

**Comment 1 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: BOB

Last Name: SHARP

Email Address: B.SHARP@STAXENGINEERING.COM

Affiliation: STAX Engineering

Subject: BONNET SYSTEMS

Comment:

Remote emissions control systems for oceangoing vessels (Bonnet Systems) are needed in the ports to supplement shore power, especially for other vessel types (Tankers, RoRo, Auto Carriers, General Cargo, etc.). These systems can remove the equivalent Diesel emissions of thousands of vehicles. However, Bonnet Systems are not represented in the plan.

Please add "Bonnet Systems" to the plan.

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2017-09-20 15:38:52

No Duplicates.

**Comment 2 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Guy

Last Name: Fayette

Email Address: mlileasing@mayorusa.com

Affiliation: Mayor Logistics

Subject: Class 8 Trucks

Comment:

Will CARB assist the Ports of Los Angeles and Long Beach via their Clean Air Action Plan to implement lower NOx emissions and allocate VW settlement funds as grants to replace diesel fueled trucks with CNG or ZEV technology?

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2017-09-22 10:38:48

No Duplicates.

### **Comment 3 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California (vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Christopher  
Last Name: Brown  
Email Address: apco@fraqmd.org  
Affiliation: Chris Brown

Subject: VW Mitigation  
Comment:

Thank you for the opportunity to make comments on this item.  
Unfortunately no one from FRAQMD is able to attend the workshop  
since it occurs on a federal holiday and we lack the funds to pay  
"double time" for staff to attend.

I believe it is important to keep in mind that the VW emissions  
impacted the ENTIRE state of California. Therefore it is reasonable  
to expect some funding to benefit every community in the state -  
just urban areas or those who can afford to travel to Sacramento to  
lobby for funding.

The Chair of the ARB has recently stated a goal of eliminating all  
ICE vehicles in the near future, which is a change from prior ARB  
policy. In order to accomplish this aggressive goal ARB should  
embrace the idea of greatly expanding the EV and PEV charging  
network - not simply creating a denser network in some communities  
as is the current envisioned.

With this in mind FRAQMD recommends ARB consider setting a baseline  
"level of service" statewide with a goal of EV/PEV charging  
stations being available long all major highways at a specified  
distance. This should probably include separate goals for both  
light duty and heavy duty projects.

Please feel free to contact the District with any questions.

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2017-09-29 15:57:14

No Duplicates.

**Comment 4 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Mike

Last Name: Saxton

Email Address: MikeS@OrangeEV.com

Affiliation: Orange EV

Subject: Comments from Orange EV re: Developing California's VW Beneficiary Mitigation Plan

Comment:

Please see the attached document for Orange EV's comments regarding the California VW Beneficiary Mitigation Plan. Thank you for your consideration and continued partnership.

NOTE: I am attempting to submit a second time since the previous confirmation stated that the attached file did not upload.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/5-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-AGMBaFQ4AD5SMVU7.pdf>

Original File Name: Comments from Orange EV re CA VW Beneficiary Mitigation Plan 10-4-17.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2017-10-04 21:22:03

No Duplicates.

**Comment 5 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Michael

Last Name: Holihan

Email Address: holihan.michael@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Holihan-Derbin Soot Reducer

Comment:

Dear Sir/Ms.

My name is Michael Holihan and a Principal Multi-Disciplined Engineer. I live in Santa Clarita California. My patent partner, Patrick Derbin and I have a proven, patented concept to reduce soot at idle in most all diesel engines. We have one EPA SBIR grant under our belt that proved the concept. However, it's unfortunate we've not been able to get a sponsor to continue development. This is a great concept that reduces soot and particulates at idle by about 40% with very few changes to a diesel engine. I'm attaching a power point which explains the concept. I believe this would be a great candidate for a grant for someone like UCLA or Cal Pomona to continue development for use on diesels. I was part of a pioneer team on the first Methanol Fueled Diesel Buses used in Southern California in the 80's and also a pioneer on the 1200 point EPA transient Emission Cycle for the EPA in '78. I have multiple patents on this research and additional patents pending, in the defense sector in Southern California. Ms. Patti Brown (ARB Chair person) and Ms. April Richards (EPA Washington D.C.) are familiar with the in-roads Patrick and I have made in reducing Diesel Emissions. Development of this soot reducer would be a good fit for a grant with the VW Mitigation Fund along with a sponsor that you may be able to provide. I look forward to discussing this concept more fully.

Sincerely,

Michael J. Holihan (661-645-2457)

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/7-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-WjJWPwNuBT8Eaghp.pdf>

Original File Name: Holihan-Derbin Diesel Soot Reducer .pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2017-10-05 22:16:22

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 6 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California (vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Keith

Last Name: Loewen

Email Address: KLoewen@fowlerusd.org

Affiliation: District Accountant, Fowler Unified SD

Subject: Comments from Fowler Unified School District

Comment:

1. School Buses account for 5 times more pollution affecting our children than trucks.
2. The San Joaquin Valley has by far the highest amount of pollution in the state but state funding for buses in the San Joaquin Valley has been almost nonexistent in the last 6 years.
3. Governor Brown has stated that he wants the future of California school buses to be electric rather than a combination fuel bus. However, in the latest state school bus grant, not a single grant went to a school district in the San Joaquin Valley.
4. Electric buses cost over \$400,000 each compared to diesel buses which cost around \$200,000. Smaller school districts, especially rural school districts, have a difficult time raising this money without help from the state which, as stated above, has been sorely lacking.

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2017-10-09 07:34:15

No Duplicates.

**Comment 7 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Eli

Last Name: Saddler

Email Address: eli@scoot.co

Affiliation: Scoot Networks, Inc.

Subject: LEV, NEV, & E-bikes

Comment:

How will money help people access personal or shared LEVs (like e-mopeds), Neighborhood Electric Vehicles (NEVs), and electric bikes?

These types of transportation methods benefit low income Californians and communities of concern more than subsidies for expensive electric cars, which contribute also to traffic and parking congestion, and are unnecessary for many.

Will shared e-bikes, LEVs, NEVs, etc., get some benefit to serve low-income Californians and neighborhoods of concern.

Thank you,  
Eli Saddler

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2017-10-09 09:02:12

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 8 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California (vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: John

Last Name: McGowan

Email Address: richard.mcgowan@ge.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Freight Switcher Funding Requirements

Comment:

Dear Ms. Lisa Williams,

Two questions regarding the Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California available for freight switcher locomotives.

1. Existing switcher locomotives produce high levels of emission pollutants at EPA Tier 0+ or non-emission tier levels also operating at low efficiency rates, which produce high greenhouse gas output. The older switcher configurations are relatively inexpensive to overhaul and maintain, thus difficult to justify EPA Tier-4 conversions without funding near 80% reimbursement rates. Therefore, can the 40% Volkswagen funding for switchers be utilized in conjunction with other California state or DERA funding?

2. The funding applies to freight switcher applications while some re-power applications will continue to serve freight yards but will have gross power ratings above the 2300 ghp EPA line haul classification threshold. Please clarify if re-power solutions rated between 2,300 to 4,100 ghp that continue to serve California switch yard applications, qualify for the VW funding reimbursement.

Best regards,

John McGowan

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2017-10-09 09:29:36

No Duplicates.



**Comment 9 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Mark

Last Name: Roest

Email Address: MarkLRoest@gmail.com

Affiliation: Green Fleets Group, SeaWave Battery

Subject: Supposed scrappage requirement

Comment:

If you look at the appendix, you will see contradictions between scrappage and information about conversions. Is it possible for you to determine that you will fund conversions, relying on the paragraphs in the Appendix whose subject matter is conversions, and either claiming the right to interpret the defective writing for the obvious intent to allow conversions in lieu of scrappage, or appealing to the supervising court to acknowledge that portion of the intent of the negotiators of the agreement.

