

Chris Shimoda  
11-8-4<sup>10/21/2011</sup>

### Cost of Rule 4 to 8+ Times Higher Than Expected

| Regulation or ATCM                                      | Diesel PM Cost-Effectiveness (dollars/pound PM) | Comments                                                            |
|---------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------|
| TRU ATCM 2011(EPA/4-mode)<br>7-Year Operational Life    | \$118-\$222                                     | 25-60% less PM by using 4-mode data.<br><u>Likely cost of rule.</u> |
| Ocean Going Vessels at Berth                            | \$173                                           |                                                                     |
| Public Fleets Rule                                      | \$159                                           |                                                                     |
| TRU ATCM 2011 (Staff/8-Mode)<br>7-Year Operational Life | \$88                                            | <u>Current Staff Recommendation</u>                                 |
| Truck and Bus Rule                                      | \$46                                            |                                                                     |
| In-Use Off Road Diesel Rule                             | \$40                                            |                                                                     |
| Solid Waste Collection Vehicle                          | \$32                                            |                                                                     |
| Cargo Handling ATCM                                     | \$21                                            |                                                                     |
| TRU ATCM 2003<br>7-Year Operational Life                | \$10-20                                         | Original 2003 Cost Estimate                                         |

### ARB Can Meet 2003 Emission Reduction Goals And Save California Millions of Dollars

| Regulation or ATCM                                      | Diesel PM Cost-Effectiveness (dollars/pound PM) | Comments                                                                        |
|---------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Ocean Going Vessels at Berth                            | \$173                                           |                                                                                 |
| Public Fleets Rule                                      | \$159                                           |                                                                                 |
| TRU ATCM 2011 (Staff/8-Mode)<br>7-Year Operational Life | \$88                                            | <u>Achieves SIP</u>                                                             |
| TRU ATCM 2011<br>8-Year Operational Life                | \$52                                            | Saves \$270,000,000:<br><u>Achieves SIP</u>                                     |
| Truck and Bus Rule                                      | \$46                                            |                                                                                 |
| In-Use Off Road Diesel Rule                             | \$40                                            |                                                                                 |
| Solid Waste Collection Vehicle                          | \$32                                            |                                                                                 |
| TRU ATCM 2011<br>9-Year Operational Life                | \$27                                            | CTA Recommended Operational Life<br>Saves \$430,000,000:<br><u>Achieves SIP</u> |
| Cargo Handling ATCM                                     | \$21                                            |                                                                                 |
| TRU ATCM 2003                                           | \$10-20                                         |                                                                                 |
| TRU ATCM 2011<br>10-Year Operational Life               | \$9                                             | 10 Year Operational Life<br>Saves \$530,000,000                                 |

**9 Year Operational Life:**  
**Achieves Environmental-Economic Balance**

- 9 Year Operational Life Exceeds Original PM Reduction Goal
- 9-Year vs. 7-Year Operational Life:  
Saves \$430,000,000, Adjusts Statewide PM 0.02%
- Allows "One and Done" OEM Compliance Option to Come to Market (Tier 4 Final Engine due last quarter of 2013)
- Allows time for additional ULETRU retrofit field testing
  - Better retrofit reliability helps avoid Food Safety/Spoilage issues

**Best Available Compromise to Fix Issues With TRU ATCM**