renewable energy, not fossil fuels

Comment:

Carbon offsets are NOT the answer. Fully exploring renewable energy is the ONLY answer!

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 12:22:19

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 30 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Andrew

Last Name: Dudley

Email Address: andrew@earthpbc.com

Affiliation: Earth PBC

Subject: California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

For California to meaningfully address global climate change, it is critical for the state to support the protection of tropical forests. As a California resident, I support California using the state's global influence to protect tropical forests through endorsement of the Tropical Forest Standard.

Cutting and burning tropical forests like the Amazon threatens their unique animals, plants and millions of people who depend on them to survive. Deforestation also contributes more greenhouse gas emissions than all the cars, trucks, and ships in the world every single year - stopping it is a critical step to avoiding dangerous global warming and meeting the goals of the Paris climate agreement.

California's proposed Standard for rainforest credits would create incentives to protect tropical forests -- whole forest landscapes, across entire states or nations. It would also require that programs producing rainforest credits consult and collaborate with indigenous and other traditional communities who use and safeguard forests. And that their communities are partners who benefit from these programs. The money generated from the sale of the credits directly benefits the programs that are protecting forests, reducing emissions and creating sustainable indigenous livelihoods that are in harmony with and strengthen their cultural traditions.

The world must address the loss of tropical forests to stop climate change. Now is the time for California to directly promote the reduction of greenhouse gas emissions from the cutting and burning of tropical forests. We can't save the climate without tropical forests. The California Air Resources Board should endorse the California Tropical Forest Standard.

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 13:16:08

No Duplicates.





**Comment 31 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Rayline

Last Name: Dean

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: Reference to Docket TFS2019

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/32-tfs2019-VTFQM1Q0VmsKIIMj.pdf'

Original File Name: Dean.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 14:01:32

No Duplicates.

**Comment 32 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: barbara

Last Name: poland

Email Address: catsdogsnroses@hotmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: carbon offsets

Comment:

Carbon offsets are a marketing scheme to keep corporations in full operation doing their dirty work in destruction of the environment and displacement of indigenous peoples while offsets are a feel good deception that ameliorate nothing.

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 14:03:47

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 33 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Jan

Last Name: Buckwald

Email Address: jbuckwald@mac.com

Affiliation:

Subject: carbon offsets

Comment:

Clerk of the Board,

I'm joining many others in asking you to not endorse the California Tropical Forest Standard, to ensure that these tropical forests are never accepted into California's carbon trading system, or adopted by out-of-state entities like the ICAO.

We need companies, corporations, people to REDUCE the carbon footprints, not continue to pollute just because they can afford the inconvenience of paying a fee that will do nothing to help the serious pollution crisis.

Thank you,

Jan Buckwald

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 14:10:18

No Duplicates.

**Comment 34 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Sue

Last Name: Habegger

Email Address: suehabegger34@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Carbon Offsets

Comment:

No carbon offsets !

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 14:20:13

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 35 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Patricia

Last Name: Rain

Email Address: rain@vanillaqueen.com

Affiliation: The Vanilla Company

Subject: No Carbon Offset Options

Comment:

To All This May Concern:

We are up against the wall, so to speak, when it comes to the changing climate. I work with tropical farmers and have been extremely concerned for years about the impact of the changing climate as it affects everyone worldwide in different ways.

While the concept of carbon offset credits sounds good on paper, in actuality, it provides many large corporations and the airlines an easy loophole where they can continue to pollute and "write it off." The reality is that the Tropical Forest Standard is incredibly corrupt. No surprise; it has ever been thus. I have seen the devastation done to the Indonesian rain forest and in Central and South American forests. We are losing plant, animal and insect species at an unprecedented rate -- by some counts, every four-to-eight minutes! Every month we are recording higher global temperatures on every continent. Africa and South America are drying up and will rapidly lose crops that they depend on for survival as they sell their coffee, chocolate, vanilla, bananas and much more to Europe and the USA. If these people lose their crops what will they do and where will they go??

This is the century of desperation for food, water, and making a living. The ONLY way we are going to lower the carbon footprint is by leaving it in the ground. With the tundra in Alaska without permafrost, more carbon is going into the atmosphere every day.

This isn't a wake-up call -- it's huge shout-out that if humans are going to survive to the end of this century, we'd damn well better come up with workable solutions!! We need to act quickly-but-wisely. Stop cutting the big polluters a lot of slack. We need smart ways to save our planet!!

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 14:40:06

No Duplicates.

**Comment 36 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Craig

Last Name: Guenther

Email Address: cag1951@msn.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Tropical Forest Carbon offsets

Comment:

Greetings:

Please do not accept the current TFC offset plan.

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 14:56:25

No Duplicates.

**Comment 37 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Raquel

Last Name: Machaqueiro

Email Address: rrmachaqueiro@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Why the CARB should not use any kind of forest offsets

Comment:

Please, see attached document with comprehensive comments on why CARB should not use forest offsets to reduce California's emissions.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/38-tfs2019-AWxQN1AyV2wLbFUk.pdf'

Original File Name: Machaqueiro\_Comment to CARB.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 15:24:55

No Duplicates.

**Comment 38 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Mike

Last Name: Korchinsky

Email Address: mike@wildlifeworks.com

Affiliation: Wildlife Works

Subject: Tropical Forest Standard Support

Comment:

To whom it may concern...please find attached our letter in strong support of approval of the Tropical Forest Standard.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/39-tfs2019-BWkBY1AIBCMKaQFz.pdf'

Original File Name: Letter on TFS to California ARB 2019 FINAL.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 15:38:05

No Duplicates.



**Comment 39 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Craig

Last Name: Wong

Email Address: cwong@2mpower.net

Affiliation:

Subject: Reject the Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/40-tfs2019-UCQAYABwBwsCZwlm.txt'

Original File Name: tfs\_comment.txt

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 16:04:40

No Duplicates.

**Comment 40 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Andrea

Last Name: Bonnett

Email Address: aesabet11@yahoo.com

Affiliation: Please Select

Subject: Carbon Offsets

Comment:

Carbon offsets allow big polluters in California keep polluting.  
This is not the right fix to reduce our carbon emissions.

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 16:55:56

No Duplicates.

**Comment 41 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Brian

Last Name: Florian

Email Address: briankflorian@hotmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: No Carbon Offset

Comment:

Fossil fuel-free future.

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 17:00:37

No Duplicates.

**Comment 42 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Joanne  
Last Name: Fanucchi  
Email Address: jfanucchi9@gmail.com  
Affiliation:

Subject: Say NO to Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/43-tfs2019-WilSNQR8AAwGblM8.pdf'

Original File Name: Say NO to Tropical Forest Standard.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 17:53:01

No Duplicates.

**Comment 43 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Felicia  
Last Name: Chase  
Email Address: Bdlmnia@aol.com  
Affiliation:

Subject: Clean Air.  
Comment:

Clean air

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 20:20:13

No Duplicates.

**Comment 44 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Martha

Last Name: San Roman Montero

Email Address: martha.sanroman.estrategia@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Support letter from the Government of Campeche Mexico

Comment:

Please find attached our comments and support for the California Tropical Forest Standard.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/45-tfs2019-UyBXJFwtUXJSO1cl.pdf'

Original File Name: Support letter from Campeche.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 21:20:16

No Duplicates.

**Comment 45 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Floriberto

Last Name: Vasquez

Email Address: floribertov@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Support for California Tropical Forest Standard Oaxaca Mexico

Comment:

Through this letter we reiterate our support for the Tropical Forest Standard and its endorsement by the California Air Resources Board. Oaxaca State Government.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/46-tfs2019-UCNXJAZ3AyBSO1Un.pdf'

Original File Name: Support letter Oaxaca CTFS.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 21:42:42

No Duplicates.

**Comment 46 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Rafael

Last Name: Robles

Email Address: roblesdeb1@hotmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Quintana Roo support comments to the California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please find attached our comments and support to the California Tropical Forest Standard.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/47-tfs2019-B3QAc1YnU3BQOQFz.pdf'

Original File Name: Support letter Quintana Roo California Air and Resources Board.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 21:49:13

No Duplicates.



**Comment 47 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Jenner

Last Name: Rodas

Email Address: sllamasprado@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Support letter from the Government of Chiapas Mexico

Comment:

Dear Members of the California Air and Resources Board find  
attached our support comments. Regards

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/48-tfs2019-B3RRIGR1VXYHblMh.pdf'

Original File Name: Support letter Chiapas.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 21:53:47

No Duplicates.

**Comment 48 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: David

Last Name: Marvin

Email Address: dave@salo.ai

Affiliation: Salo Sciences, Inc.

Subject: Public comment on updated CTFS

Comment:

See attached document. Thank you.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/49-tfs2019-B3RTNFQ5BzsGXwBj.pdf'

Original File Name: Salo Comments to ARB (updated Aug 2019).pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 21:35:08

No Duplicates.

**Comment 49 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: daniel

Last Name: Medrano

Email Address: d.medrano87@yahoo.com

Affiliation:

Subject: pollution

Comment:

corporations should never be allowed to offset their pollution. the environment needs to be put in front of profits.

