P.O. Box 80607, San Diego, CA 92138-0607

April 30, 2018

To: Clerk of the Board
Cc: Dan Garrett
Ravi Ramalingam
Joe Calavita
Jose Gomez

Subject: Multi-purpose Lubricant Amendments

The WD-40 Company appreciates the opportunity to comment on the Amendments to the Consumer Products Regulation. These amendments include changes to the category of Multi-purpose lubricants future effective limit.

WD-40 Company is a California company that is the global leader in the manufacturing and selling of Multi-purpose Lubricants. Our products are sold across multiple trade channels in 176 countries around the world. WD-40 Company products are used in over 80% of all households in the United States.

WD-40 Company has worked with the staff on this issue for close to a decade. Staff has been willing to meet and discuss this issue through that time. This regulation will maintain the Emission Reductions in the SIP and provide flexibility to the MPL manufacturers to produce effective products. These amendments are truly a win for California and a win for Industry.

The staff per section 94513(f)2 performed a technology assessment on Multi-purpose lubricants (MPL's) to determine if the future effective limit of 10% is technologically and commercially feasible. The staff's finding was that the vast majority of MPL manufacturers could not achieve the 10% VOC limit. However staff did discover that the product reactivity between the 25% VOC product and the 10% VOC product was extremely close. Meaning that the VOC emission reductions claimed in the SIP for the 10% VOC limit would be achieved.

Staff also is attempting to create more flexibility for MPL manufacturers to develop effective products for the consumer while maintaining the emission reductions in the SIP. By adding this flexibility the MPL manufacturers will be able to comply with the regulations in a more economic way and be able to maintain the cost of effective products for the consumer.

WD-40 Company supports the staff proposal of a product weighted Maximum Incremental Reactivity (MIR) limit of 0.45 with a maximum VOC level of 25%. The use of the Concept of Reactivity in the reduction of ozone formation is sound science. The Aerosol Coating Regulation that CARB developed almost two decades ago has proved this. The reduction in an MIR level in a product always results in an ozone reduction. This is not the case for Mass based regulations. Thus CARB staff should consider Reactivity options for more Consumer Products.

WD-40 Company will now provide comments on the text of the amendments.

9715 Businesspark Ave
San Diego, CA 92131-1642

Section 94509 (a)
Comment: WD-40 Company supports the extension of the effective date to 7/1/2019. This will provide the manufacturers time to comply with the amendments.

Section 94509 (r)(1)(F)
"Product formulation" means the weight of all ingredients.
Comment: to be consistent with section 94513 (h)(i)(a) and add clarity this definition should read: "Product formulation" means the weight on all ingredients above 0.1 percent by weight.

Section 94509 (r)(1)(H)
"Product-Weighted MIR (PWMIR)" means the sum of all weighted-MIR for all ingredients in a "Multi-purpose Lubricant product. The PWMIR is the total product reactivity expressed to hundredths of a gram of ozone formed per gram of product (g O3/g product), excluding container and packaging.
Comment: Similar to above the definition should include the following for clarity with section 94509(r)(4)
"Product-Weighted MIR (PWMIR)" means the sum of all weighted-MIR for all ingredients equal to or exceeding 0.1 percent by weight in a "Multi-purpose Lubricant product. The PWMIR is the total product reactivity expressed to hundredths of a gram of ozone formed per gram of product (g O3/g product), excluding container and packaging.

Section 94509 (r)(5)(E)
For fragrance, as defined in section 94508(a)(54), present in a "Multi-purpose Lubricant" product, the MIR value for terpinolene, as listed in section 94700, must be used to calculate the PWMIR unless detailed fragrance ingredients information is available to determine the MIR value of the fragrance.
Comment: This section should also reference a 0.1% by weight cutoff.
For fragrance, in the formula equal to or exceeding 0.1% by weight, as defined in section 94508(a)(54), present in a "Multi-purpose Lubricant" product, the MIR value for terpinolene, as listed in section 94700, must be used to calculate the PWMIR unless detailed fragrance ingredients information is available to determine the MIR value of the fragrance.

Section 94509(r) Assignment of Maximum Incremental Reactivity (MIR) Values
There should be additional statements added to this section such as the following.
A description of high carbon chain high boiling point and low vapor pressure compounds be assigned a MIR Value 0.0.
Or
Grouped LVP are assigned a MIR Value of 0.0.
Definition Grouped LVP is a compound that has a carbon number greater than 20 and a Boiling Point above 250°c. Examples are beeswax, cellulose, cornstarch, non-volatile silicones, oils non-volatile polymers, sodium xylene sulfonate, styrene butadiene rubber, tallow, triclosan, urea, xanthan gum, paraffin wax, and mineral oil.
Or
A statement "Compounds that contain at least one atom of carbon but do not contribute to ozone formation in the troposphere are assigned a MIR value of 0.0".
Comment: These statements in this section will guide the public to know how to assign MIR values for compounds that contain at least one carbon atom but do not contribute to ozone formation, such as oils or base oils that historically have not been counted as VOC's. This wording is consistent with the following wording in section 94509(r)(1)(I) "Reactive Organic Compound (ROC)" Means any compound containing at least one atom of carbon and that has the potential, once emitted, to contribute to ozone formation in the troposphere. Any of the above statements will add clarity to the regulation.

9715 Businesspark Ave
San Diego, CA 92131-1642

Section 94513(h)(1)
The Responsible Party must report annual sales to the Executive Officer no later than March 31. The annual reporting requirement shall sunset on April 1, 2023.
Comment: WD-40 supports the sunset of the annual reporting.

Section 94513(h)(2)
(D)For chemical mixtures not listed in sections 94700, 94701, or 94509(r)(5) each chemical compound in the mixture must be reported separately.
Comment: for clarity the section should add "greater or equal to 0.1 percent by weight.
(D)For chemical mixtures not listed in sections 94700, 94701, or 94509(r)(5) each chemical compound in the mixture greater or equal to 0.1 percent by weight must be reported separately.

(F) If an MIR value other than terpinolene is used for fragrance, the Responsible Party must provide the fragrance ingredients.
Comment: for clarity the section should add in a formula greater or equal to 0.1 percent by weight.
(F) If an MIR value other than terpinolene is used for fragrance in a formula greater or equal to 0.1 percent by weight, the Responsible Party must provide the fragrance ingredients.

Conclusion
WD-40 Company would like to commend the staff on a thorough development of the Reactivity Option. WD-40 Company believes the emission reductions required in the SIP will be met. In addition this Alternative Option provides flexibility and along with the effective date delay manufacturers will be able to provide effective products.

Any questions or comments feel free to contact our consultant Doug Raymond at 740-936-8120 or by e-mail at djraymond@me.com.

Sincerely,

Ernest Bernarducci

Michael L. Freeman
Chief Strategy Officer
WD-40 Company
freeman@wd40.com
Cell 619-981-3991

Ernest Bernarducci
Global Vice President, R&D
WD-40 Company
ernieb@wd40.com
Cell 973-896-7109

9715 Businesspark Ave
San Diego, CA 92131-1642