April 21, 2009

Mary D. Nichols, Chairman California Air Resources Board Headquarters Building 1001 "I" Street Sacramento, CA 95812

Dear Chairman Nichols,

As scientists and economists with relevant expertise, we are writing to recommend that you include indirect land use change in the lifecycle analyses of heat-trapping emissions from biofuels and other transportation fuels. This policy will encourage development of sustainable, low-carbon fuels that avoid conflict with food and minimize harmful environmental impacts.

Our comments are relevant to the development of California's Low Carbon Fuel Standard (LCFS), which the Air Resources Board (ARB) will consider for adoption in its April hearing, as well as other policies that evaluate lifecycle heat-trapping emissions from biofuels. For policies like the LCFS to successfully reduce GHG emissions, it is critical to include all major sources of emissions, including indirect land use emissions from biofuels.

We encourage you to investigate and include significant direct and indirect emissions from all fuels, including conventional petroleum, heavy oils, natural gas for transportation, oil sand-based fuels, and the range of fuels used to power electrified transportation, consistent with the best available science. However, you should not delay inclusion of known sources of emissions, including indirect emissions from biofuels, pending discovery of potential effects from other fuels.

Recent peer-reviewed research indicates that conventional biofuels can directly or indirectly result in substantial heat-trapping emissions through the conversion of forests and grasslands to croplands to accommodate biofuel production. Increased demand for crops to make fuel results in higher global commodity prices that can induce farmers in other countries to plow up sensitive, high-carbon ecosystems—including rain forests in South America and Southeast Asia. Previous lifecycle analyses did not adequately account for these emissions, giving biofuels credit for greater carbon savings than actually achieved.

There are uncertainties inherent in estimating the magnitude of indirect land use emissions from biofuels, but assigning a value of zero is clearly not supported by the science. The data on land use change indicate that the emissions related to biofuels are significant and can be quite large. Grappling with the technical uncertainty and developing a regulation based on the best available science is preferable to ignoring a major source of emissions. Over time, greater accuracy and detail in a more refined analysis can be reflected in future LCFS rulemakings.

The need to address uncertainties applies to other areas the analysis as well, and we urge you to evaluate the increasing use of nitrogen fertilizers and herbicides associated with greater biofuel production. In particular, nitrogen fertilizers enhance the emission of nitrous oxide—a powerful greenhouse gas in Earth's atmosphere.

To spur innovation in low carbon fuels, the LCFS must send an accurate signal to the growing clean energy market. Strategic investment decisions should be based upon the best available data of the carbon footprint of alternative fuels. Failure to include a major source of pollution, like indirect land use emissions, will distort the carbon market, suppress investment in truly low carbon fuels, and ultimately result in higher emissions.

The work you are doing in California sets an important precedent for transportation fuel policy nationally and internationally, as well as for action to confront climate change more broadly. We urge you to ensure that your policies are based on the best science, including consideration of emissions from indirect changes in land use.

Sincerely,

- Original Authors -

PAM MATSON, Ph.D. Chester Naramore Dean of the School of Earth Sciences Richard and Rhoda Goldman Professor of Environmental Studies Stanford University Stanford, CA Member of the United States National Academy of Sciences

STUART L. PIMM, Ph.D. Doris Duke Professor of Conservation Ecology Nicholas School of the Environment and Earth Sciences Duke University Durham, NC

WILLIAM SCHLESINGER, Ph.D. President Cary Institute of Ecosystem Studies Millbrook, NY Member of the United States National Academy of Sciences

PETER C. FRUMHOFF, Ph.D. Director of Science and Policy Chief Scientist, Climate Campaign Union of Concerned Scientists Cambridge, MA

W. MICHAEL HANEMANN, Ph.D. Chancellor's Professor Department of Agricultural and Resource Economics University of California, Berkeley Berkeley, CA

## Organizational affiliations are for identification purposes only.

KENNETH ARROW, Ph.D. Palo Alto, CA Nobel Laureate, Economics Member of the United States National Academy of Sciences Recipient of the United States National Medal of Science

