

**Comment 1 for Public Workshop: 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Public Health (sp22-publichealth-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Holly

Last Name: Kaufman

Email Address: hollykaufman@yahoo.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Comments

Comment:

See attached comments.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/4-sp22-publichealth-ws-WzhWP1Q4UW9XNAVr.docx](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/4-sp22-publichealth-ws-WzhWP1Q4UW9XNAVr.docx)

Original File Name: comments.docx

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-02-15 12:56:14

No Duplicates.

**Comment 2 for Public Workshop: 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Public Health (sp22-publichealth-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Manijeh

Last Name: Berenji

Email Address: manijehberenji@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Let's Improve the Scoping Plan!

Comment:

Please see my word document for my comments. Thank you! Manijeh  
Berenji MD MPH FACOEM

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/5-sp22-publichealth-ws-UzBSNVQnUmMDWgNg.docx](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/5-sp22-publichealth-ws-UzBSNVQnUmMDWgNg.docx)

Original File Name: CARB Comments\_2-15-22.docx

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-02-15 13:46:31

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 3 for Public Workshop: 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Public Health (sp22-publichealth-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Jerry

Last Name: Tobe

Email Address: tagchai@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: The 2022 Scoping Plan

Comment:

CARB and the public may find very useful a report that objectively and forthrightly presents what the 2017 Scoping Plan led to being done, what failed to be implemented and why as well as which implemented plans produce the expected results, which implemented plans came up short and why/how.

I hope CARB has the same appreciation

- for the tension between producing a scoping plan that is more likely to result in better outcomes for the vast majority of people living in California and a plan that may have a more negative affect on time, money, other resources, and good will

that it has

- for the tension between producing a scoping plan quickly and taking time to produce a plan more likely to result in better outcomes for the vast majority of people living in California. May you chose to do ONLY that which is truly best for the vast majority of people living in California in the 2022 scoping plan cycle.

There appears to be a conflict of interest between the billions of dollars the oil and gas industry contribute to the State's treasury plus the oil and gas industry's 2% contribution to California's economy and doing that which is truly best for Californians and the world.

Choosing to do whatever it takes to for the oil and gas industry to preserve its current business model instead of transitioning to a business model that is truly best for a vast majority of people contributes to the conflict.

The oil and gas industry fights for acceptance of its climate change solutions - cap and trade, net zero by 2050, production of gray and blue hydrogen, carbon dioxide sequestration, which are all design to continue its polluting extraction business model.

A 2011 study out of Cornell University found [methane] leakage of [1.4] to 3.9 percent of produced gas per well, and up to 8 percent - [https://www.gem.wiki/Fracking\\_and\\_clMethane](https://www.gem.wiki/Fracking_and_clMethane), also known as natural gas, is pumped out of the region's wells and captured for use, but the satellite analysis has shown they are also inadvertently leaking 3.7 per cent of that gas into the atmosphere.

The leakage rate is more than twice that assumed by the US Environmental Protection Agency, well above the average 1.9 per cent for 11 other major US basins, and higher than that recorded in any US oil and gas field before -

<https://www.newscientist.com/article/2241347-fracking-wells-in-the-us-are-leaking-loads-of-planet-warming-methane/#ixzz7L1wG5iZi>imate\_change#:~:text=concerning%20fracking%20regulations.-,2011%20Cornell%20study,than%20conventional%20natural%20gas%20wells.

