

From: pennie opal plant
To: [ARB Clerk of the Board](#)
Subject: Tropical Forest Offsets
Date: Monday, October 29, 2018 12:54:35 PM

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

October 29, 2018
Mary Nichols
Chair, California Air Resources Board
1001 I Street
Sacramento, CA 95814

Many of the members of the primarily Native American all-volunteer group, Idle No More SF Bay, live along the refinery corridor in the San Francisco East Bay. We stand for clean air, water, soil and a safe, vibrantly healthy world. We organized the Refinery Corridor Healing Walks during 2014, 2015, 2016 and 2017 in order to connect the fossil fuel impacted communities. Many of us and our families suffer from respiratory issues and asthma as a result of living near these refineries.

We are also extremely concerned about the IPCC Climate Report which, according to the New York Times states that "The authors found that if greenhouse gas emissions continue at the current rate, the atmosphere will warm up by as much as 2.7 degrees Fahrenheit (1.5 degrees Celsius) above preindustrial levels by 2040, inundating coastlines and intensifying droughts and poverty. Previous work had focused on estimating the damage if average temperatures were to rise by a larger number, 3.6 degrees Fahrenheit (2 degrees Celsius), because that was the threshold scientists previously considered for the most severe effects of climate change."

All carbon trading mechanisms must be left behind in light of the new IPCC report, especially the Tropical Forest Standard (TFS) that the CARB Board and staff are considering now. These mechanisms do nothing to reign in the fossil fuel industry at a time when we now know that allowing this industry to continue to add tons of carbon dioxide to the atmosphere will lead to catastrophic climate disruption.

Additionally, while there are a minority of Indigenous forest dwelling people who have been seduced by financial gains who have signed forest offset contracts, there are many more Indigenous forest dwelling people who do not agree with these mechanisms. And, we have found that members of the Yurok tribe in California, whose leadership signed a forest offsets contract, were not made aware of the entire spectrum of what that contract means with regard to continued fossil fuel emissions, climate and the health impacts which communities suffer like those along the refinery corridor in the East Bay. The fact that these impacts of the Yurok contract were not shared with tribal members violates the Free and Prior Informed Consent as directed by the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous People.

We demand that CARB reject consideration of tropical forest carbon credits into California's cap and trade system.

1. Offsets achieve nothing to reduce the emissions that are poisoning California communities.
 - a. They do not result in a reduction of emissions, but rather allow big polluters such as refineries to release more greenhouse gasses legally.
 - b. This further harms our communities, who have historically suffered from carbon co-pollutants.
 - c. It distracts from the only strategy that can work: ending emissions at their source.
2. Tropical forest offset programs pose serious risks to human and indigenous rights.
 - a. The market linkages proposed by CARB subject Indigenous Peoples to grossly disproportionate economic power, intimidation, and coercion and typically fail to obtain meaningful Free, Prior, Informed Consent.
 - b. Programs such as REDD+ (project or jurisdictional) have resulted in land grabbing, and put indigenous peoples at risk of displacement and/or loss of control of their forests, their way of life, cultures, food security, and sovereignty.
 - c. They are rife with corruption and conflicts of interest, which CA cannot police.
3. Tropical forest offsetting has been discredited as an environmental strategy.
 - a. Offsets do not work: they allow certain, permanent harm (more GHGs) in exchange for the fallacy of hoped-for uncertain, temporary carbon sequestration.
 - b. Offset programs (REDD+ etc.) fail to address the drivers of deforestation.
 - c. Because of such flaws, no compliance market in the world accepts REDD+ credits.
4. CARB fails to consider the scientific evidence against tropical forest offsetting.
 - a. It is ignoring the extensive, peer-reviewed literature by independent researchers documenting the environmental and social failures of REDD+.
 - b. It has relied too much on organizations and consultants with careers and personal stakes in offsetting projects and policies.
 - c. The proposed TFS, fails to provide a plan consistent with California's legal requirement that emissions reductions be "real, additional, quantifiable, permanent, verifiable and enforceable".

Respectfully,

Pennie Opal Plant

Founding Grandmother of Idle No More SF Bay

Signatory on the Indigenous Women of the Americas Defending Mother Earth Treaty

Richmond California

List of additional Signatories and groups:

Alison Ehara-Brown, Founding Grandmother of Idle No More SF Bay, Signatory on the Indigenous Women of the Americas Defending Mother Earth Treaty, Richmond California

Tom Goldtooth, Executive Director, Indigenous Environmental Network

Priscilla Hunter, tribal elder of the Coyote Valley Band of Pomo Indians, California

Patricia Joseph, Hupa/Karuk, California

Thomas Joseph II, Hupa/Karuk/Paiute, California

Patricia Joseph, Hupa/Karuk

Zachary Quair, Tule River Yokut
Marva Siixuutesna Jones Tolowa Deeni/Yurok/Wintu/Karuk
Kin-Sin-Ta Joseph, Hupa/Paiute
Te'isyay Evy, Hupa/Paiute
Nah-Tes Jackson, Hupa/Yurok/Karuk
Kanyon Coyotewoman Sayers-Roods, Indian Canyon Nation - Mutsun-Ohlone
Barbara Mumby-Huerta, KonKow Maidu & Powhatan, Burlingame, California
Carlrey Arroyo, Mexica/Yaqui

Steering Committee of the 1000 Grandmothers for Future Generations:

Barbara Rhine
Carol Rothman
Claire Schoen
Grace Morizawa
Nancy Feinstein
Rochelle Towers
Patricia St. Onge

Refinery Corridor Community Members:

Maureen Brennan, Rodeo
Rosa Fallon, Antioch
Chris Fallon, Antioch
Janet PyeGeorge, Rodeo
Janet Callaghan, Rodeo
Lisa Martell, Crockett
Tom Martell, Crockett
Charles Davidson, Hercules
Ann Puntch, Rodeo
Amanda Louria, Crockett

Refinery Corridor Organizations:

Carquinez Straits Environmental Alliance
Citizens Concerned about Selby Slag
Concerned Neighbors of Rodeo
Concerned Neighbors of P66
Rodeo Citizens Association
Urban Tilth

Organizations:

Osprey Orielle Lake, Executive Director, Women's Earth and Climate Action Network
John Anderson, Steering Committee Member, 350 San Francisco
Laura Neish Executive Director, 350 Bay Area,
Darcy Sweeney, Steering Committee Member, 350 Sonoma

San Francisco Bay Area Community Members:

Liz Gamboa
Atava Garcia-Swiecicki
Maura Williams
Lucy Beazley
Sirama Moreno
Amy Hutto
Amanda Bloom