November 15, 2021

Clerk of the Board

California Air Resources Board

1001 I Street,

Sacramento, California 95814

RE: Proposed Amendments to the Commercial Harbor Craft Rule

Comments submitted electronically to:

To the California Air Resources Board:

These comments are from the California Forestry Association and are only addressing the Commercial Harbor Craft use in Humboldt Bay.

California Forestry Association is a trade association whose membership includes California sawmills, veneer mills, several biomass powerplants, and private industrial forest landowners. Transportation of forest products, including logs and chips is a major component of California’s forestry industry.

**Information from the Proposed Rule**

According to the California Air Resources Board (CARB) as of 2021, there are 229 towing vessels statewide in three subcategories: escort/ship assist tugs, push/tow tugs, and articulated tug barges. There are 2 inventoried towing vessels at Humboldt Bay.

The Air Resources Board (ARB) states the regulation is necessary to reduce emissions of diesel PM and NOx that cause adverse health effects for Californians. The ARB exposure study was done at the Ports of Los Angeles and Long Beach and found harbor craft to be the third highest source of diesel PM emissions contributing to the cancer risk from port activity.

CARB used Port Emissions Inventory Data from Port of Los Angeles, Port of Long Beach, and Port of Oakland.

CARB has reporting data from the Bay Area Bulk Terminal, Concord Naval Weapons Station, LA Berth 240, Port of Hueneme, Port of Redwood City, Port of Richmond, Port of Sacramento, Port of San Diego, Port of San Francisco, and Port of Stockton.

Note, CARB is not using data from the Port of Humboldt Bay.

**Proposed Rule Amendment Requirements**

Under the Proposed Amendments, towing vessels operating in Regulated California Waters would be subject to:

* + use of Tier 4 engines equipped with diesel particulate filters (DPF).
  + if engines are rated below 600 kilowatts (kW) and Tier 4 engines are not available in required power subcategories, Tier 3 engines equipped with DPFs.

**Excerpts from Proposed Rule Compliance Exceptions and Extensions**

* With full compliance extensions, compliance dates for towing vessels would phase in between **2029 and 2034**.
* Vessels operating under low-hour use thresholds (80 hours annually for a dredge, and 300 hours annually for all other commercial harbor craft) within 24 nautical miles of the coast do not have to repower or retrofit their vessels.
* If compliance requires vessel replacement, towing vessel owners can receive up to six years of compliance extensions or 2034, whichever is earlier, if they can demonstrate financial difficulty.

**The Proposed Rule Schedule**

The Proposed Amendments are scheduled for initial Board consideration December 9, 2021, final consideration in early 2022, and would take effect beginning in 2023.

**Situation at Humboldt Bay**

According to the CARB fact sheet, there are 2 towing vessels on the North Coast; there are 6 commercial sportfishing vessels on the North Coast.

Air Quality is in **Attainment** in the Eureka area (Humboldt Bay).

There is no apparent reason to require private owners to make major investments for 6 commercial sportfishing vessels and 2 tugboats. There is also a dredge used annually in Humboldt Bay that may not be able to stay under the low use limit.

There are usually only 5-6 freighters that use the Port at Humboldt Bay annually.

There’s no data to indicate that the Port of Humboldt Bay should be administered the same as the Port of Long Beach or Los Angeles or any other major California Port under this proposed Rule.

**Recommendation:**

Humboldt Bay should be exempt from the Commercial Harbor Craft Rule.

**Closing**

Thank you for the opportunity to comment. Direct any questions to Steve Brink.

Sincerely,

Diagram

Description automatically generated with medium confidence

STEVEN A. BRINK

Vice President – Public Resources

[steveb@calforests.org](mailto:steveb@calforests.org)

916-208-2425