

**Comment 1 for Public Webinar: Meeting California's Carbon Neutrality Goals: Approaches for the Industrial Sector (cn-industry-web-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Steven

Last Name: Brink

Email Address: steveb@calforests.org

Affiliation: California Forestry Association

Subject: Comments on: Meeting California's Carbon Neutrality Goals

Comment:

&#61607; CARB Q:What other programs administered by CARB could be leveraged or adjusted

to support further emissions reductions in the industrial sector?

A:Dramatically increase funding for the FARMER Program.

&#61607; CARB Q:What hurdles does California face for decarbonizing the industrial sector?

A: An "all-electric" approach is not practical for much of the rural counties in CA. It's just too far to a sufficient and efficient set of recharging stations.

CARB Q:How can CARB help overcome these hurdles?

A: Focus on what's practical and incentivize off-road and some rural on-road equipment (FARMER Program) to have latest emission technology.

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2020-02-20 10:16:02

No Duplicates.

**Comment 2 for Public Webinar: Meeting California's Carbon Neutrality Goals: Approaches for the Industrial Sector (cn-industry-web-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Neil

Last Name: Tangri

Email Address: tangri@alumni.stanford.edu

Affiliation:

Subject: Feedback on webinar

Comment:

Overall, the webinar was helpful and informative. However, too little attention was paid to technical issues. The emphasis was on policy approaches to encourage decarbonization in the industrial sector. There was little discussion of the challenges to this decarbonization and only one slide mentioned (without any detail or discussion) what decarbonization actually looks like. I believe that understanding the technologies available or in the pipeline, the challenges to their implementation, and their co-benefits, is a prerequisite for good policymaking. I would suggest devoting more time to the technical aspects. The policy approaches implemented in other jurisdictions could be cut to make time; it was interesting but not critical.

There is one technical aspect in particular that should have been explored. It is highly controversial yet seems embedded in many of the technical approaches: the carbon neutrality of biomass. This is worth a full discussion on its own.

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2020-02-20 14:43:04

No Duplicates.

**Comment 3 for Public Webinar: Meeting California's Carbon Neutrality Goals: Approaches for the Industrial Sector (cn-industry-web-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Tom

Last Name: Vessels

Email Address: [tvessels@vesselscoalgas.com](mailto:tvessels@vesselscoalgas.com)

Affiliation: Vessels Carbon Solutions Inc.

Subject: Carbon Neutrality

Comment:

We recommend California ARB adopt IPCC AR5 20 year GWP for greenhouse gases and include emissions of Black Carbon from open field burning (forest and brush fires). If CARB broke from the UNFCCC Politically motivated and negotiated standards and follow the scientific consensus of IPCC it would have a profound impact on the Community and drive adoption of more recent Scientific findings.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/3-cn-industry-web-ws-UiVcMgZ+BQIVPgVg.pdf>

Original File Name: Why Methane 2.0ARB.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2020-02-27 11:20:04

No Duplicates.

**Comment 4 for Public Webinar: Meeting California's Carbon Neutrality Goals: Approaches for the Industrial Sector (cn-industry-web-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Thomas

Last Name: Vessels

Email Address: [tvessels@vesselscoalgas.com](mailto:tvessels@vesselscoalgas.com)

Affiliation: Vessels Carbon Solutions Inc.

Subject: Carbon Neutrality

Comment:

Additional information. Comparing effect of methane emission capture compared to forestry sequestration and auto emissions.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/4-cn-industry-web-ws-BWRUIFIxU19QNQFu.pdf>

Original File Name: ARB Colorado AMM Project.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2020-02-27 12:08:50

No Duplicates.