FRANK WILCZEK, Ph.D. Herman Feshbach Professor of Physics Physics Massachusetts Institute of Technology Cambridge, MA Nobel Laureate, Physics Member of the United States National Academy of Sciences MacArthur Fellow

F. CHAPIN, III, Ph.D. Professor of Ecology Institute of Arctic Biology University of Alaska Fairbanks Fairbanks, AK Member of the United States National Academy of Sciences

WILLIAM CLARK, Ph.D. Professor Kennedy School of Government Harvard University Cambridge, MA Member of the United States National Academy of Sciences MacArthur Fellow DAVID GIBSON, Ph.D. Professor Emeritus University of Iowa Iowa City, IA Member of the United States National Academy of Sciences

RICHARD HOUGHTON, Ph.D. Acting Director Woods Hole Research Center Falmouth, MA

ROBERT KATES, Ph.D. Trenton, ME Member of the United States National Academy of Sciences MacArthur Fellow

THOMAS E. LOVEJOY, Ph.D. Heinz Center Biodiversity Chair The H. John Heinz III Center for Science, Economics and the Environment Member of the United States National Academy of Sciences

MICHAEL O'HARE, Ph.D. Professor of Public Policy Goldman School of Public Policy University of California, Berkeley Berkeley, CA

RICHARD AMBROSE, Ph.D. Professor Environmental Health Sciences University of California, Los Angeles Los Angeles, CA

JASMIN ANSAR, Ph.D. Visiting Assistant Professor Lorry Lokey Business School Mills College Oakland, CA

LOWELL ASHBAUGH, Ph.D. Project Scientist Crocker Nuclear Laboratory University of California, Davis Davis, CA BEVIN ASHENMILLER, Ph.D. Assistant Professor of Economics Economics Occidental College Los Angeles, CA

DENNIS BALDOCCHI, Ph.D. Professor of Biometeorology Environmental Science Policy and Management University of California, Berkeley Berkeley, CA

EDWARD BARBIER, Ph.D. John S. Bugas Professor of Economics Economics and Finance University of Wyoming Laramie, WY PETER BAYLEY, Ph.D. Fisheries and Wildlife Department The Ohio State University Corvallis, OR

KENNETH BERGMAN, Ph.D. National Aeronautics and Space Administration (retired) Earth Sciences Ashland, OR

DONALD BOESCH, Ph.D. President University of Maryland, Center for Environmental Science Cambridge, MD SEVERIN BORENSTEIN, Ph.D. Professor Haas School and University of California Energy Institute University of California, Berkeley Berkeley, CA

CHARLES BOYCE, Ph.D. Assistant Professor University of Chicago Chicago, IL

GUY BRASSEUR, Ph.D. Earth and Sun Systems Laboratory National Center for Atmospheric Research Boulder, CO

HOLGER BRIX, Ph.D. Assistant Researcher Atmospheric and Oceanic Sciences University of California, Los Angeles Los Angeles, CA

PETER BRUSSARD, Ph.D. Professor Emeritus Biology University of Nevada Reno, NV

HAROLD BURSTYN, Ph.D. Electrical Engineering and Computer Science Syracuse University Syracuse, NY

CHRISTOPHER BUSCH, Ph.D. Economist Policy Director Center for Resource Solutions

JOHN CAMPBELL, Ph.D. Assistant Professor College of Engineering University of California, Merced Merced, CA

PETER CHESSON, Ph.D. Professor Ecology and Evolutionary Biology University of Arizona Tucson, AZ

ROBERT CIFELLI, Ph.D. Senior Research Scientist Atmospheric Science Colorado State University Fort Collins, CO RAYMOND CLARKE, Ph.D. Biology Sarah Lawrence College Bronxville, NY

DANIEL COLBERT, Ph.D. Executive Director Institute for Energy Efficiency University of California, Santa Barbara Santa Barbara, CA

ALAN CUNNINGHAM, Ph.D. Professor Emeritus Chemistry Monterey Peninsula College (retired) Carmel Valley, CA