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 22:28:58

No Duplicates.

**Comment 50 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Catherine

Last Name: Leining

Email Address: catherine.leining@motu.org.nz

Affiliation: Motu Economic and Public Policy Research

Subject: Support for the revised California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019)

Comment:

Please see the attached letter of support for the revised California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019).

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/51-tfs2019-VWddawExUDpVflJi.pdf'

Original File Name: 2019-08-28 Leining submission on California Tropical Forest Standard.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-27 23:23:44

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 51 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Johnny

Last Name: Sorensen

Email Address: erik6242@yahoo.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Off Sets for public polluters

Comment:

Please, for the sake of the planet, for the sake of the children here and now and in the future and for the sake of all creatures more or less great and small, do not allow big industry polluters to conduct themselves as "business as usual" in the 80's we as a society had a big chance to halt the most dramatic aspects of climate change, well frankly, not anymore and we as a species on this one blue or not so blue, do not have the luxury to allow the usual polluting industries of the world to think they have license to go on as usual, destroying the planet for profit, at it's and ours and our children's and children's future? expense, so please find a conscience somewhere deep in side you, those that can make a difference and say no, to any and all carbon offsets.

Were out of time for no longer is it on our side, it's either dramatic swift action, or we and the planet are doomed to extinction, it's that real and that scary, just follow all the current events of science, get your head out of the sand of denial, one planet, it's all we have, there is no second home not even for the super rich with all there wealth, there just like all the rest of us and their precious money will not save them period!

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-28 05:06:06

No Duplicates.

**Comment 52 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Colin

Last Name: Murphy

Email Address: colinpmurphy23@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: No Carbon Offsets!

Comment:

"Carbon offsets" are an absurd policy that allow companies and the government to make it look like they are doing something to fight climate change when in fact they are doing nothing and are simply taking credit for vegetation that was already there. Beyond that, sometimes these "offsets" involve displacing people who live in the ecosystem they are "acquiring". Furthermore, we need to be reducing our emissions, not just offsetting them. No carbon offset policies!!!

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-28 06:24:55

No Duplicates.

**Comment 53 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Allan

Last Name: Campbell

Email Address: allanlc16@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Comments on Carbon Offsets

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/55-tfs2019-VjVdOlwwUXIFYQRh.pdf'

Original File Name: Campbell.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-28 08:12:29

No Duplicates.

**Comment 54 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Yazmin

Last Name: Gonzalez

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: Comments on TFS2019

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/56-tfs2019-UDdcNV0yWHELbAJu.pdf'

Original File Name: Gonzalez.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-28 08:26:12

No Duplicates.



**Comment 55 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Anastasia

Last Name: Fiandaca

Email Address: fiandaca@zoho.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Do not Endorse the California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/57-tfs2019-B2FdMlc3BDlSMAhP.pdf'

Original File Name: Fiandaca.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-28 10:33:17

No Duplicates.

**Comment 56 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Stefani

Last Name: Grant

Email Address: stefani.millie@unilever.com

Affiliation: Unilever

Subject: Support for California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/58-tfs2019-B3NRJQZoV3QDbAVm.pdf'

Original File Name: Tropical Forest Standard Letter of Support August 2019.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-28 11:03:38

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 57 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Jonah

Last Name: Busch

Email Address: jbusch@earthinnovation.org

Affiliation: Earth Innovation Institute

Subject: Strong support for endorsement of updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019)

Comment:

The Earth Innovation Institute strongly supports the California Air Resources Board endorsing the updated California Tropical Forest Standard. In the attached letter, we describe the importance of the Standard in the larger context of solving climate change.

About Earth Innovation Institute:

The Earth Innovation Institute is a not-for-profit, independent research institute with headquarters in San Francisco and programs in Brazil, Colombia, Indonesia, and Peru. We pursue our goals of slowing climate change, conserving tropical forests and fisheries, and improving rural livelihoods by promoting sustainable rural development through a blend of research, consensus-building, policy analysis and reform, and private sector engagement.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/59-tfs2019-Wz5SPQRsUFwEcQh8.pdf'

Original File Name: EII Strong Support for CARB Endorsing the Updated California Tropical Forest Standard 8 27 2019.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-28 10:58:51

No Duplicates.

**Comment 58 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Virginia

Last Name: Zaunbrecher

Email Address: zaunbrecher@ucla.edu

Affiliation:

Subject: Comments from UCLA's Center for Tropical Research to TFS2019

Comment:

Please find attached comments from the Center for Tropical Research in favor of the Updated Tropical Forest Standards.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/60-tfs2019-AWJcLIUmAw9SIAZ0.pdf'

Original File Name: CTR Tropical Forest Standard Comments (Aug 28 2019) final.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-28 11:56:36

No Duplicates.

**Comment 59 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Christina

Last Name: McCain

Email Address: cmccain@edf.org

Affiliation: Environmental Defense Fund

Subject: Support for endorsement of updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019)

Comment:

Environmental Defense Fund strongly supports the California Air Resources Board endorsing the updated California Tropical Forest Standard.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/61-tfs2019-VjVcO10DBSJSJgZp.pdf'

Original File Name: CA\_TropicalForestStandard\_EDF\_final\_2019.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-28 12:49:50

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 60 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Emily

Last Name: Laskin

Email Address: emily.laskin@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: No to California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

As a Californian, I feel strongly that our state should lead the way on climate change adaptation and mitigation--as we have already been doing. Offsets, while they certainly have their place in a green economy, are just not as good a solution as reducing emissions and climate pollution in the first place, especially for large companies and corporations. Carbon offsets allow those corporations to keep polluting. Furthermore, the offsets run the risk of displacing native people in the Amazon and other areas that offsets supposedly support. And the efficacy of offsets in the long-run is unknown and the integrity of current projects is difficult to measure. California should not endorse them through endorsement of TFS.

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-28 13:57:24

No Duplicates.

**Comment 61 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Bonnie

Last Name: Lockhart

Email Address: bonnie@bonnielockhart.com

Affiliation:

Subject: NO on Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/63-tfs2019-VDgAaQBiADgDbVQ1.pdf'

Original File Name: Lockhart.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-28 14:39:54

No Duplicates.

**Comment 62 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Jose

Last Name: Bravo

Email Address: josetbravo2810@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Reject TFS

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/64-tfs2019-WjhSJgdnVHEKYwAu.pdf'

Original File Name: Bravo.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-28 14:46:53

No Duplicates.



## **Comment 63 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Susan

Last Name: Schacher

Email Address: susan4@jps.net

Affiliation:

Subject: Oppose endorsement of the California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

I urge you to not endorse the California Tropical Forest Standard, and to ensure that these tropical forest offsets never are accepted into California's carbon trading system, or adopted by out-of-state entities like the International Commercial Aviation Organization (ICAO).

Carbon offsets allow big emitters in California to keep polluting, instead of reducing their carbon footprint. They perpetuate pollution hotspots and prevent California from taking real action on climate change. If the ICAO were to adopt tropical forest offsets, it would allow airline emissions to continue growing while putting tropical forests into the market over the protests of local communities -- a bad idea.

Tropical forest carbon offsets lack integrity, pose unacceptably high risks of violating indigenous and human rights, and are impossible to police across national borders. California should not be encouraging them through the endorsement of the TFS.

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-28 14:51:10

No Duplicates.

**Comment 64 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Dorothy

Last Name: Dent

Email Address: Saveislavistaparks@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Vote NO on Tropical Forest Standard Bill

Comment:

Do not adopt this non environmentally sustainable bill. Polluters need to stop polluting and pay to clean up their messes.

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-28 15:38:06

No Duplicates.

**Comment 65 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Janice

Last Name: Schroeder

Email Address: westberkeleyalliance@yahoo.com

Affiliation: West Berkeley Alliance for Clean Air and

Subject: Opposition to endorsement of the California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

See attachment

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/67-tfs2019-Uz8CYVwpVHMBYgBy.docx'

Original File Name: Letter to Governor Newsom and CARB .docx

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-28 16:05:15

No Duplicates.

**Comment 66 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Larry

Last Name: Hendel

Email Address: larryhendel@att.net

Affiliation:

Subject: TFS 2019

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/68-tfs2019-B29TMF0yAzRXNFQ4.pdf'

Original File Name: Hendel.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-28 16:17:25

No Duplicates.

**Comment 67 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Lou-Anne F.  
Last Name: Makes-Marks, PhD  
Email Address: sacredamerica@gmail.com  
Affiliation: Sacred America

Subject: IEN and Sacred America Comments on the Tropical Forest Standard 2019  
Comment:

Comments attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/69-tfs2019-B2tTMFAIWX5XNAV3.pdf'

Original File Name: Letter to CARB August 28 2019.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-28 16:53:54

No Duplicates.