**Comment 5 for Public Webinar: Meeting California's Carbon Neutrality Goals: Approaches for the Industrial Sector (cn-industry-web-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Sam

Last Name: Wade

Email Address: sam@rngcoalition.com

Affiliation: Renewable Natural Gas Coalition

Subject: Comments on Feb 20 Industrial Decarbonization Webinar

Comment:

Attached please find our comments on the February 20, 2020 webinar entitled "Meeting California's Carbon Neutrality Goals: Approaches for the Industrial Sector."

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/5-cn-industry-web-ws-BzUGMFRIIVzdVY1Ri.pdf>

Original File Name: 200306 RNGC Comments on GHG Reductions in the Industrial Sector FINAL.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2020-03-06 10:25:53

No Duplicates.

**Comment 6 for Public Webinar: Meeting California's Carbon Neutrality Goals: Approaches for the Industrial Sector (cn-industry-web-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Fariya

Last Name: Ali

Email Address: fariya.ali@pge.com

Affiliation:

Subject: PG&E and SoCalGas 2-20-20 Workshop Comments

Comment:

See attached.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/6-cn-industry-web-ws-VjVWMVQnVGUFbFc5.pdf>

Original File Name: Carbon Neutrality Comments\_PGE-SCG\_3-6-20.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2020-03-06 12:24:40

No Duplicates.

**Comment 7 for Public Webinar: Meeting California's Carbon Neutrality Goals: Approaches for the Industrial Sector (cn-industry-web-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Kathleen

Last Name: Brundage

Email Address: [kathleen.brundage@californiasteel.com](mailto:kathleen.brundage@californiasteel.com)

Affiliation: California Steel Industries, Inc.

Subject: Comments on CARB Concepts for GHG Reduction in Industrial Sectors

Comment:

We appreciate the opportunity to provide comments regarding the information provided in the February webinar on potential strategies for the industrial sector in meeting California's Carbon Neutrality Goals. We look forward to furthering our discussions on this matter.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/7-cn-industry-web-ws-AmFVMgRpUmhWNgBv.pdf>

Original File Name: California Steel - GHG In Industrial Sectors - Comments.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2020-03-06 14:26:11

No Duplicates.

**Comment 8 for Public Webinar: Meeting California's Carbon Neutrality Goals: Approaches for the Industrial Sector (cn-industry-web-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: John

Last Name: Larrea

Email Address: john@clfp.com

Affiliation: California League of Food Producers

Subject: CLFP comments on Carbon Neutrality Goals

Comment:

Q: What other programs administered by CARB could be leveraged or adjusted to support further emissions reductions in the industrial sector?

One of the most innovative programs has been the Food Production Investment Program (FPIP). Focused solely on CO2 reductions, this program should become the model for all industrial incentive programs going forward if the state expects to meet its emission reduction goals. CARB should advocate for continuous funding for FPIP.

Q: What hurdles does California face for decarbonizing the industrial sector? How can CARB help to overcome these hurdles? Lack of new or emerging technologies prevent additional significant gains in emissions reductions for food processors. Additional research into the current status of available technologies and emerging technologies for industrial food processors needs to be funded. For instance, understanding the availability of technologies will allow for a fine tuning of the emission reductions on a sector by sector basis under the cap-and-trade regulation.

Bottom line, more incentives/grants for industrial food processors will be needed if additional significant reductions are expected.

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2020-03-06 16:06:36

No Duplicates.

**Comment 9 for Public Webinar: Meeting California's Carbon Neutrality Goals: Approaches for the Industrial Sector (cn-industry-web-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Tiffany

Last Name: Roberts

Email Address: [troberts@wspa.org](mailto:troberts@wspa.org)

Affiliation: Western States Petroleum Association

Subject: Western States Petroleum Association Comment Letter

Comment:

Attached please find our comment letter on "Meeting California's Carbon Neutrality Goals: Approaches for the Industrial Sector."

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/9-cn-industry-web-ws-WyxUIV0sBDYBWANg.pdf>

Original File Name: WSPA Comment Letter\_Carbon Neutrality\_Industrial Webinar 3.6.20.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2020-03-06 16:58:00

No Duplicates.