MARIA DAMON, Ph.D. Assistant Professor Daniel J. Evans School of Public Affairs University of Washington Seattle, WA

ERIC DAVIDSON, Ph.D. Senior Scientist The Woods Hole Research Center Falmouth, MA

PETER DORMAN, Ph.D. The Evergreen State College Olympia, WA

ELLEN DOUGLAS, Ph.D. Assistant Professor Department of Environmental, Earth and Ocean Sciences University of Massachusetts Boston Boston, MA

AMY DUNHAM, Ph.D. Research Faculty Ecology and Evolutionary Biology Rice University Houston, TX

HALLIE EAKIN, Ph.D. Assistant Professor School of Sustainability Arizona State University Tempe, AZ

BRENDA EKWURZEL, Ph.D. Climate Scientist Climate Program Union of Concerned Scientists Washington, DC

Y. FARZIN, Ph.D. Professor Agricultural and Resource Economics University of California, Davis Davis, CA TRACY FELDMAN, Ph.D. Postdoctoral Associate Biology University of Wisconsin - Stevens Point Stevens Point, WI

PAUL FERRARO, Ph.D. Associate Professor of Economics Department of Economics Georgia State University Atlanta, GA

MELANIE FITZPATRICK, Ph.D. Climate Scientist Climate Program Union of Concerned Scientists Cambridge, MA

ALLISON FLEGE, Ph.D. Adjunct Assistant Professor Geography University of Cincinnati Cincinnati, OH

JOHANNES FOUFOPOULOS, Ph.D. Assistant Professor School of Natural Resources University of Michigan Ann Arbor, MI

ROBERT GAMACHE, Ph.D. Professor Environmental, Earth, and Atmospheric Science University of Massachusetts Lowell Lowell, MA

CATHERINE GAUTIER, Ph.D. Professor Geography University of California, Santa Barbara Santa Barbara, CA

BART GEERTS, Ph.D. Associate Professor Atmospheric Science University of Wyoming Laramie, WY

KAREN GLENNEMEIER, Ph.D. Science Director Audubon-Chicago Region Evanston, IL

DAVID GORCHOV, Ph.D. Professor Botany Miami University Oxford, OH W. GRIFFIN, Ph.D. Executive Director, Green Design Institute Tepper School of Business Carnegie Mellon University Pittsburgh, PA

MARTHA GROOM, Ph.D. Associate Professor of Conservation Biology Interdisciplinary Arts and Sciences University of Washington Bothell Bothell, WA

THEODORE GROVES, Ph.D. Professor of Economics Economics University of California, San Diego La Jolla, CA

HOSHIN GUPTA, Ph.D. Professor Hydrology and Water Resources University of Arizona Tucson, AZ

DOUG GURIAN-SHERMAN, Ph.D. Senior Scientist Food and Environment Program Union of Concerned Scientists Washington, DC

M. ROBERT HAMERSLEY, Ph.D. Assistant Professor of Environmental Microbiology Environmental Studies Soka University of America Aliso Viejo, CA

DENNIS HANSELL, Ph.D. Professor Marine and Atmospheric Chemistry University of Miami Miami, FL

JOHN HARTE, Ph.D. Professor Energy and Resources Group University of California, Berkeley Berkeley, CA

EVAN HAZARD, Ph.D. Professor Emeritus Biology Bemidji State University Bemidji, MN

MARK HIXON, Ph.D. Helen Thompson Professor Department of Zoology Oregon State University Corvallis, OR KAREN HOLL, Ph.D. Professor Environmental Studies University of California, Santa Cruz Santa Cruz, CA

ROBERT HOWARTH, Ph.D. David Atkinson Professor of Ecology Ecology & Evolutionary Biology Cornell University Ithaca, NY

DAVID INOUYE, Ph.D. Professor Biology University of Maryland College Park, MD

STEPHEN JACKSON, Ph.D. Professor of Botany and Ecology Botany University of Wyoming Laramie, WY