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2017-10-09 11:10:05

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 10 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California (vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Ryan

Last Name: Storz

Email Address: rstorz@csum.edu

Affiliation: CSU Maritime Academy

Subject: Cal Maritime Research Vessel

Comment:

To The VW Environmental Mitigation Trust,

I would like to propose that some of this funding be used for research to further reduce emissions in ports. As the Trust Members are aware, California's Ports represent huge concentrations for all categories of emissions. Our hybrid boat project could replace a Tier 0-3 propulsion system for one of our Cal Maritime owned vessels that we use for training for students. Our goal with this research project is threefold:

- 1.) Provide a platform for manufacturers to test the performance of zero-emission and LNG technologies on an electric propulsion system.
- 2.) Provide training for students in emissions reduction projects and to familiarize them with alternative technologies that have yet to be fully adopted by the maritime industry.
- 3.) By utilizing an electric propulsion system with zero-emission generating technologies, we aim to use this vessel as part of a campus microgrid to backfeed power during peak energy usage times or emergencies. This would further lower emissions in the region by potentially displacing any utility gas backed power generating resources.

Please review the initial project overview proposal.

Kind Regards,

Ryan Storz

Assistant Professor

Department of Engineering Technology

Cal Maritime

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/15-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-Vz8CfQZIVXQCbQJm.pdf>

Original File Name: Hybrid Project Scope.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2017-10-09 11:08:56

No Duplicates.

**Comment 11 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Veronica

Last Name: Bradley

Email Address: vbradley@airlines.org

Affiliation: Airlines for America

Subject: Volkswagen Consent Decree Environmental Mitigation Trust Beneficiary Mitigation Plan

Comment:

Please see attached letter for comments.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/16-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-WzoGNFU1U18EbGfk.pdf>

Original File Name: A4A Letter re VW CD & Mitigation Plan\_CA.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2017-10-11 09:51:07

No Duplicates.

**Comment 12 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Chris

Last Name: Anderson

Email Address: canderson1138@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Mitigating California High Desert Pollution Hot Spot

Comment:

Hello,

As a concerned citizen of the state of California, I would like further details regarding mitigation funding, specifically procedures for obtaining appropriations from this fund. I reside in a rural area that has become overwhelmed by particulate matter air pollution from vehicular traffic. This pollution is a hot spot that is not being satisfactorily monitored locally. I will propose specific mitigation measures once more details are provided regarding appropriations.

Regards,

Chris A.

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2017-10-11 15:32:34

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 13 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California (vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Penny

Last Name: Elia

Email Address: greenpl@cox.net

Affiliation:

Subject: Invest Volkswagen settlement in green infrastructure and prioritize underserved communities

Comment:

Dear California Air Resources Board,

I'm writing to urge you to spend the approximately \$400 million in funds covered by Appendix D in the Volkswagen settlement on projects that will increase the use of zero-emission vehicles and technologies in the heavy-duty sector.

The funds provide a perfect opportunity to rapidly advance, commercialize, and deploy non-polluting vehicles that are independent of carbon or methane fuels. That includes electric drayage trucks, electric transit buses, and electric school buses. To spend this money on anything other than zero-emission vehicles would mean exposing communities that are most burdened by heavy-duty sector vehicles and activities to more pollution than necessary.

The settlement funds present a unique opportunity to eliminate decades of air pollution hotspots. In the programs you support with these funds, I urge you to prioritize environmental justice and the communities hit hardest by air pollution.

The California Air Resources Board should not use the funding for natural gas, propane, or diesel vehicles. Further dependence on fossil fuels only means more pollution, and only a transition to electric vehicles and investing in electric vehicle infrastructure will make it possible to have a transportation sector that is eventually 100% clean.

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2017-10-23 11:59:15

4087 Duplicates.

## **Comment 14 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California (vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Kevin

Last Name: Hamilton

Email Address: kevin.hamilton@centralcalasthma.org

Affiliation: Central California Asthma Collaborative

Subject: VW Mitigation Trust Comments

Comment:

Central California Asthma Collaborative, a non-profit organization focused at reducing the impact of climate and air pollution on public health, feels strongly that a mix of funding streams that focus at electrifying class 4-7 vehicles and repowering class 8 and above to either natural gas and an eye toward hydrogen and/or electrification in the future. Specific geographic locations should be determined by a combination of CalEnviro Screen 3.0 and communities with incomes of <80% AMI.

The San Joaquin Valley, LA Ports and Inland Empire, and East Bay Port areas generate the majority of the climate and criteria pollution in California and should be funded equally, leveraging or "stacking" all available program matching and grant funds to maximize the impacts. Such stacking offers opportunities to increase the flexibility of programs like Carl Moyer and Equip which may, because of statute driven restrictions, exclude certain engines, uses, and/or vehicle classes.

We also feel strongly that these investments need to be guided by the needs of regional and local State Implementation Plans to meet PM 2.5 and Ozone EPA mandates targets and in consultation with local agencies and the Environmental Justice Communities most impacted by the emissions we expect to be reduced.

We thank you for this opportunity and look forward to commenting further as this process matures.

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2017-10-23 12:03:58

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 15 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California (vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Stacy

Last Name: Shull

Email Address: cleanairgrants@gmail.com

Affiliation: CleanAir Grant Services

Subject: Tugs and Ferries

Comment:

Hello - in regards to Ferries and Tugs. Happy to discuss offline if more appropriate.

1. Appendix D states "Eligible Ferries and/or Tugs include unregulated, Tier 1, or Tier 2 marine engines". In this case, does "unregulated" refer to Tier 0 / uncontrolled engines?

2. If yes - Will this funding only be allocated to those engines which have not yet reached their Commercial Harbor Craft (CHC) regulatory compliance date for engine replacement and/or have already achieved compliance with the CHC by installing a Tier 2 or cleaner engine? Or will you be allowing Tier 0 and Tier 1 engines to be eligible for funding, even if their engine replacement date set forth by the CHC has already passed? If CARB plans to follow the CHC engine replacement schedule, this would only allow for engines 2003 model year or newer and Tier 2 engines or cleaner to be upgraded through the mitigation trust funding. This would likely result in many projects being a Tier 2 to Tier 3 or 4 upgrade.

3. Suggestion: I would suggest that CARB utilize the Carl Moyer guidelines as a framework for managing this category. However, I would eliminate the 3 year surplus emissions requirement - this requires projects to be completed 3 years prior to any regulatory compliance date. I would recommend that applicants be deemed eligible as long as they are awarded funding for engine repower prior to their compliance date. I would also allow for propellers and shafts to be included as an eligible cost for this category, which the Carl Moyer Program does not allow for.

4. Suggestion: I would follow the Cost Effectiveness Cap set by Carl Moyer of approximately \$30,000 / ton of emission reductions  
5. For all repower / scrap projects I would recommend there be an opportunity for the applicants to request a "progress payment" for any engines / equipment prior to the completion of the project. Many applicants are not able to come up with the funds needed for reimbursement type projects.

6. Suggestion: I would recommend that the application for diesel repower / replacement projects be an online application process similar to those developed by the BAAQMD and SCAQMD.

7. Suggestion: Although I understand appendix D does not allocate funds to all commercial harborcraft, I would suggest (if possible) that a portion of the VW funds be allocated to Carl Moyer programs throughout the state, so the commercial diesel categories who are left out of this settlement (like ag, construction and marine) can also benefit from this funding. The emission benefits from the replacement of high usage Tier 0 engines within the unregulated harborcraft communities are significant.