Seen From Space: Huge Methane Leaks -

<https://www.nytimes.com/2022/02/04/climate/methane-leaks-satellites.html#:~:text=These%20methods%20can%20be%20revealing,We%20Made%20It%20Visible.>

"Among the nearly 400 million tons of human-linked methane emissions every year, oil and gas production is estimated to account for about one-third. And unlike carbon dioxide, which is released when fossil fuels are deliberately burned for energy, much of the methane from oil and gas is either intentionally released or accidentally leaked from wells, pipelines and production facilities.", which is more than 133 million tons of methane that the oil and gas industry leaks annually. CARB can incentivize the oil and gas industry to capture much of that methane and convert it to clean hydrogen and clean carbon black (refer to the "A Decarbonization Win-Win That Produces Clean Hydrogen And Clean Carbon Black" article that follows

A Decarbonization Win-Win That Produces Clean Hydrogen And Clean Carbon Black -

<https://www.forbes.com/sites/mitsubishiheavyindustries/2021/10/22/a-decarbonization-win-win-that-produces-clean-hydrogen-and-clean-carbon-black/?sh=5ee9b41b2f14>

This is an alternative to the hydrogen that the oil and gas industry is producing/proposes to produce and it doesn't require CO2 sequestration. Labs around the world are developing processes that convert methane to hydrogen and solid carbon more efficiently and processes that don't use rare earth metals. You may find a subscription to the International Journal of Hydrogen Energy - Official Journal of the International Association for Hydrogen Energy -

<https://www.journals.elsevier.com/international-journal-of-hydrogen-energy> useful/informative.

Agriculture biomass generators, while creating their own problems, may be a way to reduce agricultural methane emissions while producing hydrogen and solid carbon.

Regarding processing forest undergrowth (You referred to it as forest waste), it seems to me that most forest undergrowth can be shredded using industrial shredders/wood chippers powered by GREEN hydrogen, turning the undergrowth into compost (biomass generators?), capturing any methane produced by the composting process, and converting the methane into hydrogen and solid carbon. Selling the compost, hydrogen and solid carbon may defray some costs.

A lab (I can't find the article) has developed a method for converting CO2 emissions to carbon black and some environmentally

safe byproducts. It is projecting commercialization by 2025. The lab claims it's working on a version that will work in industrial settings.

In Summary

May you make the time to build/use models based on health outcomes. One rational being that using health outcomes as the bases for modeling effectively addresses the most significant causes and quantities of climate change while effectively addressing the most health impacted populations. The larger the population of health individuals the more productive the society, the less societal burden, the better educational outcomes, and the more desirable the workforce.

May you do an objective, forthright, thorough analysis of earlier scoping planning cycles to determine what did and didn't work, why, and how to improve.

May CARB not be swayed by fossil fuel industry talking points/campaigns.

May you successfully apply the latest technology.

May you do ONLY that which is truly best for the environment and the vast majority of people living in California and cause those people as little harm as humanly possible.

Thank you for reading my message

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-02-16 04:30:17

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 4 for Public Workshop: 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Public Health (sp22-publichealth-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Jerry

Last Name: Tobe

Email Address: tagchai@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: UC researchers omit key evidence in study on massive tree cutting in Sierra forests

Comment:

To Whom It May Concern,

I'm not qualified to perform a peer-to-peer review of Dr. North's et.al. "Operational resilience in western US frequent-fire forests"

-

<https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/abs/pii/S0378112721010975?dgcid=author#f0005>.

However Dr. Hanson (UC researchers omit key evidence in study on massive tree cutting in Sierra forests BY CHAD HANSON FEBRUARY 15, 2022 12:35 PM -

<https://www.fresnobee.com/opinion/readers-opinion/article258425303.html#storylink=cpy>

) seems to be qualified to peer review Dr. North's work.

My concern is that CARB may be using Dr. North's work in developing the scoping plan. Please read Dr. Hanson's piece in the Fresno Bee and possibly his book "Smokescreen: Debunking Wildfire Myths to Save Our Forests and Our Climate". I haven't read the book.

I can't say my suggestion for managing undergrowth "forest waste" (feeding the undergrowth into a wood chipper [2018 SERIES (18 IN.)

DISK CHIPPERS -

<https://www.stumpcutters.com/wood-chippers/2018-series-18-disk-chippers/>], turn the wood chips into compost using biomass generators, turn the methane captured from the biomass generators into hydrogen and solid carbon, then sell the compost, hydrogen and carbon) is any better. Some compost could also be put back on the forest floor where it would have been if everything had gone through the natural cycle.