MILIND KANDLIKAR, Ph.D. University of British Columbia Liu Institute for Global Issues Vancouver, BC

JAMES KASTING, Ph.D. Distinguished Professor of Geosciences Geosciences Pennsylvania State University University Park, PA

ANDY KEELER, Ph.D. Associate Professor of Public Policy John Glenn School of Public Affairs The Ohio State University Columbus, OH

ARTURO KELLER, Ph.D. Bren School of Environmental Science & Management University of California, Santa Barbara Santa Barbara, CA

ALISSA KENDALL, Ph.D. Assistant Professor Civil and Environmental Engineering University of California, Davis Davis, CA

KENNETH KIMBALL, Ph.D. Director of Research Research Appalachian Mountain Club Gorham, NH CHRISTOPHER KNITTEL, Ph.D. Associate Profess and Chancellor's Fellow Economics University of California, Davis Davis, CA

NIR KRAKAUER, Ph.D. Department of Civil Engineering City University of New York New York, NY

DAVID LEAHY, Ph.D. Research Scientist Chemistry Stanford University Stanford, CA

SHERMAN LEWIS, Ph.D. Professor Emeritus Political Science California State University Hayward Hayward, CA

WILLIAM LIDICKER, Ph.D. Professor of Integrative Biology Emeritus Integrative Biology University of California, Berkeley Berkeley, CA

TIMOTHY LIPMAN, Ph.D. Co-Director Transportation Sustainability Research Center Institute of Transportation Studies University of California, Berkeley Richmond, CA

LESTER LIPSKY, Ph.D. Professor Emeritus Conputer Science and Engineering University of Connecticut Storrs, CT

CREIGHTON LITTON, Ph.D. Assistant Professor, Forest Ecology Natural Resources and Environmental Management University of Hawaii Honolulu, HI

RAINER LOHMANN, Ph.D. Assistant Professor Graduate School of Oceanography University of Rhode Island Narragansett, RI

JOHN LORAND, Ph.D. Professor Emeritus Chemistry Central Michigan University Mt. Pleasant, MI STEPHEN MANNING, Ph.D. Professor of Biology Biology Arkansas State University - Beebe Beebe, AR

PETRUS MARTENS, Ph.D. Astrophysicist Smithsonian Astrophysical Observatory Cambridge, MA

JEREMY MARTIN, Ph.D. Senior Scientist Clean Vehicles Union of Concerned Scientists Washington, DC

MICHAEL MCCORMICK, Ph.D. Assistant Professor Biology Hamilton College Clinton, NY

MARGARET MELLON, Ph.D. Senior Scientist and Director Food and Environment Program Union of Concerned Scientists Washington, DC

ZEWEI MIAO, Ph.D. Research Associate Energy Biosciences Institute University of Illinois Urbana, IL

DAVID MITCHELL, Ph.D. Associate Research Professor Division of Atmospheric Sciences Desert Research Institute Reno, NV

RONALD MITCHELL, Ph.D. Political Science University of Oregon Eugene, OR

DAVID MODARELLI, Ph.D. Professor Chemistry University of Akron Akron, OH

WILLIAM MOOMAW, Ph.D. Professor Center for International Environment and Resource Policy Tufts University Medford, MA K. MURRAY, Ph.D. Professor of Biology Biology Hope College Holland, MI

RONI NEFF, Ph.D. Research Associate Environmental Health Sciences Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health Baltimore, MD

CHARLES NELSON, Ph.D. Professor of Physics Physics State University of New York Binghamton, NY

JOHN NIELSEN-GAMMON, Ph.D. Professor Atmospheric Sciences Texas A&M University College Station, TX

RICHARD NORGAARD, Ph.D. Professor of Energy and Resources University of California, Berkeley Berkeley, CA

GRETCHEN NORTH, Ph.D. Associate Professor Biology Occidental College Los Angeles, CA

REED NOSS, Ph.D. Davis-Shine Distinguished Professor Biology University of Central Florida Orlando, FL

MICHAEL PALMER, Ph.D. Regents Professor Botany Oklahoma State University Stillwater, OK

