GAIL FARBER
CHAIRMAN

LOS ANGELES COUNTY
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE/
INTEGRATED WASTE MANAGEMENT TASK FORCE
900 SOUTH FREMONT AVENUE, ALHAMBRA, CALIFORNIA 91803-1331
P.O. BOX 1460, ALHAMBRA, CALIFORNIA 91802-1460
www.lacountyiswmtf.org

December 2, 2008

Ms. Mary Nichols, Chair
California Air Resources Board
P.O. Box 2815
Sacramento, CA 95812

Dear Chairperson Nichols:

COMMENTS REGARDING THE CLIMATE CHANGE PROPOSED SCOPING PLAN, DATED OCTOBER 2008: RECOMMENDED MEASURE NO. 15–*"RECYCLING AND WASTE"*

On behalf of the Los Angeles County Integrated Waste Management Task Force (Task Force), I want to thank the California Air Resources Board (CARB) for the opportunity to comment on the *Climate Change Proposed Scoping Plan* (Scoping Plan), which was released for public comment on October 15, 2008, and its Errata Sheet dated November 14, 2008. As the lead agency for implementation of AB 32 (The Global Warming Solutions Act of 2006), CARB is responsible for developing a comprehensive set of actions designed to reduce overall greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions in California while preserving our environment, revitalizing and expanding our economy, and improving public health and wellness. We applaud CARB's staff for their tireless efforts, and recognize the development of this Scoping Plan as a tremendous undertaking, which has significant ramifications for our future health and well-being. While this second draft of the Proposed Scoping Plan has expanded its recommendations in the Recycling and Waste Sector, the Task Force would like to provide the following comments for your consideration and action.

Pursuant to Chapter 3.67 of the Los Angeles County Code and the California Integrated Waste Management Act of 1989 (AB 939, as amended), the Task Force is responsible for coordinating the development of all major solid waste planning documents prepared for the County of Los Angeles and the 88 cities in Los Angeles County with a combined population in excess of ten million. Consistent with these responsibilities, and to ensure a coordinated and cost-effective and environmentally-sound solid waste management system in Los Angeles County, the Task Force also addresses issues impacting the system on a countywide basis. The Task Force membership includes representatives of the League of California Cities-Los Angeles County Division, the Los Angeles County

Board of Supervisors, the City of Los Angeles, the waste management industry, environmental groups, the public, and a number of other governmental agencies.

We respectfully request your consideration of the following comments in order to provide additional context and details to the Proposed Scoping Plan's recommendations regarding Recommended Measure No.15 - Recycling and Waste:

- The Task Force strongly supports recycling as an important element of our integrated solid waste management system, and recognizes its value in reducing our dependence on current disposal options. However, without a complete economic and environmental life-cycle analysis conducted by the State, it is not possible to measure the net impact in GHG emissions that result from recycling activities. As such, the Task Force strongly recommends that CARB, in concert with the California Integrated Waste Management Board (CIWMB), conduct a complete life-cycle analysis on all recycling activities in order to quantify GHG reduction potential for all recycling activities. We appreciate the Proposed Scoping Plan recognizing that economic studies are planned to investigate the potential for commercial recycling; however, we would still request that the Proposed Scoping Plan acknowledge the importance of **a full lifecycle analysis on all recycling activities**.

- The California recycling industry is very complex and extends well beyond California and U.S. boundaries. The Proposed Scoping Plan must consider overseas environmental laws and regulations, which when compared to California regulations, may be considered weak or non-existent. We noted the Proposed Scoping Plan acknowledges that most GHG reductions from commercial recycling will occur outside of California, making accounting more difficult. However, the Proposed Scoping Plan does not acknowledge that if recyclables are shipped to other countries the net impact on both GHG emissions and other environmental impacts may be worse. It should also be recognized that there are no jurisdictional boundaries that would limit the movement of air contaminants (including GHG emissions) from other countries to California, which can negatively impact our air quality and our residents' wellbeing. Thus, in addition to conducting a complete life-cycle analysis for recycling activities, the Task Force believes **it is critical for the State to take the lead in developing local and statewide markets for recyclables**.
- With regard to commercial recycling, the Proposed Scoping Plan recognizes that "A variety of implementation approaches may be needed to increase commercial waste diversion, increase recycling opportunities, and enhance market development to utilize the feed stocks from recycling" (Appendix C, C-121). To

