

May 31, 2019

Assemblymember Cristina Garcia  
Assembly District 58  
Capitol Office, Room 2013  
PO Box 942849, Sacramento, CA 94249-0058

Assemblymember Eduardo Garcia  
Assembly District 56  
Capitol Office, Room 4140  
PO Box 942849, Sacramento, CA 94249-0056

*Re: June 3<sup>rd</sup> Tropical Forest Standard Stakeholder Meeting*

Dear Assemblymember Eduardo Garcia and Assemblymember Cristina Garcia:

On behalf of the undersigned organizations and individuals, we write to reiterate our opposition to the proposed California Tropical Forest Standard (TFS) that the California Air Resources Board (CARB) has considered adopting. We appreciate your efforts in convening stakeholders on this issue, including for June 3, 2019, but feel that further discussion about alternatives to TFS needs to occur.

Based on our decades of work with environmental justice communities, indigenous peoples in the tropics and California, and climate programs in-state and internationally, we believe that international tropical forest carbon offsets pose grave dangers for human rights and achieving greenhouse gas emission reductions. These offsets do not reduce emissions in California communities where massive polluting emissions occur. The March 27, 2019 proposed revision to the CARB's TFS proposal fails to address even a few of the many human rights and technical concerns that we raised through comment letters, at these stakeholder meetings, and at the November 2018 CARB hearing.

Furthermore, new research from the University of California at Berkeley, as referenced by the MIT Technology Review, shows that domestic forest offsets currently accepted by CARB may overstate their emissions reductions by *80 million tons* of carbon dioxide, which represents *one third* of the total cuts that the state's cap-and-trade program is supposed to achieve. We also agree with the May 5, 2019 letter by legislators to CARB and CalEPA outlining concerns with the environmental integrity of California's carbon offset program.

**We respectfully request that the Joint Legislative Committee on Climate Change Policies exercise its statutory authority and convene an expert panel on the proposed TFS.** An expert panel focused on issues raised above that can protect against deforestation while upholding human rights and sovereignty of indigenous peoples would be a prudent next step, upon which the Committee can better inform its recommendations. We urge you to create space for these issues to be explored, particularly for the benefit of protecting local EJ and indigenous communities who would be most harmed by a failed climate program.

Thank you for your consideration of our request. If you have questions or need additional information, please contact Mari Rose Taruc <marirose@caleja.org>.

Respectfully,

Zoë Cina-Sklar  
Climate Justice Campaigner  
Amazon Watch

Miya Yoshitani  
Executive Director  
Asian Pacific Environmental Network

David Gassman  
Bay Area - System Change not Climate Change

Gary Hughes  
California Policy Monitor  
Biofuelwatch

Gladys Limon  
Executive Director  
California Environmental Justice Alliance

Brian Nowicki  
California Climate Policy Director  
Center for Biological Diversity

Pam Tau Lee  
Board of Directors  
Chinese Progressive Association

Cynthia Mellon  
Climate Justice Policy Coordinator  
Climate Justice Alliance

Darryl Molina Sarmiento  
Executive Director  
Communities for a Better Environment

Jeff Conant  
Senior International Forests Program Manager  
Friends of the Earth, U.S.

Anne Petermann  
Executive Director  
Global Justice Ecology Project on.

Jaron Browne  
National Organizer  
Grassroots Global Justice Alliance

Amy Moas, Ph.D.  
Senior Forest Campaigner  
Greenpeace USA

Pennie Opal Plant  
Co-founder  
Idle No More SF Bay

Tom BK Goldtooth  
Executive Director  
Indigenous Environmental Network

Ginger Cassady  
Program Director  
Rainforest Action Network

Lou-Anne Fauteck Makes-Makes, Ph.D.  
Sacred America  
California Indian, Shawnee and Virginia/Maryland Algonquian, Southeastern Sioux, Mohawk,  
and Creek

Kathy McAfee  
Sunflower Alliance

Osprey Orielle Lake  
Executive Director  
Women's Earth and Climate Action Network (WECAN) International

CC:  
Assembly Speaker Rendon  
Assemblymember Bloom  
Assemblymember Burke  
Assemblymember Kalra  
Assemblymember Mayes  
Assemblymember Gomez Reyes

Senate Pro Tem Atkins  
Senator Hueso  
Senator Monning  
Senator Skinner  
Senator Stern  
Governor Newsom  
CalEPA Secretary Blumenfeld  
CARB Chair Nichols  
CARB Executive Officer Corey  
CARB Jason Gray