MARTIN POLZ, Ph.D. Professor Civil and Environmental Engineering Massachusetts Institute of Technology Cambridge, MA

R. RAU, Ph.D. Physics Brookhaven National Laboratory (retired) Bellport, NY DOROTHY READ, Ph.D. Professor Emerita Biology University of Massachusetts Dartmouth Dartmouth, MA

MICHAEL REICH, Ph.D. Professor Economics University of California, Berkeley Berkeley, CA

PETER REYNOLDS, Ph.D. Adjunct Professor Physics

North Carolina State University Raleigh, NC

JANE RISSLER, Ph.D. Senior Scientist and Deputy Director Food and Environment Program Union of Concerned Scientists Washington, DC

GEORGE ROBINSON, Ph.D. Professor Biological Sciences University at Albany, State University of New York Albany, NY

DIANNE ROCHELEAU, Ph.D. Associate Professor Geography Clark University Worcester, MA

JEFF ROMM, Ph.D. Professor Environmental Science, Policy and Management University of California, Berkeley Berkeley, CA

THOMAS ROONEY, Ph.D. Assistant Professor Biological Sciences Wright State University Dayton, OH

JULIETTE ROONEY-VARGA, Ph.D. Associate Professor Biological Sciences University of Massachusetts Lowell Lowell, MA

ARMIN ROSENCRANZ, Ph.D. Visiting Professor Johns Hopkins School of Advanced International Studies Washington, DC VOLKER RUDOLF, Ph.D. Assistant Professor Ecology and Evolutionary Biology Rice University Houston, TX

PATRICK RYAN, Ph.D. Professor Arts and Sciences Johnson & Wales University Denver, CO

ROBERT SANFORD, Ph.D. Professor Biological Sciences University of Denver Denver, CO

KAY SCHEETS, Ph.D. Adjunct Assistant Professor Botany Oklahoma State University Stillwater, OK

DAVID SCHIMEL, Ph.D. Chief Executive Officer National Ecological Observatory Network Boulder, CO

LEE SCHIPPER, Ph.D. Senior Research Engineer Precourt Energy Efficiency Center Stanford University Stanford, CA

KURT SCHWABE, Ph.D. Associate Professor Environmental Sciences University of California, Riverside Riverside, CA

JASON SCORSE, Ph.D. Assistant Professor Monterey Institute of International Studies Monterey, CA

THOMAS SHERRY, Ph.D. Professor Ecology and Evolutionary Biology Tulane University New Orleans, LA

JACK SITES, JR., Ph.D. Professor and Curator Biology Brigham Young University Provo, UT JOHAN SIX, Ph.D. Plant Sciences University of California, Davis Davis, CA

LOWELL SMITH, Ph.D. U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (retired) Berryville, VA

DANIELA SOLERI, Ph.D. Geography University of California, Santa Barbara Santa Barbara, CA

ROGER SPARKS, Ph.D. Professor of Economics Economics Mills College Oakland, CA

SABRINA SPATARI, Ph.D. Assistant Professor Civil, Architectural and Environmental Engineering Drexel University Philadelphia, PA

THOMAS SPIRO, Ph.D. Professor Chemistry University of Washington Seattle, WA

THOMAS STRUHSAKER, Ph.D. Evolutionary Anthropology Duke University Durham, NC

THOMAS TIETENBERG, Ph.D. Mitchell Family Professor of Economics Economics Colby College Waterville, ME

ROBERT TURNER, Ph.D. Professor Economics and Environmental Studies Colgate University Hamilton, NY

MATHIAS VAN THIEL, Ph.D. Physical Chemist Physics and Space Technology Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory (retired) Hayward, CA ASHWANI VASISHTH, Ph.D. Director Institute for Sustainability California State University, Northridge Northridge, CA

JEFFREY VINCENT, Ph.D. Korstian Professor of Forest Economics and Management Nicholas School of the Environment Duke University Durham, NC