**Comment 10 for Public Webinar: Meeting California's Carbon Neutrality Goals: Approaches for the Industrial Sector (cn-industry-web-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Gary  
Last Name: Aguinaga  
Email Address: gaguinaga@tnrenewableenergy.com  
Affiliation: TNRE

Subject: Comments  
Comment:

See attached.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/10-cn-industry-web-ws-UiZTOwR3BDIFXAZl.pdf>

Original File Name: TNRE\_CARB March 6 Comments Industrial\_Final.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2020-03-10 07:56:09

No Duplicates.

**Comment 11 for Public Webinar: Meeting California's Carbon Neutrality Goals: Approaches for the Industrial Sector (cn-industry-web-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Emanuel  
Last Name: Wagner  
Email Address: [ombcomm@arb.ca.gov](mailto:ombcomm@arb.ca.gov)  
Affiliation: CHBC

Subject: Comments  
Comment:

See attached.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/11-cn-industry-web-ws-VzRTPVAzBTUFXAdk.pdf>

Original File Name:  
[CHBC\\_CARB\\_IndustrialEmissions\\_TechnicalWorkshop\\_Comments\\_Final.pdf](#)

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2020-03-10 07:59:26

No Duplicates.

**Comment 12 for Public Webinar: Meeting California's Carbon Neutrality Goals: Approaches for the Industrial Sector (cn-industry-web-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Rock

Last Name: Zierman

Email Address: [ombcomm@arb.ca.gov](mailto:ombcomm@arb.ca.gov)

Affiliation: CIPA

Subject: Comments on February 20,2020 Webinar

Comment:

See attached.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/12-cn-industry-web-ws-AWJdMl0sUmABWAZl.pdf>

Original File Name: CIPA Carbon Neutral CARB Webinar Comments.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2020-03-26 15:22:29

No Duplicates.

**Comment 13 for Public Webinar: Meeting California's Carbon Neutrality Goals: Approaches for the Industrial Sector (cn-industry-web-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Bob

Last Name: Houston

Email Address: laura@houstonmagnani.com

Affiliation: CSCME

Subject: : CSCME Submittal - California's Carbon Neutrality Goals: Approaches

Comment:

See attached.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/13-cn-industry-web-ws-W24GLVVI2RRegIw.pdf>

Original File Name: 5-14-2020 CSCME.CarbonNeutralityComments revision 1.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2020-05-15 08:28:56

No Duplicates.

**Comment 14 for Public Webinar: Meeting California's Carbon Neutrality Goals: Approaches for the Industrial Sector (cn-industry-web-ws) - 2nd Workshop.**

First Name: Barbara

Last Name: McBride

Email Address: [ombcomm@arb.ca.gov](mailto:ombcomm@arb.ca.gov)

Affiliation:

Subject: C&T letter

Comment:

See attached.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/14-cn-industry-web-ws-VDcBZgZ1UGE BWFAz.pdf>

Original File Name: CARB C&T Letter\_20Jul2020\_FINAL.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2020-07-21 08:09:26

No Duplicates.

**Comment 15 for Public Webinar: Meeting California's Carbon Neutrality Goals: Approaches for the Industrial Sector (cn-industry-web-ws) - 2nd Workshop.**

First Name: Urban

Last Name: Paul

Email Address: [ombcomm@arb.ca.gov](mailto:ombcomm@arb.ca.gov)

Affiliation: California Resources Corp

Subject: Comment

Comment:

See attached.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/15-cn-industry-web-ws-VjVdKVY0VVIQNQBf.pdf>

Original File Name: CRC\_C&T\_Comments (1).pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2020-08-05 14:00:08

No Duplicates.

**There are no comments posted to Public Webinar: Meeting California's Carbon Neutrality Goals: Approaches for the Industrial Sector (cn-industry-web-ws) that were presented during the Workshop at this time.**