8. Suggestion: I would concur with local Air Districts on the projects that receive the most reductions in NOX so funding could be successful in reducing the most NOX / ton / cost to manage funding.

Thanks,

PS: Check out our new website!: [www.cleanairgrants.com](http://www.cleanairgrants.com)

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2017-10-23 12:03:58

No Duplicates.



## **Comment 16 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California (vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Richard

Last Name: Boggs

Email Address: tugs@earthlink.net

Affiliation: EnerYacht LLC

Subject: Aftermarket vs replacement

Comment:

While replacing an engine with new benefits engine manufacturers it may impose crippling costs on many operators, particularly in the marine sector. It appears that the concept of replacement was developed before a source of aftermarket aftertreatment systems was available. If the objective is to reduce emissions, regulatory measures must focus on the level of emissions leaving the stack, not on forcing users to purchase new engines.

In the marine sector this has worked very well for sulfur emissions reduction. Because the supply of low sulfur fuels is problematic, and no other practical alternatives exist, both EPA and IMP permit the use of aftermarket sulfur scrubbers. We should approach NOx emissions with the same goal, to reduce emissions not promote engine replacement as the only solution. We now have the technology to achieve emissions goals without imposing such high costs to users. Current thinking is very much a case of throwing out the baby with the bathwater.

A large part of the problem in the marine sector exists because the market is so small that engine manufacturers simply ignore that market. Our customers operate large motoryachts which use generators that are at the lower power level at which EPA Tier 4 or IMO Tier 3 standards apply in order to enter the North American NOx Emissions Control Area. Because the size of the engines fitted to most of these vessels is not worth an engine manufacturer's attention it has become, for all practical purposes, impossible to fit generators sized for the application. In cooperation with our German partner, we manufacture aftertreatment systems sized and developed for this niche market but because current regulations prohibit certification by any route other than the engine manufacturer, it may become impossible to build yachts in certain sizes. Because larger generators currently available use such large aftertreatment systems the volume required to fit those generators in engine rooms creates a cascade of regulatory barriers based on vessel tonnage (volume) and problems associated with oversized generators. The unintended consequences of current regulations create serious problems for the yachting industry which, in my own state of Florida alone, brings in more than \$11 billion annually and employs more than 136,000 people in Broward County.

Because current regulations were developed before any other solution was available, users are being forced to destroy perfectly useable engines and spend very large amounts (even with government assistance) to replace those engines that simply do not exist on the market today. We can retrofit aftertreatment systems that meet

all emissions standards and deliver the environmental benefits the regulations were intended to provide.

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2017-10-23 12:03:58

No Duplicates.

**Comment 17 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Gus

Last Name: Block

Email Address: gblock@nuvera.com

Affiliation: Hyster-Yale Group / Nuvera Fuel Cells

Subject: EMT Funding for Fuel Cell Equipment

Comment:

I am writing to express strong support from Nuvera Fuel Cells and Hyster-Yale Group of projects funded by the VW Environmental Mitigation Trust (EMT) for diesel emissions reduction from non-road equipment used primarily in ports, terminals, and airports. Nuvera and Hyster-Yale offer zero-emissions fuel cell forklifts that qualify under the settlement decree guidelines, and larger port cargo handling equipment powered by fuel cells is under development.

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2017-10-23 12:36:20

No Duplicates.

**Comment 18 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Linus

Last Name: Farias

Email Address: ljfb@pge.com

Affiliation: Pacific Gas & Electric Company

Subject: Comments on October 9, 2017 Beneficiary Mitigation Plan Public Workshop

Comment:

Please find attached comment letter for consideration.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/24-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-AXdVJFEPu24FbAZ+.pdf>

Original File Name: VW NOx Mitigation Plan Comment Letter.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2017-10-24 15:28:40

No Duplicates.

**Comment 19 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Kevin

Last Name: Vincent

Email Address: kevin.vincent@faradayfuture.com

Affiliation: Faraday Future

Subject: Comments in Support of Ultra-High-Power Charging Stations

Comment:

Please see the attached comments from Faraday Future

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/25-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-UzAFYgFyBTRWDwJj.docx>

Original File Name: CARB Appendix D comments final.docx

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2017-10-25 10:04:20

No Duplicates.

**Comment 20 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Michael

Last Name: Pimentel

Email Address: michael@caltransit.org

Affiliation: California Transit Association

Subject: Invest VW Settlement in Zero-Emission Buses and Trucks

Comment:

See attachment.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/26-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-AHZSIwNdAiIAYwRw.pdf>

Original File Name: VW Settlement Letter to ARB - 10-25-17.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2017-10-25 17:03:46

No Duplicates.

**Comment 21 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Raul

Last Name: Portugal

Email Address: raul@gensets.com

Affiliation: Central California Power

Subject: Volkswagen Mitigation Trust

Comment:

Good Morning,

I am writing to you today because I was at the October 9th meeting in Sacramento for the Volkswagen Mitigation Trust. I am asking today that the board please consider the DERA option for the spending of the 423 million available. Under the trust 35% of funds must go to disadvantaged communities. In San Joaquin we have 22 of the 30 disadvantaged communities identified by Cal Enviro Screen. The current options for scrap and replacement do not tackle all the polluting factors that our communities have to deal with. The 10 categories for funding of scrap and replacement vehicles covers mainly on road vehicles and ocean going vessels as well as airports. In San Joaquin we get most of our Nox and PM from off road engines. I am asking that we please include the DERA option. I would also like to see that local APCD's and AQMD's be the ones to manage the budget because they have the programs and infrastructure to administer these programs.

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2017-10-26 09:04:25

No Duplicates.

**Comment 22 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Thomas

Last Name: Ashley

Email Address: tom@greenlots.com

Affiliation: Greenlots

Subject: Greenlots' Comments RE Drafting California's VW Beneficiary Mitigation Plan  
Comment:

Please find attached comments from Greenlots to assist in  
developing guiding principles for drafting California's Volkswagen  
Beneficiary Mitigation Plan.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/28-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-AGdRJQNnADYDawJu.pdf>

Original File Name: Greenlots Comments CARB Beneficiary Mitigation Plan.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2017-10-26 17:30:14

No Duplicates.



**Comment 23 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

This comment was posted then deleted because it was unrelated to the Workshop item or it was a duplicate.

**Comment 24 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Ryan

Last Name: Kenny

Email Address: ryan.kenny@cleanenergyfuels.com

Affiliation: Clean Energy

Subject: Comments Regarding Appendix D - VW Settlement

Comment:

Please find attached comments from Clean Energy concerning Appendix D of the VW settlement. Thank you.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/30-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-AmFTOVU6UGYDWgB2.pdf>

Original File Name: CLNE VW CA Comment Letter.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2017-11-07 12:51:53

No Duplicates.

**Comment 25 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Julia

Last Name: Rege

Email Address: jrege@globalautomakers.org

Affiliation: Association of Global Automakers

Subject: Maximizing Settlement Fund Allocation for Charging and Hydrogen Refueling  
Infrastructure

Comment:

Please find attached comments from the Association of Global  
Automakers, Inc. on the Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/31-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-BWYAZ1wxAzkFZQZp.pdf>

Original File Name: California VW Settlement - Appendix D Letter.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2017-11-08 06:34:27

No Duplicates.

**Comment 26 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Michael

Last Name: Neuenburg

Email Address: ombcomm@arb.ca.gov

Affiliation:

Subject: Comment to the VW Mitigation Trust

Comment:

See attached

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/32-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-BWgHaFIwUWoEYwht.pdf>

Original File Name: michael\_neuenburg\_10262017.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2017-11-09 12:57:09

No Duplicates.