ours and many other stakeholders' surprise, during the Public Comment Period at the November 20, 2008 CARB meeting, Chairwoman Margo Reid Brown from the CIWMB recommended the commercial recycling element include mandatory regulations only and not a hybrid implementation approach as currently identified in the Proposed Scoping Plan. **The Task Force strongly advises against relying on mandatory recycling as the only strategy due to lack of adequate markets for recyclables in California as well as the recent collapse of the global market for recyclables.** In a November 14, 2008 CIWMB news release, the CIWMB states "California's environment may face a potential set-back as the depressed global economy and an excess in global inventory have reduced prices being paid for recycled newspapers, old corrugated cardboard and plastics around the world". According to Chairwoman Brown, "We must consider the health and safety of California as we look for short-term relief in the current situation and for long-term solutions such as locating new manufacturing and energy-producing facilities in California."

- The Task Force, along with the County of Los Angeles and many other jurisdictions throughout California, has been a strong supporter of conversion technologies and has played a major role in evaluating and promoting their development. Conversion technologies refer to a wide array of biological, chemical, thermal (excluding incineration) and mechanical technologies capable of converting post-recycled residual solid waste into renewable energy, useful products, and green fuels. Numerous studies, including those conducted by the State of California, have confirmed that conversion technologies provide triple benefits with regard to GHG emissions reductions, including reducing waste transportation, reducing landfill disposal, and displacing fossil fuels by producing fuel and energy. In addition, conversion technologies provide an opportunity to increase the number of green-collar jobs in the State of California, supporting CARB's goal to protect our environment while spurring economic development we so urgently need right now.

  The Task Force was pleased to see the addition of anaerobic digestion to the recommended Recycling and Waste Management measures, recognizing the environmental benefits of biologically converting waste rather than disposing it; however, **the Proposed Scoping Plan should acknowledge that these benefits can be derived from all conversion technologies, and should promote them on a level playing field based on their actual performance, rather than selecting one technology winner**. The Task Force looks to the Proposed Scoping Plan as a guidance document for the state, and believes this is an excellent opportunity to support clean, green, and proven technologies such

as the ones mentioned above. Before California can benefit from the development of local conversion technologies, it is imperative that the state remove current legislative barriers to their development.

The Task Force looks forward to the opportunity to work with CARB and other appropriate agencies to ensure an environmentally and economically viable integrated waste management system that is protective of our citizens' health and safety as well as our natural resources and the environment. If you have any questions, please contact Mr. Mike Mohajer of the Task Force at (909) 592-1147.

Sincerely,

Margaret Clark

Margaret Clark, Vice-Chair
Los Angeles County Solid Waste Management Committee/
Integrated Waste Management Task Force and
Council Member, City of Rosemead

TM/CS:ca
P:sec\taskforce\letter\AB 32 Proposed Scoping Plan

cc: Governor Arnold Schwarzenegger
Cal EPA Secretary, Linda Adams
Each Member of the California Air Resources Board✓
James Goldstene, Executive Officer of the California Air Resources Board
Margo Reid Brown, Chair of the California Integrated Waste Management Board
Each Member of the County of Los Angeles' Board of Supervisors
California State Association of Counties
The League of California Cities
The League of California Cities, Los Angeles County Division
Each City Mayor in Los Angeles County
Southern California Association of Governments
South Bay Cities Council of Governments
San Gabriel Valley Council of Governments
Gateway Cities Council of Governments
Each Member of the Los Angeles County Integrated Waste Management Task Force
Each Member of the Los Angeles County Alternative Technology Advisory Subcommittee
CARB's Economic and Technology Advancement Advisory Committee