To Whom It May Concern,

I'm not qualified to perform a peer-to-peer review of Dr. North's et.al. "Operational resilience in western US frequent-fire forests"

-

<https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/abs/pii/S0378112721010975?dgcid=author#f0005>.

However Dr. Hanson (UC researchers omit key evidence in study on massive tree cutting in Sierra forests BY CHAD HANSON FEBRUARY 15, 2022 12:35 PM -

<https://www.fresnobee.com/opinion/readers-opinion/article258425303.html#storylink=cpy>

) seems to be qualified to peer review Dr. North's work.

My concern is that CARB may be using Dr. North's work in developing the scoping plan. Please read Dr. Hanson's piece in the Fresno Bee and possibly his book "Smokescreen: Debunking Wildfire Myths to Save Our Forests and Our Climate". I haven't read the book.

I can't say my suggestion for managing undergrowth "forest waste"  
(feeding the undergrowth into a wood chipper [2018 SERIES (18 IN.)  
DISK CHIPPERS -  
<https://www.stumpcutters.com/wood-chippers/2018-series-18-disk-chippers/>],  
turn the wood chips into compost using biomass generators, turn the  
methane captured from the biomass generators into hydrogen and  
solid carbon, then sell the compost, hydrogen and carbon) is any  
better. Some compost could also be put back on the forest floor  
where it would have been if everything had gone through the natural  
cycle.

Thank you for reading my message.

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-02-17 12:18:52

No Duplicates.

**Comment 5 for Public Workshop: 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Public Health (sp22-publichealth-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Muriel

Last Name: Strand

Email Address: ecoengr@comcast.net

Affiliation:

Subject: comments on 2022 scoping plan public health workshop

Comment:

please find my comments attached

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/8-sp22-publichealth-ws-WyhTNII8WXoHaFQ6.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/8-sp22-publichealth-ws-WyhTNII8WXoHaFQ6.pdf)

Original File Name: Scoping Plan public health workshop.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-03-03 11:57:13

No Duplicates.



**Comment 6 for Public Workshop: 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Public Health (sp22-publichealth-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Wendy

Last Name: Ring

Email Address: wendy@climate911.org

Affiliation:

Subject: Comments on Scoping Public Health Workshop

Comment:

see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/9-sp22-publichealth-ws-WyhSNIMNBGQFMQNc.doc](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/9-sp22-publichealth-ws-WyhSNIMNBGQFMQNc.doc)

Original File Name: sb 32 public health workshop comment.doc

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-03-06 18:07:12

No Duplicates.

**Comment 7 for Public Workshop: 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Public Health (sp22-publichealth-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Mariela

Last Name: Ruacho

Email Address: mariela.ruacho@lung.org

Affiliation: American Lung Association

Subject: Health Group Comment Letter on Scoping Plan Health Analysis

Comment:

Please see attached letter from our health group. Thank you.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/10-sp22-publichealth-ws-VDwBYgBgV2hVJwNr.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/10-sp22-publichealth-ws-VDwBYgBgV2hVJwNr.pdf)

Original File Name: Health Group Comments on the Scoping Plan – Health Analysis (2).pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-03-07 11:39:47

No Duplicates.

**Comment 8 for Public Workshop: 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Public Health (sp22-publichealth-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Jayne

Last Name: Parker

Email Address: jayne.parker@pge.com

Affiliation:

Subject: PG&E Comments on CARB's Scoping Plan Update Workshop - Public Health  
Comment:

Letter attached, thank you.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/11-sp22-publichealth-ws-B3dTIF0+VGtRPlc0.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/11-sp22-publichealth-ws-B3dTIF0+VGtRPlc0.pdf)

Original File Name: Public Health Scoping Plan Workshop Comments 0307.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-03-07 15:46:51

No Duplicates.