**Comment 27 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Ellah

Last Name: Ronen

Email Address: eronen@calfund.org

Affiliation:

Subject: Comments on a Beneficiary Mitigation Plan

Comment:

Please See Comment Letter Attached

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/33-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-UjdQOAdwBzlSPQdz.pdf>

Original File Name: EnvMitTrust Los Angeles Partners Comment Letter- 11.9.17.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2017-11-09 16:54:48

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 28 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California (vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Katrina

Last Name: Walsh

Email Address: cinerina@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Invest Volkswagen settlement in green infrastructure & prioritize underserved communities

Comment:

Dear California Air Resources Board,

What better way to try and reverse the damage done by their emissions? You could also invest the settlement to plant more trees in cities, which will cool communities, shade homes which reduces need for air conditioning, increase habitats, and scrub pollution out of the air. More trees also add to a neighborhood's desirability and beauty. In Burbank, East San Jose Avenue is literally 10 degrees cooler than one street over, and the homes there use far less AC.

I'm writing to urge you to spend the approximately \$400 million in funds covered by Appendix D in the Volkswagen settlement on projects that will increase the use of zero-emission vehicles and technologies in the heavy-duty sector.

The funds provide a perfect opportunity to rapidly advance, commercialize, and deploy non-polluting vehicles that are independent of carbon or methane fuels. That includes electric drayage trucks, electric transit buses, and electric school buses. To spend this money on anything other than zero-emission vehicles would mean exposing communities that are most burdened by heavy-duty sector vehicles and activities to more pollution than necessary.

The settlement funds present a unique opportunity to eliminate decades of air pollution hotspots. In the programs you support with these funds, I urge you to prioritize environmental justice and the communities hit hardest by air pollution.

The California Air Resources Board should not use the funding for natural gas, propane, or diesel vehicles. Further dependence on fossil fuels only means more pollution, and only a transition to electric vehicles and investing in electric vehicle infrastructure will make it possible to have a transportation sector that is eventually 100% clean.

Sincerely,

Karina Walsh

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2017-11-30 13:14:54

No Duplicates.

**Comment 29 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Kathryn

Last Name: Phillips

Email Address: kathryn.phillips@sierraclub.org

Affiliation: Sierra Club

Subject: Sierra Club Comments on VW Settlement Part D Funds Expenditure

Comment:

See attached

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/37-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-WikCbQRgWXgAdFc2.pdf>

Original File Name: Sierra Club Ltr Re VW Environmental Mitigation Trust  
Expenditure.11.22.17.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2017-12-11 14:21:15

No Duplicates.



**Comment 30 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Brian  
Last Name: Rondinella  
Email Address: ombcomm@arb.ca.gov  
Affiliation: John Wayne Airport

Subject: Comments to vw-mititrust  
Comment:

See attached.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/38-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-BWcBZIIhUXAKdVIN.pdf>

Original File Name: Barry Rondinella - John Wayne Airport.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2017-12-12 09:44:37

No Duplicates.

**Comment 31 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Mikael

Last Name: Sloth

Email Address: mslot@nelhydrogen.com

Affiliation: Nel Hydrogen

Subject: Funding for fueling infrastructure

Comment:

Comment is attached.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/39-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-VzIRMgBtUV0AYFcy.pdf>

Original File Name: NEL\_feedback-ARB-VW-Mitigation-Trust-Dec-13-2017.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2017-12-13 02:27:37

No Duplicates.

**Comment 32 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Gary  
Last Name: Dannar  
Email Address: gdannar@dannar.us.com  
Affiliation:

Subject: DANNAR VW Comments  
Comment:

Thank you for the opportunity to provide comments on the Appendix D  
Beneficiary Mitigation Plan.

In order to effectively mitigate NOx emissions, DANNAR strongly  
supports maximizing investment in the eligible off-road mitigation  
categories, including forklifts & port cargo handling equipment and  
airport ground support equipment (GSE).

Please see further comments attached.

Thank you,  
Gary Dannar

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/40-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-UScAcVYIUGBXPgZr.pdf>

Original File Name: VW Comment Letter\_Dannar.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2017-12-19 10:11:43

No Duplicates.

**Comment 33 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Francesca  
Last Name: Wahl  
Email Address: fwahl@tesla.com  
Affiliation:

Subject: Tesla Comments VW Mitigation Trust BMP  
Comment:

Please find attached Tesla's comments on the development of the  
Beneficiary Mitigation Plan for California.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/41-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-W2lUYlFhVjIHMAAy.pdf>

Original File Name: 20171220 Tesla Comments VW Mitigation Trust BMP Appendix D.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2017-12-20 10:26:36

No Duplicates.

**Comment 34 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Jordyn

Last Name: Bishop

Email Address: jordynb@greenlining.org

Affiliation: The Greenlining Institute

Subject: Comments on October 9, 2017 Public Workshop on Developing a Beneficiary  
Mitigation Plan

Comment:

The Greenlining Institute's Comments on October 9, 2017 Public  
Workshop on Developing a Beneficiary Mitigation Plan Volkswagen  
Environmental Mitigation Trust for California Attached.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/44-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-VjFUPgFpBQkEbQBw.pdf>

Original File Name: GLI\_Opening Comments\_VW Mitigation Trust.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2017-12-22 12:41:58

No Duplicates.

**Comment 35 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Kent

Last Name: Leacock

Email Address: kleacock@proterra.com

Affiliation: Proterra, Inc.

Subject: Comments VW Settlement Appendix D

Comment:

See attached file. Thank you.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/45-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-VCJXJgZYADABZglW.pdf>

Original File Name: VW CA comments Appendix D.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-01-11 15:02:43

No Duplicates.

**Comment 36 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Frank

Last Name: Podgwaite

Email Address: frank@medicaire.net

Affiliation:

Subject: VW Settlement Comment

Comment:

See attached

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/47-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-USQHclczWFRXPglv.docx>

Original File Name: Use of Volkswagen settlement funds for Medidocks to advance Ambulance.docx

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-01-16 14:41:54

No Duplicates.

**Comment 37 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Marie  
Last Name: Bedard  
Email Address: marie.bedard@thelionelectric.com  
Affiliation: THE LION ELECTRIC CO.

Subject: Volkswagen Mitigation Plan - All-Electric Buses Solution  
Comment:

Hello,

I hope this email finds you well. My name is Marie Bedard and I am the Business Relationship Manager at The Lion Electric Co., an all-electric bus manufacturing company.

I am contacting you with regards to the Volkswagen mitigation plan and was wondering if you had a few minutes to discuss the potential of replacing diesel school buses (type C and Type A) with all-electric buses? I read the draft beneficiary plan and believe we may be able to help with reducing the number of on-road heavy duty diesel vehicles in California with an immediate, all-electric solution.

Please let me know if you have a few minutes to discuss or if you have any questions. Thank you.

Warm Regards,  
Marie

Marie Bedard  
Business Relationship Manager

C 514.717.3703  
T 450.432.5466 ext 281  
1.855.546.6706 ext 281

thelionelectric.com

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/48-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-Wz4AalA4VGhSOgNg.pdf>

Original File Name: eLionC\_ONEPAGER.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-01-22 06:52:43

No Duplicates.



**Comment 38 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: James

Last Name: Johnston

Email Address: jjohnston@autocartruck.com

Affiliation: Autocar Truck

Subject: Autocar Truck Comments on How California Should Spend its Trust Allocation - VW EMT

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/51-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-VDVVJlwpV2sHY1Q1.pdf>

Original File Name: Autocar Truck Comments on How California Should Spend its Trust Allocation - VW EMT.PDF

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-01-22 13:55:18

No Duplicates.

**Comment 39 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Steven

Last Name: Booth

Email Address: juniperbooth@gmail.com

Affiliation: Mr.