**Comment 68 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Ted

Last Name: Smith

Email Address: tsmith@igc.org

Affiliation:

Subject: Opposition to the TFS Offset Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/70-tfs2019-AXIGbQRsBSJSPAIs.pdf'

Original File Name: Smith.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-28 17:23:53

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 69 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Alan

Last Name: Ramo

Email Address: aramolaw@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Opposed to the California Troical Forest Standard

Comment:

Offsets should not be the price for reversing deforestation. Offsets allow increases in ghg emissions for offset purchasers and co-pollutants not already adequately regulated. Refinery emissions in particular impact nearby communities of color in California most vulnerable to impacts of climate change and co-pollutants. The Tropical Forest Standard does not prevent leakage. Enforceability is difficult when the national government such as Brazil is facilitating forest fires and other methods of deforestation. Difficult to assure rate will continue to fall. Giving credit to one province for reducing the rate of deforestation when the rest of the nation is increasing deforestation accomplishes little of value. Corruption remains a serious concern in Brazil and will affect enforceability and determination of baselines used for calculations. The impact of planting non-native tree plantations could be destructive of indigenous populations. Stick to making existing offsets providing benefit to California real and enforceable.

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-28 18:21:39

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 70 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Maria Tereza

Last Name: Umbelino

Email Address: [diretoria@brasilmataviva.com.br](mailto:diretoria@brasilmataviva.com.br)

Affiliation:

Subject: BMV standard supports the updated California Forest Standard

Comment:

The BMV Standard network implemented and created in Brazil, which in partnership have instituted a Jurisdictional Scale Program to preserve and reduce emissions from tropical deforestation, with local communities and with some states in Brazil. Our group of institutions and farmers are complying with the updated California Forest Standard.

I hereby present the attached submissions. Should you have any questions or comments, we are available to answer or respond further per the above contact details.

Attachment: '[www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/72-tfs2019-ATBcY11sVD8BNQU9.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/72-tfs2019-ATBcY11sVD8BNQU9.pdf)'

Original File Name: 190828 BMV letter of support to CARB.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-28 18:23:58

No Duplicates.



**Comment 71 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Oscar

Last Name: Quispe

Email Address: oaltamirano@regionamazonas.gob.pe

Affiliation: Government of Amazonas

Subject: Support for TFS from government of Amazonas

Comment:

See letter attached as PDF.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/73-tfs2019-VTITMFwpBSILaFMh.pdf'

Original File Name: Letter of Amazonas-Perú.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-28 20:19:36

No Duplicates.

**Comment 72 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Juan

Last Name: Cornelio

Email Address: [jalvarado@regionhuanuco.gob.pe](mailto:jalvarado@regionhuanuco.gob.pe)

Affiliation: Governor of Huanuco

Subject: Support for TFS from Governor of Huanuco

Comment:

See letter attached as PDF.

Attachment: '[www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/74-tfs2019-AGwBYgN2ByAHZAFz.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/74-tfs2019-AGwBYgN2ByAHZAFz.pdf)'

Original File Name: Letter of Huánuco-Perú.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-28 20:24:27

No Duplicates.

**Comment 73 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Juan

Last Name: Cornelio

Email Address: [jalvarado@regionhuanuco.gob.pe](mailto:jalvarado@regionhuanuco.gob.pe)

Affiliation: Governor of Huanuco

Subject: Support for TFS from Governor of Huanuco

Comment:

See letter attached as PDF.

Attachment: '[www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/75-tfs2019-UDxSMVAIWH8EZw17.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/75-tfs2019-UDxSMVAIWH8EZw17.pdf)'

Original File Name: Letter of Huánuco-Perú.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-28 20:24:27

No Duplicates.

**Comment 74 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Guillermo

Last Name: Okimura

Email Address: luis.hidalgo.ok@gmail.com

Affiliation: Governor of Madre de Dios

Subject: Support for TFS from Governor of Madre de Dios

Comment:

See letter of support attached as PDF.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/76-tfs2019-Am5TMAN2V3BRMgJw.pdf'

Original File Name: Letter of Madre de Dios-Perú.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-28 20:26:14

No Duplicates.

**Comment 75 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Pedro

Last Name: Vargas

Email Address: jlengua@regionsanmartin.gob.pe

Affiliation: Governor of San Martin

Subject: Support for TFS from Governor of San Martin

Comment:

See letter of support attached as PDF.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/77-tfs2019-WjYGZQZzWX4DYAV3.pdf'

Original File Name: Letter of San Martin-Perú.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-28 20:28:58

No Duplicates.

**Comment 76 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Francisco

Last Name: Torres

Email Address: presidencia@regionucayali.gob.pe

Affiliation: Governor of Ucayali

Subject: Support for TFS from Governor of Ucayali

Comment:

See letter of support attached as PDF.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/78-tfs2019-VzsAY1YjUHcAYwFz.pdf'

Original File Name: Letter of Ucayali-Perú.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-28 20:30:33

No Duplicates.

**Comment 77 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Linda

Last Name: Mellen

Email Address: Lmellen1@gmail.com

Affiliation: Concerned citizen

Subject: Fluorocarbons

Comment:

No fluorocarbons allowed at all. No exchanges nada

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-28 20:34:29

No Duplicates.

**Comment 78 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Humberto

Last Name: Lugo

Email Address: betomtz.lugo@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Oppose the offsets

Comment:

<https://docs.google.com/document/d/11CnVF-ENgdANzCfa9ONnI2shPuvCnc9J11gBhXscl2M>

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-28 20:46:25

No Duplicates.



**Comment 79 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Eduardo

Last Name: Tavares

Email Address: seplan.ap@gmail.com

Affiliation: State Member of GCF Brazil

Subject: Support letter to the updated California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

On Behalf of the State of Amapa and Tesouro Verde Program, which in partnership have instituted a Jurisdictional Scale Program to preserve and reduce emissions from tropical deforestation, I hereby present the attached submissions.

Should you have any questions or comments, we are available to answer or respond further per the above contact details.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/81-tfs2019-UWBdYlBhUzgHM1Vs.pdf'

Original File Name: 190829 Letter GEA & CARB bilingue.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-28 20:40:17

No Duplicates.

**Comment 80 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Andrea

Last Name: Tuttle

Email Address: andreatuttle1@gmail.com

Affiliation: Forest and Climate Policy

Subject: SUPPORT ENDORSEMENT OF UPDATED CALIFORNIA TROPICAL FOREST STANDARD

Comment:

Please see attached letter reaffirming my support for the Updated California Tropical Forest Standard.

Thank you,

Andrea Tuttle

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/82-tfs2019-AnEGdVQIVHcCawJw.docx'

Original File Name: Support Ltr Tropical Forest Std Sept 19 2019 CARB ATuttle.docx

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-28 22:08:17

No Duplicates.

**Comment 81 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Souparna

Last Name: Lahiri

Email Address: souparna.lahiri@gmail.com

Affiliation: Global Forest Coalition

Subject: Submission and comments to California Air Resources Board on the proposed Tropical Forest

Comment:

The submission to the California Air Resources Board on the proposed Tropical Forest Standard from Global Forest Coalition is attached herewith.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/83-tfs2019-BmEBYQNhV1tSJwB1.pdf'

Original File Name: GFC submissionTFS 2019-converted.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 00:16:45

No Duplicates.

**Comment 82 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Tim

Last Name: Clairs

Email Address: tim.clairs@undp.org

Affiliation: UNDP

Subject: UNDP Statement in Support of CFTS

Comment:

Please find attached UNDP's Statement in support of the updated California Tropical Forest Standard.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/84-tfs2019-AmECZQcrByABdVc4.pdf'

Original File Name: Ca-tropical forest standard\_UNDP public comments-29 Aug 2019.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 05:56:41

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 83 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Christopher  
Last Name: Lish  
Email Address: lishchris@yahoo.com  
Affiliation:

Subject: Do NOT endorse the California Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

Thursday, August 29, 2019

Clerk of the Board  
California Air Resources Board  
1001 I Street  
Sacramento, California 95814

Subject: Do NOT endorse the California Tropical Forest Standard

To the Air Resources Board:

As a California resident, I am writing to urge you to not endorse the California Tropical Forest Standard, and to ensure that these tropical forest offsets never are accepted into California's carbon trading system, or adopted by out-of-state entities like the International Commercial Aviation Organization (ICAO).

"Our duty to the whole, including to the unborn generations, bids us to restrain an unprincipled present-day minority from wasting the heritage of these unborn generations. The movement for the conservation of wildlife and the larger movement for the conservation of all our natural resources are essentially democratic in spirit, purpose and method."  
-- Theodore Roosevelt

Carbon offsets allow big emitters in California to keep polluting, instead of reducing their carbon footprint. They perpetuate pollution hotspots and prevent California from taking real action on climate change. If the ICAO were to adopt tropical forest offsets, it would allow airline emissions to continue growing while putting tropical forests into the market over the protests of local communities. It's totally unacceptable.

"Do not suffer your good nature, when application is made, to say 'Yes' when you should say 'No'. Remember, it is a public not a private cause that is to be injured or benefited by your choice."  
-- George Washington

Tropical forest carbon offsets lack integrity, pose unacceptably high risks of violating indigenous and human rights, and are impossible to police across national borders. California should not be encouraging them through the endorsement of the Tropical Forest Standard.