BRIAN VON HERZEN, Ph.D. Executive Director The Climate Foundation Beaverton, OR

BETSY VON HOLLE, Ph.D. Assistant Professor Biology University of Central Florida Orlando, FL

RICHARD WALKER, Ph.D. Professor Geography University of California, Berkeley Berkeley, CA

LINDA WALLACE, Ph.D. Botany/Microbiology University of Oklahoma Norman, OK

DONALD WALLER, Ph.D. Professor of Botany and Environmental Studies Botany University of Wisconsin-Madison Madison, WI

ZHI WANG, Ph.D. Associate Professor Earth and Environmental Sciences California State University, Fresno Fresno, CA

CHRISTOPHER WEBER, Ph.D. Assistant Research Professor Civil and Environmental Engineering Carnegie Mellon University Pittsburgh, PA

RAY WEISS, Ph.D. Distinguished Professor Scripps Institution of Oceanography University of California, San Diego La Jolla, CA MICHAEL WEISSMAN, Ph.D. Professor of Physics Physics University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign Urbanna, IL

STEPHEN WIEL, Ph.D. President of the Board Center for Law and Social Policy (CLASP) Washington, DC

ROBLEY WILLIAMS, Ph.D. Professor Emeritus Biological Sciences Vanderbilt University Nashville, TN

WILLIAM WILLIAMS, Ph.D. Professor Biology St. Mary's College of Maryland Saint Marys City, MD

HOWARD WILSHIRE, Ph.D. Research Geologist U.S. Geological Survey (retired) Sebastopol, CA

HENDRIK WOLFF, Ph.D. Economics University of Washington Seattle, WA

COLIN WRAIGHT, Ph.D. Professor and Head Biochemistry University of Illinois Urbana, IL THOMAS YUILL, Ph.D. Professor and Director Emeritus Nelson Institute for Environmental Studies University of Wisconsin-Madison Madison, WI

HISHAM ZERRIFFI, Ph.D. Ivan Head South/North Research Chair Liu Institute for Global Issues University of British Columbia Vancouver, BC

SIMONE ALIN, Ph.D. Seattle, WA

MATTHEW AUER, Ph.D. Bloomington, IN

JEDEDIAH BRODIE, Ph.D. Missoula, MT

CLIFFORD BUNTON, Ph.D. Santa Barbara, CA

DAVID CAMPBELL, Ph.D. Tuscaloosa, AL

MARK CHANDLER, Ph.D. Madison, WI

BRUCE COLLETTE, Ph.D. Washington, DC

JOHN COOPER, Ph.D. Lewisburg, PA

CHRIS FOREST, Ph.D. University Park, PA

VINCENT GUTSCHICK, Ph.D. Las Cruces, NM HAROLD HARRIS, Ph.D. St. Louis, MO

GRAINGER HUNT, Ph.D. Boise, ID

DOUG LAFOLLETTE, Ph.D. Madison, WI

JUDITH LANG, Ph.D. Ophelia, VA

KRISTIN LEWIS, Ph.D. Cambridge, MA

ROBERT MASON, Ph.D. Philadelphia, PA

MOLLY MCMUIRE, Ph.D. Lewisburg, PA

KIRK MOLONEY, Ph.D. Ames, IA

STEPHEN MUDRICK, Ph.D. Columbia, MO

SIOBHAN REILLY, Ph.D. Oakland, CA

JEFFREY STIBICK, Ph.D. Riverdale, MD

CARLYLE STORM, Ph.D. Kingston, RI

CLAUDIA TEBALDI, Ph.D. Princeton, NJ

MAIKEN WINTER, Ph.D. Ithaca, NY

Organizational affiliations are for identification purposes only.

cc. Governor Arnold Schwarzenegger Lisa P. Jackson , Administrator, US-Environmental Protection Agency Linda Adams, Secretary, Cal-EPA Mike Scheible, Deputy Director, Air Resources Board Karen Douglas, Commissioner, California Energy Commission David Crane, Special Advisor for Jobs & Economic Growth, Office of Governor Schwarzenegger