Subject: Volkswagen Trust Fund

Comment:

Please let me know what type(s) of mitigation are allowable under the Beneficiary Mitigation Plan. What are the parameters, the guidelines? I want to make sure my comments are relevant to what is allowable. Please e-mail a reply at the earliest.

Thanks, Steve Booth

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-01-30 16:56:19

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 40 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California (vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Nicholas

Last Name: Littlejohn

Email Address: nicklittlejohn@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: VW settlement comments

Comment:

I feel that we should use VW settlement funds to provide strategic and affordable, bidded, DC fast charging.

Stations could have a token charge to encourage turnover but should be non profit. Low income drivers could also pay on a sliding scale.

Open source and inexpensive level two could be placed at workplaces and businesses with a cost share from the host. Solar, if affordable, would also be a bonus for communities.

Parking garages and parking areas could also be equipped with many level one outlets as EVs come with this adapter and may be parked and charging for long durations at a very low equipment cost.

Thank you for mindfully and effectively using the funds to make the largest benefit for Californians.

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-01-31 07:38:21

No Duplicates.

**Comment 41 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Nick

Last Name: Lee

Email Address: nlee@matson.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Matson - CARB public comment

Comment:

Please see attached document.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/55-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-BmtQN1AlWXkBAAJs.pdf>

Original File Name: Matson CA Public Comment Letter-signed.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-02-13 08:47:05

No Duplicates.

**Comment 42 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Paul

Last Name: Hernandez

Email Address: paul.hernandez@energycenter.org

Affiliation: Center for Sustainable Energy

Subject: CSE's Response to Beneficiary Mitigation Plan

Comment:

Attached, please find the Response of CSE to the Beneficiary Mitigation Plan.

This is a revised document. Please replace the original document filed on November 2nd, 2017, with the attached.

Thank you,

-Paul D. Hernandez

CSE

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/56-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-UTIHclM3UV0CdIA1.pdf>

Original File Name: CSE Response to VW Beneficiary Mitigation Plan, 2.20.2018 Revision.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-02-20 11:47:57

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 43 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California (vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Robert

Last Name: Wilson

Email Address: duke\_of\_alinor@yahoo.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Need for focus on electric charging

Comment:

We need to build level 3 charging stations.

This money is to reduce pollution. No car is pollution free as they have to be fabricated and use some type of fuel. Currently the lowest car pollution levels come from many different manufacturers but they all have one thing in common. They are all battery electric vehicles.

We need a charging infrastructure which will support many manufacturers. The chargers will favorably affect businesses in low income communities. The chargers need to be located along common routes and have easy access as well as low charging costs.

All the top brands can charge from level 2 and all have or have promised promised level 3 compatibility.

Supporting documents:

[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Hydrogen\\_production](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Hydrogen_production)

[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Electric\\_car#US\\_charging\\_standards](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Electric_car#US_charging_standards)

Avoid funding the following as they are just money grabs by special interests:

Natural Gas

Hydrogen

Propane

Biodiesel

Methanol

P-Series Fuels

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-02-21 12:20:26

No Duplicates.

**Comment 44 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Cristina

Last Name: Garcia

Email Address: ombcomm@arb.ca.gov

Affiliation:

Subject: VW Trust Letter

Comment:

See attached.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/60-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-UD5cM1w+VG9QOQVp.pdf>

Original File Name: Nichols VW Trust Letter.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-02-21 13:21:06

No Duplicates.

**Comment 45 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: David

Last Name: Troup

Email Address: david@troup.net

Affiliation:

Subject: Comment on use of VW settlement funds

Comment:

My input follows:

I appreciate that \$10MM has been recommended for light duty charging facilities, but this number needs to be increased significantly to have any real impact. Additionally, most of the LD infrastructure funding should go toward hydrogen fueling infrastructure. There are already hundreds of millions of dollars going into electric charging infrastructure for battery vehicles, from the electric utilities and others. Fuel cell vehicles hold more promise for replacing gasoline vehicles, and the charging infrastructure is far more scalable. We need to maximize the contribution to accelerating development of more light duty hydrogen fueling stations and continue to push the adoption of fuel cell electric cars.

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-02-21 13:21:06

No Duplicates.



**Comment 46 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Gregory

Last Name: Arthur

Email Address: gregoryarthur@live.com

Affiliation:

Subject: how to spend the \$400 million plus!

Comment:

The central valley is plagued by smog, poverty, low income. Oregon and Washington have ELECTRIFIED hwy 5, we have almost NOTHING except for Tesla stations. We could drastically reduce smog, where our produce is produced, by installing quick chargers at EVERY rest stop and more between those.. Also, the 210 fwy, access out/into Los Angeles has ZERO quick chargers in the San Fernando Valley area, another high smog area! We need FREE charging stations to get people onboard. No more stations with HIGH kw rates for charging as that makes it NOT worthwhile for people to switch. Also, we don't need more "low income" subsidies as the market is becoming flooded with VERY INEXPENSIVE low mileage, used EV's. Also, we need to STOP or limit the production of plug in hybrids in CA as this defeats the point of switching to renewable. ALSO, they hog the level 2 station and people with REAL EV's often can not charge! Each rest area on the 5 should have at least 3 QC stations. Some of the funds could be spent on battery storage at rest stops along with solar panel installations...

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-02-21 23:16:05

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 47 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California (vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Tadashi  
Last Name: Ogitsu  
Email Address: ogitsu@mac.com  
Affiliation: Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory

Subject: More destination H2 stations desperately needed  
Comment:

Dear Sirs/Madams,

As an owner of Clarity FCEV, I would love to see more H2 stations around CA to enjoy beautiful scenery of California guilt free.

Best,  
Tadashi Ogitsu

Candidate H2 station locations

Livermore (as a gateway to the bay area)

Highway 101  
Eureka (Humboldt)  
Leggett  
Santa Rosa (Humboldt)  
Salinas  
San Luis Obispo/Paso Robles

Highway 1  
Mendocino  
Jenner  
Point Reyes Station  
Pacifica  
Half Moon Bay  
Santa Cruz  
Monterey  
Morro Bay  
Santa Maria

I5  
Weed (Lava, Klamath)  
Redding (Lassen)  
Red Bluff

SR 99  
Chico (Lassen)  
Manteca (Yosemite)  
Modesto (Yosemite)  
Merced (Yosemite)  
Fresno (Sequoia)  
Bakersfield

SR139/299  
Canby

SR395  
Lee Vining (Yosemite/Mammoth)  
Mammoth Lakes  
Bishop  
Lone Pine (Death Valley access with Baker)  
Ridgecrest  
Kramer Junction

SR120  
Oakdale

SR140  
Mariposa

SR49  
Oakhurst

SR198  
Visalia

I15  
Barstow  
Baker (Death Valley/Las Vegas/Mojave)  
Mountain Pass

I40  
Fenner  
Needles

SR62  
Twentynine Palms  
Vidal Junction

I10  
Indio  
Blythe

SR78  
Brawley

I8  
El Centro

SR190  
Stovepipe Wells  
Furnace Creek  
Death Valley Junction

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-02-22 22:50:52

No Duplicates.



**Comment 48 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Dan  
Last Name: Lancer  
Email Address: d11lancer@gmail.com  
Affiliation:

Subject: Locomotive Switchyards  
Comment:

Please see attachment.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/65-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-VjVVMIQjVnIHXIA8.docx>

Original File Name: CAVW Letter.docx

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-02-23 06:54:12

No Duplicates.

**Comment 49 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Sherrie  
Last Name: Merrow  
Email Address: smerrow@ngvamerica.org  
Affiliation: NGVAmerica

Subject: NGVAmerica Comments for CA VW Mitigation Plan  
Comment:

Chairman Nichols:

Please see attached letter for comments on California's VW Mitigation Plan from NGVAmerica, and let me know if you have any questions.