"A thing is right when it tends to preserve the integrity,

stability, and beauty of the biotic community. It is wrong when it tends otherwise."  
-- Aldo Leopold

Thank you for your consideration of my comments. Please do NOT add my name to your mailing list. I will learn about future developments on this issue from other sources.

Sincerely,  
Christopher Lish  
San Rafael, CA

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 07:29:15

No Duplicates.

**Comment 84 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Megan

Last Name: Elsea

Email Address: meganelsea@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: No Carbon Offsets for the Amazon

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/86-tfs2019-VzJXPQR2VmAKbVB+.pdf'

Original File Name: Elsea.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 08:04:24

No Duplicates.

**Comment 85 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Joanne  
Last Name: Fanucchi  
Email Address: jfanucchi9@gmail.com  
Affiliation:

Subject: Say No to Tropical Forest emissions  
Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/87-tfs2019-AmQFYIE+VHJWM1Az.pdf'

Original File Name: Fanucchi.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 08:05:11

No Duplicates.



**Comment 86 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Frances

Last Name: Seymour

Email Address: francesjseymour@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Comments on Draft Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached letter

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/88-tfs2019-USIGZQN7V2kBaf0.docx'

Original File Name: Seymour Comments on Draft California Tropical Forest Standard\_29 August 2019.docx

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 08:36:27

No Duplicates.

**Comment 87 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Amy

Last Name: Duchelle

Email Address: a.duchelle@cgiar.org

Affiliation: Center for International Forestry Research

Subject: REDD+ addresses climate stability and sustainable development objectives

Comment:

Please find attached letter on behalf of the Center for International Forestry Research (CIFOR) reiterating our support for the Updated California Tropical Forest Standard.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/89-tfs2019-WzhTOgdrAjxVNglN.docx'

Original File Name: Comments on the California Tropical Forest Standard\_29Aug2019.docx

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 08:33:19

No Duplicates.

**Comment 88 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Stephen

Last Name: Rumsey

Email Address: [stephen.rumsey@permianglobal.com](mailto:stephen.rumsey@permianglobal.com)

Affiliation: Permian Global

Subject: Permian Global Supports CARB's Endorsement of Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

See attached.

Attachment: '[www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/90-tfs2019-BjZRbwEyUzlSZVdu.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/90-tfs2019-BjZRbwEyUzlSZVdu.pdf)'

Original File Name: 082919\_CARB letter supporting Tropical Forest Standard Final.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 09:16:59

No Duplicates.

**Comment 89 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Aida

Last Name: Marina

Email Address: amice@aol.com

Affiliation:

Subject: No Carbon Offsets

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/91-tfs2019-AWBWOVUwADJReQBw.pdf'

Original File Name: Aida.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 09:37:41

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 90 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Chris

Last Name: Tilly

Email Address: [tilly@ucla.edu](mailto:tilly@ucla.edu)

Affiliation: Professor, UCLA Urban Planning

Subject: Reduce emissions, don't paper them over with tropical forest offsets

Comment:

I write to oppose the California Tropical Forest Standard. I strongly support rain forest preservation and reforestation as part of the solution to rising carbon emissions. However, these goals should be part of the baseline, not traded off against slower emissions reductions. In addition, as recent news on the fires in the Brazilian rain forest have underlined, rain forest preservation is difficult to monitor and enforce, and offsets like those proposed have proven easy to "game". It will not be easy to reduce emissions to the necessary extent, but we need to do the hard work, not settle for misleading alternatives.

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 09:31:57

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 91 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Don

Last Name: Misumi

Email Address: don.misumi@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Stop this false solution

Comment:

I am a native-born San Franciscan and have actually made a study of these types of efforts to address climate change. It is clear to me that they are primarily political maneuvers that are done to falsely claim credit for saving the environment. In fact, they do very little to address climate change but instead allow capitalist interests to buy their way out of social responsibility at the expense of people of color and the future of our planet. This is a cap and trade policy that does almost nothing to reduce carbon emissions and has incentivized the destruction of rain forests and attacks on indigenous people, the very ones who are doing the most to protect our planet. I strongly urge you to REJECT these policies.

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 10:24:45

No Duplicates.

**Comment 92 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: James

Last Name: Roth

Email Address: jroth@conservation.org

Affiliation: Conservation International

Subject: Support endorsement of updated Tropical Forest Standard (TFS2019)

Comment:

See attached letter

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/94-tfs2019-UzAHaFQKBDsAYwRw.pdf'

Original File Name: CI Letter to CARB supporting TFS 08-28-19.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 10:37:29

No Duplicates.

**Comment 93 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Isabella

Last Name: Gonzalez Potter

Email Address: i.gonzalezpotter@tnc.org

Affiliation: The Nature Conservancy

Subject: TFS Support Letter

Comment:

Please find the attached support letter on behalf of The Nature Conservancy (TNC) in support of the Tropical Forest Standard.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/95-tfs2019-UydRPwRgVVkHbwRl.pdf'

Original File Name: The Nature Conservancy TFS Support Letter.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 10:14:12

No Duplicates.



**Comment 94 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Cassandra  
Last Name: Smithies  
Email Address: baad\_eyes@yahoo.com  
Affiliation:

Subject: REJECT TFS  
Comment:

I write to cordially request that CARB reject the TFS and desist from promoting carbon offsets, carbon trading and other false solutions to climate change of any kind by any name including "deep decarbonization."

Sincerely,  
Cassandra Smithies

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 11:42:49

No Duplicates.

**Comment 95 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: William

Last Name: Chorneau

Email Address: wchorneau@yahoo.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Public Comment on the California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/97-tfs2019-VzQHavY4UnNXPwNm.pdf'

Original File Name: Chorneau.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 11:57:48

No Duplicates.

**Comment 96 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Sara

Last Name: Omi Casama

Email Address: omisara@gmail.com

Affiliation: Congreso General Embera de Alto Bayano

Subject: Support for endorsement of updated California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/98-tfs2019-VzkBaFQ0WX4KbQdY.pdf'

Original File Name: NOATA A LA Junta de Recursos del Aire de California.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 12:47:11

No Duplicates.

**Comment 97 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Craig

Last Name: Ebert

Email Address: [cebert@climateactionreserve.org](mailto:cebert@climateactionreserve.org)

Affiliation: Climate Action Reserve

Subject: Support for endorsement of California TFS

Comment:

Please see the attached file.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/99-tfs2019-UTJdOlQnBAhRI1I0.docx'

Original File Name: CAR TFS letter to ARB.docx

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 13:42:29

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 98 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Tim

Last Name: Forsyth

Email Address: t.j.forsyth@lse.ac.uk

Affiliation: London School of Economics and Political

Subject: Concerns about Updated California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

I am writing with sensitivity to express some concerns about the Updated California Tropical Forest Standard. I have commented on this case before. I am a professor at the London School of Economics, and have some 20 years experience in tropical environmental policy. My concerns are that the sections addressing leakage and safeguards are (as yet) too vague to have meaning. The risk of these problems is that the Standard itself might lose effectiveness, but also that there is a reputational risk that the Standard might have negative impacts on local forest users in tropical countries that might be highlighted by activist and human rights organizations.

Concerning leakage: the problem is that the text of the proposed Standard is too vague, and should include best practices for leakage accounting, including over the lifecycle of the proposed production. This problem undermines the environmental objectives of the Standard.

Concerning safeguards: the text of the proposed Standard is again too vague, and leaves judgement about negative impact to subjective judgment. Admittedly, the Standard is using the framework discussed in the Cancun Agreement and REDD+SES Version 2. But these frameworks are considered to be works in progress, and are likely to be updated, and indeed are currently widely criticized by some groups engaged in environment and development policy as insufficient. I hope it is possible for the California Standard to go one or more steps further than this current incomplete framework, and to create a better system of ensuring that carbon-forest schemes do not engage in negative impacts such as displacing settlements; restricting agricultural livelihoods; unfair and poorly communicated penalties for community participants; and other factors detrimental to local development such as debt.

Best wishes.

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 13:17:47

No Duplicates.

**Comment 99 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Alberto

Last Name: saldamando

Email Address: alberto@ienearth.org

Affiliation:

Subject: TFS

Comment:

Please circulate these comments to CARB Board members

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/102-tfs2019-BWxVNII9WVUCKQRb.pdf'

Original File Name: IEN - Comments to CARB on Tropical Forest Standard August 2019.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 14:01:27

No Duplicates.

**Comment 100 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Robinson

Last Name: Lopez

Email Address: cclimaticocoica@gmail.com

Affiliation: COICA

Subject: Support for endorsement of California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/103-tfs2019-WzhVMgd0V3BRNlcI.pdf'

Original File Name: Carta al GCF CGCCOICA-2019-340 eng.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 14:11:26

No Duplicates.



**Comment 101 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Harjot

Last Name: Kaur

Email Address: kaur@law.ucla.edu

Affiliation: Emmett Institute on Climate Change and t

Subject: Emmett Institute comments on Updated Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Comment on Updated Tropical Forest Standard is attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/104-tfs2019-BnMHcQFkAjBXJQdi.pdf'

Original File Name: Updated TFS Comment Letter - 8-29 Final.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 14:25:43

No Duplicates.