**Comment 9 for Public Workshop: 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Public Health (sp22-publichealth-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Michael

Last Name: Boccadoro

Email Address: mboccadoro@westcoastadvisors.com

Affiliation: Dairy Cares

Subject: Dairy Cares Comments on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update Public Health Workshop  
Comment:

Please see comments attached. Thank you!

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/12-sp22-publichealth-ws-UjYCZVQ8V3ZXKFUK.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/12-sp22-publichealth-ws-UjYCZVQ8V3ZXKFUK.pdf)

Original File Name: Dairy Cares Comments on 2022 Scoping Plan Update Public Health Workshop 220307 (00571179xBA8E1).pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-03-07 15:54:41

No Duplicates.

**Comment 10 for Public Workshop: 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Public Health (sp22-publichealth-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Ignacio

Last Name: Fernandez

Email Address: ignacio.m.fernandez@sce.com

Affiliation: Southern California Edison

Subject: SCE comments on AB 32 2022 Scoping Plan Update Public Health Workshop  
Comment:

Dear Sir/Madam,

Please find attached Southern California Edison's comments on AB 32 2022 Scoping Plan Update Public Health Workshop that took place on February 15, 2022.

Best regards

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/13-sp22-publichealth-ws-WyhWM1QwAw8EYQRr.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/13-sp22-publichealth-ws-WyhWM1QwAw8EYQRr.pdf)

Original File Name: SCE\_comments\_SPU\_Public\_Health\_20220215.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-03-07 16:13:46

No Duplicates.

**Comment 11 for Public Workshop: 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Public Health (sp22-publichealth-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Floyd

Last Name: Vergara

Email Address: FVergara@cleanfuels.org

Affiliation: Clean Fuels Alliance America

Subject: Clean Fuels Comments on Scoping Plan Update - Public Health Workshop

Comment:

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/14-sp22-publichealth-ws-UjFcNlA0AjABaQhX.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/14-sp22-publichealth-ws-UjFcNlA0AjABaQhX.pdf)

Original File Name: Clean Fuels Comments CA Scoping Plan\_Public Health 03072022 (fvv2).pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-03-07 23:57:28

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 12 for Public Workshop: 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Public Health (sp22-publichealth-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Laura

Last Name: Rosenberger Haider

Email Address: lauragreen.rosenberger@gmail.com

Affiliation: Fresnoans Against Fracking, CEJC, Sierra

Subject: AB 32 scoping plan. Other harm from fossil fuels

Comment:

We need both qualitative and quantitative greenhouse gas reduction goals that are enforceable. Most of the diseases linked to climate change will be more significant and worsened by the decrease of the immune system linked to the Covid vaccines.

Dr. Ryan Cole, MD who expertise in pathology, found an increase in several viruses, melanoma, and a 20x increase in endometrial cancer in his patients. Official data from around the world suggests that the fully vaccinated are at risk of developing AIDS.

Alina Vodonos and Joel Schwartz, professor of Environmental Epidemiology at Harvard, developed a new risk assessment model that linked the concentration levels of particulates from fossil fuel emissions to health outcomes. This new model found a higher mortality rate for long-term exposure to fossil fuel emissions. (by Harvard's John A. Paulson).

We need to measure the large GHG emissions from cement production as well as the nickel, sulfur, & uranium pollution during mining to evaluate carbon capture. 30% of the CO2 captured is used to fuel the plant.

There is not enough water for new developments on land.

2045 is too late to reduce the physical damages from Alzheimer's, Parkinson's, encephalitis, hantavirus, developmental problems, etc.

We need to monitor the levels of methane gas leakage from cracks in the earth near oil wells, water wells, infrastructure and old homes which increase as they age. We need to convert to electric rather than build additional gas pipes that will eventually leak.

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-03-07 23:54:23

No Duplicates.

**There are no comments posted to Public Workshop: 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Public Health (sp22-publichealth-ws) that were presented during the Workshop at this time.**