Sincerely,

Sherrie Merrow  
NGVAmerica  
Director, State Government Advocacy  
303.883.5121  
smerrow@ngvamerica.org

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/66-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-VjhVNARzV2UBaII3.pdf>

Original File Name: NGVAmerica CA VW State Mitigation Plan Comments - Feb 23 2018.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-02-23 13:10:02

No Duplicates.

**Comment 50 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Andrew

Last Name: Burnette

Email Address: andrew.burnette@infowedge.com

Affiliation: on behalf of HEAT

Subject: Directly measuring on-road impacts of mitigation measures

Comment:

Recent technological advances in vehicle remote sensing device (RSD) technology have greatly reduced the cost of vehicle RSD data collection, while increasing its accuracy and applicability to all types of roadways and vehicles. If the state has not yet considered this option for collecting in-use empirical evidence of the impacts of the VW trust funding, I would like to set a meeting to give an overview of this powerful new tool for tracking fleet emissions changes over time.

I submit this comment on behalf of HEAT (Hager Environmental and Atmospheric Technologies). See their website (<https://www.heatremotesensing.com/benefits-of-edar>) for an overview of the new technology (EDAR) that is already making significant headway into the North American and European markets.

I can be reached at andrew.burnette@infowedge.com and 916-760-8474.

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-02-26 14:33:09

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 51 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California (vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Michael

Last Name: Rea

Email Address: mikerea22@gmail.com

Affiliation: CASTO and School Transportation Coalitio

Subject: School Bus Replacement with the VW Mitigation Trust Funds

Comment:

I attended and shared some verbal comments at the workshop meeting in Sacramento on Monday February 26. Here is the content of my comments as well as some others:

1. School transportation providers in California are extremely grateful for the long partnership between CARB and school transportation providers in California. Without ongoing funding like the Lower Emission School Bus Program and your support through the years, we would not have been able to replace older buses with newer, cleaner school buses.

2. By the CARB's own research as well as other research in the late 1980's and early 1990's, our children and youth are most vulnerable to the poor air quality inside the bus they are riding, which is often dirtier than the air outside the bus. Older buses had far more tailpipe emissions, and since most of them were diesel, had much higher particulate matter content.

3. Your staff recommendation for \$130 of the VW mitigation trust to be applied to public transit, shuttle buses and school bus is a sizeable amount. For that, we are most grateful.

We would strongly advise, however, that specific amounts are articulated for each mode. Of these three modes of transportation, Public Transit often has other resources, to include FTA funding for bus replacement. Shuttle can also include paratransit, which also benefits from FTA funding. We would strongly encourage that CARB supports a higher allocation for school bus, as school districts, JPAs and County offices of education have no other sources, and have been severely underfunded for school transportation (and general education) for years. You can barely go a day without reading an article in a newspaper or media source somewhere in California where school districts are cutting their budgets because the funding they receive, even to educate, is not enough. We would strongly urge a separate appropriate for school bus replacement that is near \$100 million.

Although, that seems like a lot, school buses represent the largest fleet of publicly supported transportation in the State, with over 24,000 school buses.

By your estimates in the proposal, there are close to 4,500 school buses that would be eligible for such funding. With electric buses costing nearly \$400,000, \$100 million would only fund 250 school buses, no where near addressing the overall need.



4. In addition to no tailpipe emissions with the new school buses, there would also be an additional safety benefit, as all the new school buses would be outfitted with three point seat belts. Older buses do not have seat belts. State law required that all new buses purchased since 2006 must have the three-point seat belts.

5. We also encourage that CARB utilize competitive criteria that has been cooperatively developed over the years for school bus replacement programs. It is based on age of the bus and mileage and would ensure that the oldest buses are replaced first.

We believe this is another reason why there should be separate and articulated amounts for shuttle and transit buses, because they would most likely be working with very different criteria, and it would not appropriate and beneficial to mix the types of buses. For example, you might want to see public transit criteria that stipulated a local or FTA contribution of a portion of the funds. Comparing school bus to those other types of buses in a competitive criteria environment would most likely not benefit school bus replacement, or our most vulnerable population, our children and youth.

Thank you for your support of school bus replacement over the years! We are truly appreciative.

Mike Rea

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-02-28 13:34:06

No Duplicates.

**Comment 52 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Melanie  
Last Name: Wiegner  
Email Address: mwiegner@ford.com  
Affiliation: Ford Motor Company

Subject: Ford Motor Company's Input on VW Draft Beneficiary Mitigation Plan Appendix D  
Comment:

Dear Sir or Madam:  
Attached you will find Ford Motor Company's comments regarding the use of VW Diesel Emissions Environmental Mitigation Trust Funds. We appreciate your consideration of these comments during this decision making process.

If you have any questions or comments, please feel free to contact me directly.

Melanie Wiegner  
Government Affairs  
Ford Motor Company  
mwiegner@ford.com  
916-442-0111

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/74-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-VDIAaVQnU2RRCAdx.pdf>

Original File Name: Ford\_VW\_Policy\_Letter\_CA.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-03-01 12:03:25

No Duplicates.

**Comment 53 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: glenn

Last Name: luksik

Email Address: luksik\_glenn\_m@cat.com

Affiliation: Caterpillar Inc

Subject: Comments on mitigation plan

Comment:

See attached letter

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/75-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-UmBWYAQ0B2wGLQg4.pdf>

Original File Name: 2018-02-23 (CR+3,GRN) Caterpillar Comments for California Proposed Plan of MTF .pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-03-05 06:10:36

No Duplicates.

**Comment 54 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: John

Last Name: Laird

Email Address: ombcomm@arb.ca.gov

Affiliation:

Subject: Beneficiary Mitigation Plans for Allocation of the VW Environmental Mitigation  
Trust

Comment:

See attached.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/76-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-UiRdNANuV29SJwl+.pdf>

Original File Name: Volkswagen Fund\_Bi-State final.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-03-06 08:20:06

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 55 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California (vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Teresa

Last Name: Buika

Email Address: tabuika@ucsc.edu

Affiliation:

Subject: Comments on the CA VW Mitigation Trust Program

Comment:

Hello,

I would like to submit some comments for consideration for the \$423M California will manage from the VW Mitigation Trust program. I am a Senior Transportation Planner at UC Santa Cruz and am Chair of the UC Sustainable Transportation Working Group representing all ten UC campuses.

1. Please be sure that all CA higher educations are eligible for this funding including University of California, CA State University and CA community colleges. Many campuses operate their own campus shuttle systems with older used diesel buses and have limited funding to convert these fleets to electric buses. Having this funding available can definitely help in the acquisition of these buses and replacing the older diesel buses.
2. Please allow this VW Trust funding to be eligible to be stacked with HVIP or other funding for those agencies that are NOT eligible for FTA funding. UC campuses that operate extensive shuttle programs are typically NOT eligible for FTA funding and do not receive other state funds for transit programs. At the University of CA, Santa Cruz for instance, our complete transit program is fully funded through student transit fees (which they vote to tax themselves) and is used to pay for contracts with our regional transit agency for commutes to campus and our on campus shuttle program. We operate about 16 older used diesel buses and would love to have funding to convert these buses incrementally or all at one time to electric.
3. Many campuses also provide robust vanpool programs using 10-passenger vans. Would replacement of these vans be an eligible project?
4. While I understand the rationale for first come, first serve availability of funding, it might be good to consider projects that allow larger agencies the opportunity to incrementally convert their transit fleets to EV. As you know, these costs can be substantial, even with the \$180,000 per bus funding, as additional charging infrastructure must also be installed at high costs. Perhaps projects can be funded so long as they are making their timelines? Just an idea.