**Comment 102 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Renato

Last Name: Silva

Email Address: marli.santos@semades.to.gov.br

Affiliation: Government of Tocantins

Subject: Government of Tocantins supports TFS

Comment:

See letter of support from Government of Tocantins attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/105-tfs2019-B2RSNVAjUnUKbVUK.pdf'

Original File Name: Carta Califórnia Tocantins.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 14:31:58

No Duplicates.

**Comment 103 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Lydia

Last Name: Simas

Email Address: lsimas@grassrootsonline.org

Affiliation:

Subject: NO to Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/106-tfs2019-AGdTJ1U9UI4HdQBy.doc'

Original File Name: GRI Tropical Forest Standar (TFS) Letter - CARB.doc

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 14:38:38

No Duplicates.

**Comment 104 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Jessica

Last Name: Melton PG&E

Email Address: jessica.melton@pge.com

Affiliation: PG&E

Subject: PG&E Support Letter for TFS

Comment:

Letter attached

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/107-tfs2019-ViYBYAZiAg4HdQd1.pdf'

Original File Name: PGE Tropical Forest Standard Letter of Support.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 14:42:54

No Duplicates.

**Comment 105 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Amy

Last Name: Moas

Email Address: amy.moas@greenpeace.org

Affiliation: Greenpeace USA

Subject: Reject TFS

Comment:

Please find Greenpeace USA's comments on the Updated Tropical Forest Standard. We strongly urge you to reject the Updated Standard and stop all future work on an international forestry offset program.

We formally request that Evan Kersnar copy and forward this letter to all CARB Board members.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/108-tfs2019-BmdSIVUzWVUKPgc3.pdf'

Original File Name: Aug 2019 GP Comment letter on CA Tropical Forest Standard FINAL.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 14:43:21

No Duplicates.

**Comment 106 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Roberto

Last Name: Vallejo

Email Address: roberto.vallejo@yucatan.gob.mx

Affiliation:

Subject: Comments from Yucatan Mexico

Comment:

Comments from Yucatan Mexico

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/109-tfs2019-AmEFYgFsBD5QMFI9.pdf'

Original File Name: California Support letter Yucatan.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 14:55:57

No Duplicates.

**Comment 107 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Rafael

Last Name: Ribeiro

Email Address: rafael.ribeiro@sema.ma.gov.br

Affiliation: Secretary of Environment Maranhao

Subject: Maranhao supports TFS

Comment:

Letter of support from Government of Maranhao attached as PDF.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/110-tfs2019-UzBUM1MgWX5SNQFe.pdf'

Original File Name: Carta para a Califórnia v1 Maranhao.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 14:52:38

No Duplicates.

**Comment 108 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Eduardo

Last Name: Taveira

Email Address: eduardo.taveira@sema.am.gov.br

Affiliation: Secretary of Environment of Amazonas

Subject: Government of Amazonas supports TFS

Comment:

See letter of support from TFS attached as PDF.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/111-tfs2019-VTZTNFQnBSILbFUK.pdf'

Original File Name: Carta Califórnia Amazonas.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 14:57:14

No Duplicates.



**Comment 109 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Maurren

Last Name: Lazzaretti

Email Address: maurenlazzaretti@sema.mt.gov.br

Affiliation: Secretary of Environment Mato Grosso

Subject: Mato Grosso supports TFS

Comment:

See letter of support for TFS from Government of Mato Gross  
attached as PDF.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/112-tfs2019-BXFUNFwuV1sKfwdy.pdf'

Original File Name: TFS Support Mato Grosso.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 14:59:40

No Duplicates.

**Comment 110 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Maurren

Last Name: Lazzaretti

Email Address: maurenlazzaretti@sema.mt.gov.br

Affiliation: Secretary of Environment Mato Grosso

Subject: Mato Grosso supports TFS

Comment:

See letter of support for TFS from Government of Mato Gross  
attached as PDF.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/113-tfs2019-AnZUNAFzAw8DdgZz.pdf'

Original File Name: TFS Support Mato Grosso.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 14:59:40

No Duplicates.

**Comment 111 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Lou-Anne Fauteck

Last Name: Makes-Marks

Email Address: sacredamerica@gmail.com

Affiliation: Sacred America and IEN

Subject: Comment of Sacred America and Indigenous Environmental Network

Comment:

Corrected comment attached. Previous comment had transcription error.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/114-tfs2019-VztVNl0oVnEBYgR2.pdf'

Original File Name: Letter to CARB August 28 2019.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 14:58:00

No Duplicates.

**Comment 112 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Jose

Last Name: Mauro

Email Address: mauro.odealmeida@gmail.com

Affiliation: Support for TFS from Para

Subject: Government of Para support TFS

Comment:

See letter of support for TFS from government of Para attached as PDF.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/115-tfs2019-WzRRMVxzAw8EdgRi.pdf'

Original File Name: OF. TFS Para.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 15:01:31

No Duplicates.

**Comment 113 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Alejandra

Last Name: Blanco

Email Address: mariaalejandra.blanco@jalisco.gob.mx

Affiliation:

Subject: California Forest Standard Jalisco comments

Comment:

Find attached our letter with comments to the California Forest Standard

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/116-tfs2019-UiEHdAFwUnELYgl7.pdf'

Original File Name: SupportTropical Forest Standard Jalisco.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 15:04:35

No Duplicates.

**Comment 114 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Gladson

Last Name: Cameli

Email Address: gab.govcameli@ac.gov.br

Affiliation: Governor of Acre Brazil

Subject: Government of Acre Brazil Supports TFS

Comment:

Please see the attached letter of support for the TFS from Governor Cameli of Acre, Brazil.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/117-tfs2019-JTMWzdb5QNwVWM0d.pdf'

Original File Name: Carta California Acre.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 15:08:47

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 115 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Heather

Last Name: Shelby

Email Address: hshelby@edf.org

Affiliation:

Subject: Support for endorsement of TFS

Comment:

To whom it may concern:

Attached, please find the signatures of 25,589 Environmental Defense Fund supporters (5,787 of which who are from California) who have submitted an electronic comment in support of the Tropical Forest Standard. The comment they each submitted reads:

"I strongly support California using the state's global influence to protect tropical forests through endorsement of the Tropical Forest Standard.

"Cutting and burning tropical forests like the Amazon threatens their unique animals, plants and millions of people who depend on them to survive. Deforestation also contributes more greenhouse gas emissions than all the cars, trucks, and ships in the world every single year - stopping it is a critical step to avoiding dangerous global warming and meeting the goals of the Paris climate agreement.

"California's proposed Standard for rainforest credits would create incentives to protect tropical forests -- whole forest landscapes, across entire states or nations. It would also require that programs producing rainforest credits consult and collaborate with indigenous and other traditional communities who use and safeguard forests. And that their communities are partners who benefit from these programs. The money generated from the sale of the credits directly benefits the programs that are protecting forests, reducing emissions and creating sustainable indigenous livelihoods that are in harmony with and strengthen their cultural traditions.

"The world must address the loss of tropical forests to stop climate change. Now is the time for California to directly promote the reduction of greenhouse gas emissions from the cutting and burning of tropical forests. We can't save the climate without tropical forests. The California Air Resources Board should endorse the California Tropical Forest Standard."

Please feel free to contact me if you have any questions or concerns about this submission.

Thank you,

Heather Shelby

Manager, Grassroots Organizing & Activism

Environmental Defense Fund

Attachment: '[www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/118-tfs2019-VzRUM1c6V20BYQJt.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/118-tfs2019-VzRUM1c6V20BYQJt.pdf)'

Original File Name: CaliforniaTFS\_Signatures\_082919.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 15:02:43

No Duplicates.



**Comment 116 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: EDUARDO

Last Name: TAVARES

Email Address: seplan.ap@gmail.com

Affiliation: State Member of GCF Brazil

Subject: Support letter to the updated California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

On Behalf of the State of Amapa and Tesouro Verde Program, which in partnership have instituted a Jurisdictional Scale Program to preserve and reduce emissions from tropical deforestation, I hereby present the attached submissions.

Should you have any questions or comments, we are available to answer or respond further per the above contact details.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/119-tfs2019-VGZRZ1BgWTNSCwFt.pdf'

Original File Name: 2019 Letter Gov Amapa to Carb.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 15:23:17

No Duplicates.

**Comment 117 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Sonja

Last Name: Swift

Email Address: sonja@swiftfoundation.org

Affiliation: Swift Foundation

Subject: Swift Foundation Rejects the TFS

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/120-tfs2019-UiFVJAZuADUDcQVj.docx'

Original File Name: Swiftfoundation.docx

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 15:32:10

No Duplicates.

**Comment 118 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Sonja

Last Name: Swift

Email Address: sonja@swiftfoundation.org

Affiliation: Swift Foundation

Subject: Climate Justice Foundations Reject the TFS

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/121-tfs2019-BmACa1cjUm8KaAVk.docx'

Original File Name: foundation.docx

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 15:33:42

No Duplicates.

**Comment 119 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: MARIA TEREZA

Last Name: UMBELINO

Email Address: [diretoria@brasilmataviva.com.br](mailto:diretoria@brasilmataviva.com.br)

Affiliation:

Subject: BMV standard supports the updated California Forest Standard

Comment:

The BMV Standard network implemented and created in Brazil, which in partnership have instituted a Jurisdictional Scale Program to preserve and reduce emissions from tropical deforestation, with local communities and with some states in Brazil. Our group of institutions and farmers are complying with the updated California Forest Standard.

I hereby present the attached submissions. Should you have any questions or comments, we are available to answer or respond further per the above contact details.

Attachment: '[www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/122-tfs2019-BTQAP1RIBG8GMgE4.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/122-tfs2019-BTQAP1RIBG8GMgE4.pdf)'

Original File Name: 190829c Carta BMV de apoio ao CARB bilíngue.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 15:31:47

No Duplicates.

**Comment 120 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Katie

Last Name: Sullivan

Email Address: sullivan@ieta.org

Affiliation:

Subject: IETA Comments on Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please find attached comments from the International Emissions Trading Association on the tropical forest standard.

Sincerely,

Katie Sullivan

Managing Director

International Emissions Trading Association

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/123-tfs2019-BWxRMIciAjAAWVIx.pdf'

Original File Name: IETA Comments on TFS.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 16:01:33

No Duplicates.

**Comment 121 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Rogerio

Last Name: Campos

Email Address: rogerio.mar.eng@hotmail.com

Affiliation: Director, Fdn for Env't and Water Roraima

Subject: Amapa supports the TFS

Comment:

Please find attached a letter of support from State of Roraima, Brazil for California's TFS.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/124-tfs2019-VCZUPVwvBzUKZVM+.jpeg'

Original File Name: RoraimaCALetter.jpeg

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 15:53:59

No Duplicates.

**Comment 122 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Roberio

Last Name: Nobre

Email Address: gabinete.sema.ap@gmail.com

Affiliation: Secretary of Env't Amapa Brazil

Subject: Support for California's TFS from Amapa Brazil

Comment:

Please find attached a letter of support for the TFS from Amapa Brazil.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/125-tfs2019-VzQCZQBzVHMFYgFe.pdf'

Original File Name: Carta Amapa CA.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 16:12:48

No Duplicates.

**Comment 123 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Gary

Last Name: Hughes

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Biofuelwatch

Subject: The Deficient CEQA Review Requires Rejection of CTFS

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/126-tfs2019-WGZVjJHZF03efUpL.zip'

Original File Name: CTFSpubliccomment\_BFW.zip

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 16:25:43

No Duplicates.



**Comment 124 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Jutta  
Last Name: Kill  
Email Address: juttakill@gmx.net  
Affiliation:

Subject: Submission regarding Consideration of Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest

Comment:

To whom it may concern,

please find in the attachment to this message my submission commenting on the consideration for endorsement by the California Air Resources Board of an updated California Tropical Forest Standard.

Sincerely,  
Jutta Kill

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/127-tfs2019-VzQBafU5U20BYgJs.pdf'

Original File Name: Comment to the California Air Resources Board on the 30 July 2019 version of the Tropical Forest Standard.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 16:28:39

No Duplicates.

**Comment 125 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Ignacio  
Last Name: Fernandez  
Email Address: ignacio.m.fernandez@sce.com  
Affiliation: Southern California Edison

Subject: Southern California Edison Letter of Support on Draft California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Mr. Jason Gray  
Branch Chief, Climate Change Program Evaluation Branch  
California Air Resources Board

Please find attached Southern California Edison's letter of support on Draft California Tropical Forest Standard.

Best regards,

Ignacio Fernandez  
Senior Advisor  
Air and Climate Policy  
Southern California Edison

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/128-tfs2019-UCMHYIYyAg4CcAJk.pdf'

Original File Name: SCE TFS letter Aug 29 2019.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 16:54:34

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 126 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Daniel

Last Name: Nepstad

Email Address: [dnepstad@earthinnovation.org](mailto:dnepstad@earthinnovation.org)

Affiliation: Earth Innovation Institute

Subject: Scientists urge endorsement of California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

We are 110 scientists-ecologists, economists, anthropologists, geographers, and climatologists. We are all directly involved with research to better understand climate change and to identify the best ways to avoid its most dangerous impacts. Many of us have spent decades working in the Tropics.

We include 10 lead authors of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change; 7 members of the United States National Academy of Sciences; 6 Fellows of the California Academy of Sciences; 1 member of the European Academy of Sciences; 1 member of the Australia National Academy of Sciences; 4 current or former Directors General of the Center for International Forestry Research; and 2 MacArthur "Genius Grant" fellows. We have collectively authored hundreds of articles in Science, Nature, and other top scientific journals.

We are writing to strongly urge the California Air Resources Board to endorse the California Tropical Forest Standard (CTFS). We believe that California has a unique opportunity to leverage its global leadership on climate policy to advance a broad and inclusive agenda to address climate change by protecting tropical forests at scale.

The message we convey in the attached letter is this: slowing the loss and speeding the recovery of tropical forests is a critical part of any successful global strategy for minimizing the negative impacts of climate change. The CTFS is an important step towards unlocking this potential.

Attachment: '[www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/129-tfs2019-VDECbVE5A34CdAlt.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/129-tfs2019-VDECbVE5A34CdAlt.pdf)'

Original File Name: EII.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 16:59:51

No Duplicates.

**Comment 127 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Paula

Last Name: Kahn

Email Address: pau.graciela@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: The CTFS does not guarantee reduction in carbon emissions

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/130-tfs2019-Vj1WMQNqBDkLI1cz.docx'

Original File Name: Kahn.docx

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 18:19:37

No Duplicates.

**Comment 128 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Abigail

Last Name: Grajales Cabrera

Email Address: grajales-05@hotmail.com

Affiliation: Congreso General de TCEW

Subject: Support for endorsement of California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/131-tfs2019-UTJdOlAjWH9QN1QL.pdf'

Original File Name: Carta TCEW TFS.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 18:24:09

No Duplicates.

**Comment 129 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Grace

Last Name: Malinao

Email Address: ms.jgrace@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: I am against the TFS Measure.

Comment:

I wholeheartedly am against the TFS Measure.

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 18:29:31

No Duplicates.

**Comment 130 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Dilyana

Last Name: Toteva

Email Address: Dilyana.valeva@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Protect our environment

Comment:

Please protect our environment - only we can stop this madness.

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 18:37:22

No Duplicates.

**Comment 131 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Joaquim

Last Name: Correa de Souza Belo

Email Address: belocns@gmail.com

Affiliation: CNS

Subject: Support for endorsement of California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/134-tfs2019-UjFWMVEiU3QAZ1QL.pdf'

Original File Name: Carta TFS CNS\_Amazonia\_Brazil.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 18:45:18

No Duplicates.



**Comment 132 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Brian

Last Name: Nowicki

Email Address: bnowicki@biologicaldiversity.org

Affiliation: Center for Biological Diversity

Subject: California Tropical Forest Standard -- Reject Endorsement

Comment:

Given the shortcomings of the TFS, and the failure of the EA to acknowledge that the TFS could have substantial negative impacts, the Center for Biological Diversity must respectfully urge the Board to reject endorsement of the proposed Tropical Forest Standard and to focus instead on developing policies that address the drivers of tropical deforestation.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/135-tfs2019-BjdTbFIMWDsCPAFc.pdf'

Original File Name: 19 08 29 CBD letter TFS w attachments.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 19:21:12

No Duplicates.

**Comment 133 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Bradley

Last Name: Angel

Email Address: greenaction@greenaction.org

Affiliation: Greenaction for Health & Environmental J

Subject: Opposition to California Tropical Forest Standard proposal

Comment:

Please see the attached comment letter from Greenaction for Health and Environmental Justice.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/136-tfs2019-AWZTJwFIUWcLYwRl.pdf'

Original File Name: Greenaction for Health and Environmental Justice comment letter to CARB August 29, 2019.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 20:28:41

No Duplicates.

**Comment 134 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Susanna

Last Name: Luong

Email Address: susa77aluong@hotmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: I do not approve of the TFS measure.

Comment:

I do not approve of the TFS measure

Corporations must be held responsible for pollution and damage of the environment. They must be fined and held accountable for their actions, and look to sustainable sources for production.

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 21:04:23

No Duplicates.

**Comment 135 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Michelle

Last Name: Chan

Email Address: mchan@foe.org

Affiliation:

Subject: 48 CA organizations in strong opposition to TFS

Comment:

Please find attached a comment letter on behalf of 48 organizations and 27 individuals strongly opposing the TFS. All organizations have a presence or work in California.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/138-tfs2019-W28HOQRaBTkDdwhv.pdf'

Original File Name: 48 org joint comment letter against TFS.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 21:08:56

No Duplicates.