Thank you for the opportunity to comment on the development of this program. Feel free to reach out if you have any questions or need

further information.

Teresa

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-03-06 08:20:06

No Duplicates.

**Comment 56 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Allison

Last Name: Wurtz

Email Address: awurtz@kewconsultants.com

Affiliation:

Subject: VW Question

Comment:

I understand that ports are considered "government entities" which under the settlement qualifies them for a much greater amount of funding. Will port tenants be afforded this benefit as well? For industrial operators of freight handling equipment, the larger funding amount is often the only way that upgrading to near-zero emissions is possible.

Thanks,

Allison Wurtz

KEW Grant Services LLC

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-03-06 08:20:06

No Duplicates.

**Comment 57 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Bill

Last Name: MacLeod

Email Address: emeraldadvisoryllc@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Public Workshop Comment

Comment:

See attached comment.

Regards,

Bill MacLeod

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/79-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-VzEGY1w1U2UKbVQL.pdf>

Original File Name: FCHEA Comments.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-03-06 08:20:06

No Duplicates.



**Comment 58 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Peter

Last Name: Thompson

Email Address: ombcomm@arb.ca.gov

Affiliation:

Subject: VW Mitigation Comments

Comment:

See attached.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/81-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-UDRWNVExBCUKU1My.docx>

Original File Name: Dear ARB staff.docx

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-03-06 08:20:06

No Duplicates.

**Comment 59 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Tish  
Last Name: Lanier  
Email Address: tlanier@avta.com  
Affiliation:

Subject: VW Mitigation Trust  
Comment:

See attached.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/82-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-Vz9TMFwxBDtSO1B+.docx>

Original File Name: Hello.docx

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-03-06 08:35:12

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 60 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California (vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Austin

Last Name: Benzinger

Email Address: abenzinger@thortrucks.com

Affiliation:

Subject: VW Mitigation Workshop - Thor Follow-Up

Comment:

Lisa and Peter,

Thank you for your efforts in the scoping plan thus far. Echoing the many comments in the room, I appreciate your focus on zero-emission solutions in an effort to hit the NOx mitigation goals of the consent decree.

Thank you as well for answering my two questions. I support the first-come first-serve voucher style of funding. As opposed to a formal solicitation, voucher funding allows us the flexibility to commercialize and scale as fast as possible.

I still have concerns about the inability to stack funds and how that will reduce the appeal / utilization of this program amidst all other available funds for MHD Vehicles. The question on my mind is: Why would a fleet choose to tap into these funds vs Carl Moyer or HVIP? A \$200,000 Voucher for Vehicle+Infrastructure is only \$5,000 more than HVIP (\$165,000 Vehicle in DAC + \$30,000 EVSE) and HVIP does not require vehicle scrapping. Furthermore, Carl Moyer is \$200,000 for the vehicle and \$60,000 for infrastructure. Not to mention those two programs are stackable for up to 80% of the project costs.

This program is setting itself up as a third tier option if Carl Moyer funding is not in cycle or if a vehicle has an ARB EO but no HVIP eligibility.

I understand the concern about calculating emissions reductions, but that seems like a hurdle to think about and overcome, not a barrier to stop at.

I'd love to hear your thoughts on this and other questions I have. I understand ya'll will be on tour soon, but can we set a time to discuss over the phone as you are available?

Best,

Austin Benzinger

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-03-06 08:39:25

No Duplicates.

**Comment 61 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: John  
Last Name: Higham  
Email Address: john@higham.com  
Affiliation:

Subject: Meeting in Sacramento  
Comment:

See attached

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/84-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-VjwGb1U8UG1QCVm7.zip>

Original File Name: John\_Higham.zip

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-03-06 08:39:25

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 62 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California (vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Pamela

Last Name: McDonald

Email Address: pama@orangeusd.org

Affiliation: Orange USD

Subject: VW Funds

Comment:

Please consider using VW funds for supporting School Bus replacement.

Orange USD is in the SCAQMD and have been replacing Diesel power school buses with CNG power school buses. Orange USD has the infrastructure for CNG and would like to continue to purchase CNG powered school buses.

I understand several folks are pushing for all electric school buses. This may be beneficial to several transportation departments, but for some of us who have already been replacing school buses with CNG or Propane, will need to continue with the same types of fuel.

Please consider making funds available for all types of fuel/power for school buses when making your decision.

Sincerely,

Pam McDonald  
Director of Transportation

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-03-09 12:24:50

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 63 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California (vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Volker  
Last Name: Osterholt  
Email Address: info@cleaner-mobility.com  
Affiliation: GERnano Cleaner Mobility

Subject: Maximize NOx Reduction  
Comment:

To whom it may concern,

Regardless of existing plans, I need to inform you about an additional option for drastically increasing the total NOx reduction.

Attached a report by German FSD on a light vehicle test of GERnano which delivered:

- 30% reduction of NOx emissions
- 10% fuel and CO2 savings

Estimated conservatively, the NOx reduction achievable with this solution is 5-10-fold of any other known option. It is by far the most cost efficient option with the highest NOx reduction per dollar.

Also, it applies to a vast range of engines and can deliver better air quality quickly, even as a self-financing interim solution until equipment get replaced.

The fuel savings offer an additional lasting benefit to low-income communities by reducing their cost of mobility.

Kind Regards  
Volker

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/86-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-VTJWNVQnBDIRNgFv.zip>

Original File Name: GERnano Cleaner Mobility.zip

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-03-13 03:23:54

No Duplicates.

**Comment 64 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Ezra

Last Name: Finkin

Email Address: efinkin@dieselforum.org

Affiliation: Diesel Technology Forum

Subject: Comment from the Diesel Technology Forum Regarding Draft Beneficiary Plan

Comment:

On behalf of the Diesel Technology Forum, I would like to submit this comment concerning the draft beneficiary mitigation plan as an attachment.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/87-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-BmVSO1Y6WWcGZVU7.pdf>

Original File Name: Comments to CARB - VW Settlement (FINAL).pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-03-13 10:54:35

No Duplicates.



**Comment 65 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Kim

Last Name: Tran

Email Address: kim.j.tran@lacity.org

Affiliation: LASAN

Subject: City of Los Angeles Sanitation Letter of Comment

Comment:

See attached

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/88-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-VDdTPFInBy1SC1Q7.pdf>

Original File Name: City of Los Angeles Sanitation Letter of Comment on the Proposed Beneficiary Mitigation Plan for the Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-03-13 13:11:03

No Duplicates.

**Comment 66 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Cory  
Last Name: Bullis  
Email Address: cory@caleec.com  
Affiliation:

Subject: CALSTART VW Appendix D Comments  
Comment:

Please see attached document.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/89-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-UDNRNIQ5VnZVJ1Ax.pdf>

Original File Name: CALSTART Comments on VW Appendix D - March 14, 2018.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-03-14 16:54:23

No Duplicates.

**Comment 67 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Nicholas

Last Name: Chavez

Email Address: nchavez@strategicadvocates.com

Affiliation: SCHOOL TRANSPORTATION COALITION

Subject: School Transportation Comments

Comment:

Please see the attachment.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/90-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-AnRT0IY7VGwBdFcg.pdf>

Original File Name: Volkswagen Appendix D letter STC 3-5.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-03-16 08:46:55

No Duplicates.

**Comment 68 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Cory

Last Name: Bullis

Email Address: cory@caleec.com

Affiliation:

Subject: EVCA Comments on VW Appendix D Discussion Document

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/91-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-UDVWJIIwVmQFXARy.pdf>

Original File Name: EVCA VW CA Comments.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-03-19 09:20:37

No Duplicates.

**Comment 69 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Jillian

Last Name: Solomon

Email Address: Jillian.solomon@motivps.com

Affiliation: Motiv Power Systems

Subject: Volkswagen Settlement Mitigation Plan

Comment:

See attached

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/92-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-UyVSI1MNUnJRMgF1.pdf>

Original File Name: VW Settlement Allocation Letter.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-03-21 08:27:46

No Duplicates.

**Comment 70 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Julie

Last Name: Brooks

Email Address: julieb@orangeev.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Definition of port for VW beneficiary mitigation funds

Comment:

See attached

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/93-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-Uz9XOF0vBDYCKgNn.docx>

Original File Name: Lisa.docx

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-03-22 12:25:47

No Duplicates.

**Comment 71 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Ryan

Last Name: Kenny

Email Address: ryan.kenny@cleanenergyfuels.com

Affiliation:

Subject: VW Settlement Appendix D Comments: Clean Energy

Comment:

Please find a letter from Clean Energy commenting on the VW  
settlement draft funding plan.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/94-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-AGNdN1Q7UWcLUIUj.pdf>

Original File Name: CLNE VW Comments March 2018.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-03-23 10:43:11

No Duplicates.

**Comment 72 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Judy

Last Name: Kruger

Email Address: Judy.kruger@laedc.org

Affiliation: LOS ANGELES ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT CORP

Subject: California SmartMatch Program

Comment:

California is the only region with six electric bus manufacturers located in one region. To support this growing industry and to support the CARB zero emission bus procurement goals, it is necessary to roll out a program that assists with localization of the supply chain for electric bus manufacturers. California SmartMatch is the right program. Currently, at the Los Angeles County Economic Development Corporation, we are implementing a California SmartMatch program dedicated to assisting OEMs with the California supply chain - Women-owned, HUB-zoned, Veteran-owned companies with necessary quality industry standards.

CARB could fund the California SmartMatch program portion that is focused on electric bus manufacturers.

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-03-26 13:13:16

No Duplicates.



**Comment 73 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Jordyn

Last Name: Bishop

Email Address: jordynb@greenlining.org

Affiliation: Greenlining Institute

Subject: Comments on February 16, 2018 Discussion Document

Comment:

The Greenlining Institute's comments on CARB's proposal for the  
Beneficiary Mitigation Plan Attached.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/96-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-B2ACaARsV1sCYFc+.pdf>

Original File Name: GLI\_Discussion\_Document\_Comments\_VMT.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-03-27 11:18:34

No Duplicates.

**Comment 74 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Morry

Last Name: Markowitz

Email Address: mmarkowitz@fchea.org

Affiliation: Fuel Cell & Hydrogen Energy Assn.

Subject: Mitigation Plan

Comment:

FCHEA urges the Board to develop a Mitigation Plan focused on building a balanced portfolio of NOx emissions reduction solutions. Recognizing this, FCHEA urges the Mitigation Plan allocate no less than 80 percent of the ZEV EVSE funds provided by the Environmental Mitigation Trust (EMT) for FCEV refueling infrastructure. Doing so will build on the successful efforts of the Board and the California Energy Commission (CEC) to establish a hydrogen fueling network in California. However, while the increase in the pace of network growth is a welcome development, the Board has reported on the need to sustain momentum and further accelerate the overall rate of network growth. Allocating no less than 80 percent of the EVSE funds to HRS network can help fulfill this need.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/97-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-VjAFYFc+WG4GYQFe.pdf>

Original File Name: FCHEA Comments 03.27.18.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-03-27 11:24:25

No Duplicates.

**Comment 75 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: John

Last Name: Schott

Email Address: john.schott@chargepoint.com

Affiliation: ChargePoint

Subject: ChargePoint Comments

Comment:

Please see attached comments. Thank you.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/98-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-AmEHaVExBSQCYwZj.pdf>

Original File Name: ChargePoint California Appendix D BMP Comments 3-30-2018.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-03-30 15:28:34

No Duplicates.

**Comment 76 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Veronica

Last Name: Bradley

Email Address: vbradley@airlines.org

Affiliation: Airlines for America

Subject: Volkswagen Consent Decree Environmental Mitigation Trust Beneficiary Mitigation Plan

Comment:

Please see the attached for comments on CARB's Discussion Document regarding its recommendations for use of the State's portion of the VW Environmental Mitigation Trust funds.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/99-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-VTRcblMzWVVWMwRr.pdf>

Original File Name: A4A comments re BMP discussion doc\_CA\_final.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-04-04 11:28:44

No Duplicates.

**Comment 77 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Tom

Last Name: Swenson

Email Address: tom.swenson@cummins.com

Affiliation: Cummins Westport

Subject: Volkswagen Settlement - Environmental Mitigation Trust for California

Comment:

See attached.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/100-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-VjVdLgdrVGpSPQJs.pdf>

Original File Name: Cummins Westport comments - Volkswagen Settlement Appendix D.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-04-10 15:48:27

No Duplicates.

**Comment 78 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: John

Last Name: McGowan

Email Address: Richard.McGowan@ge.com

Affiliation: GE

Subject: GE comments

Comment:

See attached

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/101-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-ADJRZwAwVD8AKwc0.pdf>

Original File Name: 2018-3-21 CARB VW Switcher Funding.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-04-11 10:32:58

No Duplicates.

**Comment 79 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Thomas

Last Name: Escher

Email Address: tescher@redandwhite.com

Affiliation:

Subject: VW Settlement Comments

Comment:

See attached

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/102-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-USNXNFcyU14FYgNt.pdf>

Original File Name: Red and White Fleet comment letter.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-04-11 10:32:58

No Duplicates.

**Comment 80 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Tom

Last Name: Escher

Email Address: tescher@redandwhite.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Red and White Fleet Comments on BMP

Comment:

See attached letter.

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/103-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-WmkBKlZlAmYKIVJg.pdf>

Original File Name: 3-27-2018 CARB letter re Mitigation App D.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-04-12 11:49:41

No Duplicates.



**Comment 81 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Mariana

Last Name: Valdivia

Email Address: mariana.valdivia@lacity.org

Affiliation: LA DOT

Subject: City of Los Angeles DOT VW Environmental Mitigation Trust Comments

Comment:

See attached

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/104-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-UWMANIFhUTpVDAft.pdf>

Original File Name: 2018 LADOT CARB VW Signed Letter.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-04-16 10:32:29

No Duplicates.

**Comment 82 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Sean

Last Name: Tiedgen

Email Address: stiedgen@srta.ca.gov

Affiliation:

Subject: SRTA Comments on VW Environmental Mitigation Trust Discussion Document

Comment:

Comment letter attached

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/105-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-B3FSIwBeVWtVOgZy.pdf>

Original File Name: VW Mitigation Disc Doc\_SRTA Comments 20180418.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-04-18 14:34:36

No Duplicates.

**Comment 83 for Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California  
(vw-mititrust-pl-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Emanuel

Last Name: Wagner

Email Address: ewagner@californiahydrogen.org

Affiliation:

Subject: CHBC Comments on Mitigation Trust Plan

Comment:

Please find attached the California Hydrogen Business Council's  
Comments on the Beneficiary Mitigation Plan for California's \$423  
million allocation of the Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust

Attachment: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/BARCU/barcu-attach/106-vw-mititrust-pl-ws-UzBWOFO+BDRWDwZl.pdf>

Original File Name: CHBC Comments on Mitigation Trust Plan\_Final.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-04-18 17:10:39

No Duplicates.

**There are no comments posted to Volkswagen Environmental Mitigation Trust for California (vw-mititrust-pl-ws) that were presented during the Workshop at this time.**