**Comment 136 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Angela Maria  
Last Name: Feitosa Mendes  
Email Address: angelamfmendes@gmail.com  
Affiliation: Comite Chico Mendes

Subject: Endorse California TFS  
Comment:

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/139-tfs2019-WjldOlAjV3AKbQJd.pdf'

Original File Name: Carta TFS Comitê\_Chico\_Mendes\_Brazil.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 21:14:59

No Duplicates.

**Comment 137 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Lauren

Last Name: Withey

Email Address: [lwithey@berkeley.edu](mailto:lwithey@berkeley.edu)

Affiliation: UC Berkeley

Subject: TFS Concerns

Comment:

Please find attached my comments on CARB's proposed Tropical Forest Standard, based on my dissertation research on REDD+. Thank you for your consideration.

Attachment: '[www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/140-tfs2019-BXJcM1wpWGMCYQJ7.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/140-tfs2019-BXJcM1wpWGMCYQJ7.pdf)'

Original File Name: Withey\_TFS Letter\_Fall2019.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 21:13:16

No Duplicates.

**Comment 138 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Gustavo

Last Name: Sanchez

Email Address: svallegustavo@gmail.com

Affiliation: AMPB

Subject: Endorse California TFS

Comment:

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/141-tfs2019-AWIHYAR3WX4BZlQL.pdf'

Original File Name: CARTA AMPB APOYO ESTANDAR BOSQUES TROPICALES.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 21:38:39

No Duplicates.

**Comment 139 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Libby

Last Name: Blanchard

Email Address: blanchard.libby@gmail.com

Affiliation: Cambridge Conservation Research Institut

Subject: Recommendation to Not Endorse the Revised Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

(see attached PDF)

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/142-tfs2019-AGJVP1MzAD0GYwJq.pdf'

Original File Name: Blanchard Public Comment Letter on the Tropical Forest Standard.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 21:16:22

No Duplicates.



**Comment 140 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Michelle

Last Name: Chan

Email Address: mchan@foe.org

Affiliation:

Subject: 3108 CA residents in strong opposition to TFS

Comment:

Please find attached comments from 3108 Californians strongly urging CARB to reject the TFS.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/143-tfs2019-VmVWYQEwUToLUgFi.pdf'

Original File Name: 3108 comments against TFS.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 21:26:59

No Duplicates.

**Comment 141 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Tashka

Last Name: Yawanawa

Email Address: tashkayawa@gmail.com

Affiliation: Yawanawa Sociocultural Association

Subject: Support for endorsement of California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/144-tfs2019-UDNUM1wvACcLbFQL.pdf'

Original File Name: Carta TFS Yawanawa\_Amazonia\_Brazil.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 21:53:04

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 142 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Fred

Last Name: Granlund

Email Address: fgranlund@yahoo.com

Affiliation:

Subject: TFS2019

Comment:

As a California resident, I am writing to urge you not to endorse the California Tropical Forest Standard, and to ensure that these tropical forest offsets never are accepted into California's carbon trading system, or adopted by out-of-state entities like the International Commercial Aviation Organization (ICAO).

Carbon offsets allow big emitters in California to keep polluting, instead of reducing their carbon footprint. They perpetuate pollution hotspots and prevent California from taking real action on climate change. If the ICAO were to adopt tropical forest offsets, it would allow airline emissions to continue growing while putting tropical forests into the market over the protests of local communities. It would perpetuate pollution in California, while stealing lands - often through force and fraud - from Indigenous People and other rural communities in places like Brazil and Indonesia. This would be totally unacceptable.

Tropical forest carbon offsets lack integrity, pose unacceptably high risks of violating indigenous and human rights, and are impossible to police across national borders. California should not be encouraging them through the endorsement of the TFS.

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 22:14:39

No Duplicates.

**Comment 143 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Sandra

Last Name: Hise

Email Address: s\_hise\_02@yahoo.com

Affiliation:

Subject: #NOTFS

Comment:

No endorsement! Please vote against adopting TFS. Carbon offsets are not a viable solution. Pollutirs must be held accountable, and find ways to reduce pollution. Offsets DO NOT reduce, but ATTEMPT to counterbalance pollution. Reduction, not offsets, is what is required now. Thank you.

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 22:41:32

No Duplicates.

**Comment 144 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Tracey

Last Name: Osborne

Email Address: tracey.osborne@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: California's Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see statement attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/147-tfs2019-WzRcKQdkBztQJFc5.docx'

Original File Name: Osborne\_TFS\_Letter\_Aug29\_2019.docx

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 22:58:12

No Duplicates.

**Comment 145 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Tracey

Last Name: Osborne

Email Address: tracey.osborne@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: California's Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see statement attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/148-tfs2019-VDtcKVc0ADwBaQNm.docx'

Original File Name:

Osbone\_McAfee\_Haya\_Withey\_TFS\_Academic\_Letter\_Aug29\_2019.docx

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 23:01:01

No Duplicates.

**Comment 146 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Kathleen

Last Name: McAfee

Email Address: kmcafee@sfsu.edu

Affiliation: San Francisco State University

Subject: Haya, McAfee: Why the proposed TFS lacks environmental integrity

Comment:

B. Haya and K. McAfee: Why the proposed TFS lacks environmental integrity

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/149-tfs2019-UjpXMFYuBDZSCwBf.pdf'

Original File Name: Haya, McAfee comment to ARB on proposed TFS.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 22:56:43

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 147 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Ken

Last Name: Jones

Email Address: meta4ken350@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Strongly Opposed to Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

I am the Clean Energy Lead with 350 Bay Area and we have been involved in trying to set a cap on GHG emissions from refineries in the Bay Area through our advocacy at the Bay Area Air Quality Management District for many years and we work on energy issues as a party in rule-makings at the CPUC. We are active on legislation that appears every year that refines the state's climate goals. So I am familiar with the issue of offsets and how they are currently being used in the state's cap and trade system which is not yet coming close to achieving our part of getting us where the planet needs to be by 2030. Free allowances are a big part of the problem.

I am strongly opposed to having the Tropical Forest Standard added into the mix of tools as it will only succeed in making fossil fuel companies or other emitters hide their real pollution that is affecting our communities here in California. They need to be incentivized to not emit what they do in the location they do it. It is an imaginary trade-off of possible carbon sequestration from forests that someone believed would eventually be cut down when there are no guarantees that either that was going to happen or would be kept from happening as there are no real ways to enforce it over time. Look at the ways the rainforest is burning now, how these fires were started. And we know we need to decrease emissions from the source. There have been no studies done that prove these offsets could or have ever done anything to decrease emissions. It would be giving any emitter a way to continue doing what they are emitting while not considering the rights of indigenous people who live in balance with nature in these forests while providing no incentive for them to stop their practices in our state.

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 22:36:58

No Duplicates.



**Comment 148 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Tim

Last Name: Hayden

Email Address: thayden@yuroktribe.nsn.us

Affiliation: Yurok Tribe

Subject: Yurok Tribe comment letter on CARB Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

The Yurok Tribe respectfully recommends the CARB formally endorse the Tropical Forest Standard (TFS).

On behalf of the Yurok Tribe, I submit the attached detailed written comments for consideration by the CARB.

Thank you.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/152-tfs2019-UDZSPQRrAzEBa1AP.pdf'

Original File Name: FINAL Yurok Tribe TFS comment letter\_082919\_signed.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-29 23:29:35

No Duplicates.

**Comment 149 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Brian

Last Name: Nowicki

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Center for Biological Diversity

Subject: Tropical Forest Standard - Request for Postponement

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/155-tfs2019-UjxXPIEnVG5XMlc8.pdf'

Original File Name: Nowicki.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-30 08:16:18

No Duplicates.

**Comment 150 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Sanjay

Last Name: Garla

Email Address: sanjay.garla@seiu-usww.org

Affiliation: SEIU-USWW

Subject: Comments on CTFS

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/156-tfs2019-AmVUM1YlBzhWMVJ8.pdf'

Original File Name: Garla.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-30 08:17:49

No Duplicates.

**Comment 151 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Alexis

Last Name: Fineman

Email Address: a.n.fineman@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Comments on the Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/157-tfs2019-AGZTPAdoBzEDaFMy.pdf'

Original File Name: Fineman.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-30 08:20:18

No Duplicates.

**Comment 152 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Betsy

Last Name: Beymer-Farris

Email Address: bbeymer-farris@uky.edu

Affiliation: University of Kentucky

Subject: Public Comment for Carbon Forestry Policies in California's Tropical Forest Standard  
Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/158-tfs2019-UzFSMVwkWGZXNAZ0.pdf'

Original File Name: Beymer Farris.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-30 08:27:50

No Duplicates.

**Comment 153 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Leslie

Last Name: Durschinger

Email Address: leslie.durschinger@terraglobalcapital.com

Affiliation: Terra Global Capital

Subject: Letter of Support on California's Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

We look forward to California's Tropical Forest Standard moving to the next round and supporting CARB in the process of creating a strong standard that will protect our communities and forests.

Thank you

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/159-tfs2019-VjJRIIAjBSUFYAZu.pdf'

Original File Name: Durschinger.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-30 08:34:19

No Duplicates.

**Comment 154 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Norman

Last Name: Jiwan

Email Address: normanjiwan@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Comments on 2018 Proposed Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/160-tfs2019-B20FagB2VWcAaAkn.pdf'

Original File Name: Jiwan.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-30 08:38:34

No Duplicates.

**Comment 155 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Cynthia

Last Name: Mellon

Email Address: [cynthia@climatejusticealliance.org](mailto:cynthia@climatejusticealliance.org)

Affiliation: Climate Justice Alliance

Subject: Reject Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: '[www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/161-tfs2019-WzYHZF0wVWoDagNt.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/161-tfs2019-WzYHZF0wVWoDagNt.pdf)'

Original File Name: Mellon.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-30 08:40:26

No Duplicates.



**Comment 156 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Erica Meta

Last Name: Smith

Email Address: ericametasmith@gmail.com

Affiliation: Registered Professional Forester

Subject: Letter of Support for the Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/162-tfs2019-USIGbQNrVnFWOAgm.pdf'

Original File Name: Smith.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-30 08:41:17

No Duplicates.

**Comment 157 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Larry

Last Name: Lohmann

Email Address: larrylohmann@gn.apc.org

Affiliation:

Subject: Comments on Endorsement of TFS

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/163-tfs2019-WzdROAduVWsBZlU7.pdf'

Original File Name: Lohmann.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-30 08:48:17

No Duplicates.

**Comment 158 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Christie

Last Name: Pollet-Young

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: SCS Global Services

Subject: Tropical Forest Standard Comments

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/165-tfs2019-BXZUMVEjUFwAcgJk.pdf'

Original File Name: SCS\_TFS\_Comments\_082919.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-08-30 13:55:07

No Duplicates.

**Comment 159 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Michelle

Last Name: Chan

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Friends of the Earth

Subject: LATE Letter from CA organizations Opposing TFS

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/167-tfs2019-BWNVPF05BHIWIAVh.pdf'

Original File Name: foe.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-09-17 13:05:09

No Duplicates.

**Comment 160 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Peter

Last Name: Seligmann

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Conservation International

Subject: LATE Comments on TFS2019

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/168-tfs2019-UiEBYIE8VG4DYgJv.pdf'

Original File Name: Seligmann.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-09-17 13:09:54

No Duplicates.

**Comment 161 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Bob

Last Name: Fisher

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Conservation International

Subject: LATE Comments on TFS2019

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/169-tfs2019-VzFTPANxUGsEZ1Ai.pdf'

Original File Name: Fisher.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-09-17 13:10:41

No Duplicates.

**Comment 162 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Rachel

Last Name: Rovine

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: LATE Reject pay-to-pollute schemes - we need REAL climate Solutions!

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/170-tfs2019-AGZROAR3BTsEblUw.pdf'

Original File Name: Formletter.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-09-18 11:22:55

5000 Duplicates.

**Comment 163 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Jan

Last Name: Warren

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: LATE Comments on Agenda Item 19-8-6

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/171-tfs2019-VCNWMVUmWHIXNAJs.pdf'

Original File Name: Warren.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-09-18 12:46:00

No Duplicates.



**Comment 1 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Bob

Last Name: Fisher

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Conservation International

Subject: Comments on Updated California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/172-tfs2019-VjBUOwZ0BzwDYAZ0.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/172-tfs2019-VjBUOwZ0BzwDYAZ0.pdf)

Original File Name: Fisher.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-09-20 15:34:52

No Duplicates.

**Comment 2 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Peter

Last Name: Seligmann

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Conservation International

Subject: Comments on Updated California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/174-tfs2019-VCdRMgRpAzkLalQ5.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/174-tfs2019-VCdRMgRpAzkLalQ5.pdf)

Original File Name: Seligmann.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-09-20 15:37:53

No Duplicates.

**Comment 3 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019). (At Hearing)**

First Name: John

Last Name: Swift

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Swift Subtropicals

Subject: Comments on Updated California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/175-tfs2019-BnVTIII6VGFSIAMt.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/175-tfs2019-BnVTIII6VGFSIAMt.pdf)

Original File Name: Swift.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-09-20 15:38:20

No Duplicates.

**Comment 4 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Eldo

Last Name: Carlos Gomes Barbosa

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: OPIAC

Subject: Comments on Updated California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/176-tfs2019-AHNSPFQ0WGVXNAJs.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/176-tfs2019-AHNSPFQ0WGVXNAJs.pdf)

Original File Name: Shanenawa.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-09-20 15:39:04

No Duplicates.

**Comment 5 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Angela

Last Name: Mendes

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: Comments on Updated California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/177-tfs2019-VjtdPgRrVWJWNQJx.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/177-tfs2019-VjtdPgRrVWJWNQJx.pdf)

Original File Name: Mendes.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-09-20 15:40:01

No Duplicates.

**Comment 6 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Gary

Last Name: Hughes

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: BioFuelWatch

Subject: Comments on Updated California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/178-tfs2019-AWkHdARiAzgHZANw.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/178-tfs2019-AWkHdARiAzgHZANw.pdf)

Original File Name: Hughes.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-09-20 15:41:41

No Duplicates.

**Comment 7 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Julie

Last Name: Messais

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: GCF Brazil

Subject: Comments on Updated California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/179-tfs2019-BmtcPwByBSUBZgRt.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/179-tfs2019-BmtcPwByBSUBZgRt.pdf)

Original File Name: Messaias.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-09-20 15:49:16

No Duplicates.

**Comment 8 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Eric

Last Name: Knauft

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: EDF

Subject: Comments on Updated California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/180-tfs2019-UTpQOFExAiQCYgVx.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/180-tfs2019-UTpQOFExAiQCYgVx.pdf)

Original File Name: Knauft.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-09-20 15:50:01

No Duplicates.



**Comment 9 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Jacquim

Last Name: Yawanawa

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: Comments on Updated California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/181-tfs2019-UCkBZlchBDZVPVc2.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/181-tfs2019-UCkBZlchBDZVPVc2.pdf)

Original File Name: Yawanawa.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-09-20 15:50:36

No Duplicates.

**Comment 10 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Muriel

Last Name: Strand

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Ecological Engineering

Subject: Comments on Updated California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/182-tfs2019-VSZcLgd0BDYFbQlt.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/182-tfs2019-VSZcLgd0BDYFbQlt.pdf)

Original File Name: Strand.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-09-20 15:51:17

No Duplicates.

**Comment 11 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Jonah

Last Name: Busch

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: EII

Subject: Comments on Updated California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/183-tfs2019-VTcCcQByUGAEagMt.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/183-tfs2019-VTcCcQByUGAEagMt.pdf)

Original File Name: Busch.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-09-20 15:52:40

No Duplicates.

**Comment 12 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Joanna

Last Name: Durbin

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Conservation International

Subject: Comments on Updated California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/184-tfs2019-B2MFdIYIVGUAb1c5.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/184-tfs2019-B2MFdIYIVGUAb1c5.pdf)

Original File Name: Durbin.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-09-20 15:53:27

No Duplicates.

**Comment 13 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Tamra

Last Name: Gilbertson

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Indigenous Environmental Network

Subject: Comments on Updated California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/185-tfs2019-UzRdMgZrVmcLaFQm.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/185-tfs2019-UzRdMgZrVmcLaFQm.pdf)

Original File Name: Gilbertson.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-09-20 15:54:07

No Duplicates.

**Comment 14 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019). (At Hearing)**

First Name: William

Last Name: Quinn

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: CA Council for Environmental and Economi

Subject: Comments on Updated California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/186-tfs2019-USBXJFE5VGkCagIs.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/186-tfs2019-USBXJFE5VGkCagIs.pdf)

Original File Name: quinn.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-09-20 15:54:49

No Duplicates.

**Comment 15 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Jutta

Last Name: Kill

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: WRM

Subject: Comments on Updated California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/187-tfs2019-Bm1dMl0wUW4GLlcn.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/187-tfs2019-Bm1dMl0wUW4GLlcn.pdf)

Original File Name: Kill.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-09-20 15:55:31

No Duplicates.

**Comment 16 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Rafel Robles

Last Name: de Benitez

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: Comments on Updated California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/188-tfs2019-B2UBYl0yU2kGdFUw.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/188-tfs2019-B2UBYl0yU2kGdFUw.pdf)

Original File Name: Benitez.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-09-20 15:56:14

No Duplicates.



**Comment 17 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Loretta

Last Name: Moreno

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: Comments on Updated California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/190-tfs2019-Uj8AaQd0WG5XPwlm.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/190-tfs2019-Uj8AaQd0WG5XPwlm.pdf)

Original File Name: Moreno.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-09-20 15:57:20

No Duplicates.

**Comment 18 for Consider Endorsement of an Updated California Tropical Forest Standard (tfs2019). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Laura

Last Name: Bautista

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: Comments on Updated California Tropical Forest Standard

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/191-tfs2019-UjBdOgdzVHNVOgFy.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/191-tfs2019-UjBdOgdzVHNVOgFy.pdf)

Original File Name: Bautista.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-09-20 15:58:08

No Duplicates.